



PTI



PML-N



PPP

Provincial Tracking Reports

2017-2018

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PRIME is a public policy think tank working for an open, free and prosperous Pakistan by creating and expanding a constituency for protective function of the state and freedom of the market.

This report is the part of a project, 'Government Policy Scorecard Project' of Provincial Governments including Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh. It aims at initiating and informing policy dialogue and public debate on the implementation of the economic agenda promised by various political parties at a provincial level in the general election held in May 2013.

Published by: Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

© PRIME Institute

Supported by: Centre for International Private Enterprise (CIPE).

Recommended Citation: PRIME Institute 2018, Provincial Tracking Reports (2017-2018) Islamabad.

Published in: April 2018

For inquiries:

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

Office No. 401, 4th Floor Muhammad Gulistan Khan House
82-East, Fazal-ul-Haq Road, Blue Area, Islamabad.

Tel: 00 92 (51) 831 43 37-8 Fax: 00 92 (51) 831 43 39

Provincial Tracking Reports

2017 - 2018

Authors

Ali Salman

Aniqa Arshad

Beenish Javed

Available at:

www.govpolicyscorecard.com.pk

Provincial Tracking Report

Introduction

Provincial Tracking Report reviews economic performance of three provinces, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh by tracking the progress made on the implementation of economic manifesto announced by the parties in power in these respective provinces i.e. Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) and Pakistan People's Party-Parliamentarians (PPP-P). In case of Balochistan, the report includes a commentary on the socio-economic status of the province instead of following any manifesto because of a mid-term change in the government. The purpose of the Provincial Tracking Report is to initiate and inform policy dialogue and public debate on the progress made by political parties vis-à-vis their electoral promises. This tracking directly serves the basic principle of a functioning democracy: accountability.

Structure

As far as the scorecard is concerned, the report picks seven overlapping and common areas in the manifestoes of three leading parties pertaining to economic development, governance and social development. These common "Areas" include: Agriculture and Livestock, Taxation, Labor and Human Resources, Transport, Housing, E-Governance, and Industrial Development. These areas are then divided into "Components" and "Sub-components". In most cases, these are based on a simple reproduction of text of the manifesto, and in some cases, some editing has been carried out for the purpose of clarification and structure, but without altering the meaning of the authors of the manifesto. While maximum care has been taken to keep common grounds for the sake of comparison, some differences remain.

In all, the report identifies measurable "targets" and allocates scores on all of them, subject to information availability, on the basis of three distinct parameters: policy and legislative developments, institutional reforms, and implementation. Policy and Legislative Development indicate the presence, or absence, of a supportive legal environment; Institutional Reforms indicate the quality of governance structure and Implementation shows the actual progress made on the policy.

Scoring

The scorecard quantifies the status of implementation on announced goals in the economic agenda of three respective parties. For each of the target area, the score is assigned from 0 to 10 with 10 being the highest. The score is sub-divided in three categories namely Legislative and Policy Developments (2.5), Institutional Reforms (2.5), and Implementation (5).

The team has developed and consistently applies a set of rules to minimize discretion.

1. Averages are computed on non-weighted basis. All “areas” and their constituting components and sub-components carry same weight towards the overall score.
2. Negative scoring is not allowed as it has a disproportionate impact on the overall score of each category.
3. Score of 2 to 2.5 is assigned in “Policy and Legislative Development”, if one already exists or has been developed.
4. Score of 1 to 1.5 is assigned in “Institutional Reforms” if some progress is being shown.
5. Score of 1 to 2 is assigned in “Implementation” if some progress has started. A goal is considered to be achieved, if the related policy is implemented.
6. Score of zero is assigned if progress has been reversed.
7. Score of ‘Nil’, if no progress is made, though positive policy direction is announced.
8. Score of “As yet no development”, if work in the particular area or component is yet to begin. Such components and sub-components are not scored and are discarded while computing average.
9. Same level of score over various editions of scorecard is assigned, if the level of progress is maintained or if adequate and updated information is not available.
10. If a goal is achieved, then in the subsequent editions, it is mentioned as “Target Stands Achieved” and is not counted towards taking averages more than once.
11. Subject to information availability, the data included in the report pertain to the time period for which the scorecard is being published. For this report, the data largely focuses on the calendar year of 2016.

The structure and methodology of the report has been shared with a select group from the business community, politicians and economists for the purpose of feedback and has undergone several revisions.

The scoring gives a snapshot view on the performance of the government in a particular area as well as an aggregate perspective. Based on one year progress, a narrative report is prepared.

Interpretation of Scoring

For interpretation of score, following guidelines have been developed.

- Zero: Progress has been reversed.
- As Yet No Development: No progress made.
- 1 to 4.9: Policy direction is not clear, institutional bottlenecks exist and no or very little implementation has started.
- 5 to 7.9: Policy direction is supportive, institutional reforms are in progress and some implementation has started.
- 8 to 10: Policy direction is supportive, governance structure is functional and implementation is complete.

By ‘complete implementation’, one should not necessarily interpret it as having achieved the ultimate goals of the policy, e.g., welfare or industrial productivity, which does not lend to easy assessment. This should be interpreted as output achieved rather than the outcome.

Data Sources

In order to develop a comprehensive scorecard, the team collects the data from publically available documents and secondary data sources including provincial government websites, provincial budgets, statements by public officials and newspapers. The team tracks five newspapers on daily basis and develops portfolio of news on the basis of classification system of the scorecard. These newspapers become the basis of an interim assessment of the “current status”, which is then verified, endorsed or rectified in the light of secondary data available.

The Team

The report and scorecard has been compiled by a team comprising political scientists and economists. The tool development was primarily undertaken by Mr. Ali Salman. From PRIME research staff, Anika Arshad and Shehryar Aziz significantly contributed in compiling this report by searching and verifying the data for each province, and writing their respective narratives. While Beenish Javed contributed in composing the narrative of Balochistan.

- **Mr. Ali Salman:** Ali is Founder Executive Director Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME). Ali has worked as a consultant economist for major international development organizations, public sector organizations and non- profits in Pakistan and other countries. He is author of several studies and monographs and regularly writes for

Express Tribune. Ali is currently based in Kuala Lumpur. He holds master degrees in Economics, Public Policy and Business Administration.

Provincial Tracking Report

Comparative Account of Selected Provincial Governments¹ in Pakistan

AREAS	Score (Maximum=10)		
	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh
Agriculture & Livestock	4.7	5.43	3
Taxes/Resource Mobilization	6	5.33	4.67
Health	7.5	6.25	2.83
Education	5.89	8.09	3.43
Labour & Human Resources	5	4.33	4
Transport	6	8	3
Industrial Development	4.5	Not included.	Not included.
Housing	6	4	0
Governance	5.4	9	Not included.
AVERAGE	5.67	6.30	2.99
PREVIOUS SCORE	4.69	5.45	3.71

Mere Claims or Reality? PTI Socio-Economic Agenda Tracking Report

Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaaf (PTI) was running a provincial government for the first time in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. A conclusion of the progress and situation of the ruling party's performance from 2017-2018 has been derived, based on the scores of all manifesto targets and their sub-components. The average score of the implementation status achieved by PTI in KP is currently is 5.67 which was previously 4.69, showing an increase of 0.98 since the last Provincial

¹ Excluding Balochistan, which was excluded to maintain consistency in the selection of data. As this comparison is based on the promises made in the electoral manifesto and the government changed in Balochistan after first two and a half years as a result of prior arrangement between two political parties, a consistent comparison cannot be made. However, a section on Balochistan has been added to present a narrative of the past four years for the province.

Tracking Report. It is the second highest score of the scorecard, spearheaded by Punjab with an average score of 6.30.

The Agriculture and Livestock component score indicates an increase of 1.2 from the previous score, and a 100 percent utilization of the assigned budget to ensure access to agricultural inputs. However, the party lagged behind overall and the agricultural sector suffered a regressing score due to a lack of credit accessibility, as banks are to date hesitant to extend credit.

The Health component holds an average score of 7.5, highest amongst all components for KP and also highest amongst all provincial components of health. The ruling party aimed to extend its services as an effort to move forward in its aim to achieve improved patient care and enable provision of good quality education to junior doctors. According to an article by The Economist the ratio of doctors per 1,000 people has increased from 0.16 to 0.24, along with the introduction of health-insurance cards. The number of operations and inpatient cases have both doubled. Medicine is also now being provided at wholesale rates at government hospitals across KP. However, challenges remain and the existing state of affairs poses to slow down the performance and progress. Prominent improvement has come about in the sub component of free primary healthcare system for poor where the scores have increased by 3 points. A highly positive and progressive step was taken in the health sector in regard to health care where health insurance was extended to the transgender community of the province in form of the 'Sehat Insaaf Cards'. The government has also successfully campaigned for healthcare and against drug along with introducing a provision of free mental health counseling.

Education, health and accountability have remained top priorities of the KP government throughout their term. The education sector however, does not follow the commendable performance of health sector. Despite holding the maximum number of subcomponents within PTI's manifesto and the evident emphasis, the education sector has not performed too well. With a mere score of 5.89, which has dropped down from a score of 6 in the previous scorecard. No significant development was seen in education after April 2017. However, some subcomponents have shown improvement; particularly those related to girls' education. Throughout the province Infrastructure was focused on more compared to other features of a school such as class environment and standard of education. As stated in a comprehensive national report on education by Alif Ailaan, improvements were made in school infrastructure. KP province along with Punjab topped in terms of middle school infrastructure. PTI aimed to provide equal education facilities to all but it was unable to successfully implement and bring about an improvement in its way to achieve this goal. Alif Ailaan ranked KP on 5th place in

their report out of eight reported regions, and 2nd out of the four provinces. Access to education improved, through provision of need based vouchers under public-private partnership.

The scores of both Governance and Labour and Human Resources declined from 6.5 to 5.4 and from 5.5 to 5 respectively. Labour and Human Resources have seen little progress over the four years in KP, where a tripartite board consisting of the employer, labor and inspectors for each sector to improve plight of labor has still not been formed. No measures have been introduced so far to prevent unemployment, occupational safety, and protect working hours of labour.

Under governance, while the e-governance sector has shown progress, KP has to date been unable to finalize the 6th Provincial Finance Commission (PFC) Award, and it is still running on an interim arrangement. The government was unable to either introduce a socio-economic measurement structure at Union Council level or launch a GPRS based system to match availability and need for teachers. Industrial Development saw no progress and its score remained constant.

The score increased from 4 to 6 for Transport. Despite introduction of a rapid transit system, an estimated 40 per cent of KP's total population has no access to any form of transport. Housing score increased from 5.5 to 6. Where for some funds have been allocated for subsidized housing schemes and land has been purchased for others.

Under the term served by PTI, KP has seen a rather clean government and a development in schools' and hospitals' infrastructure as well as administration have come about. There has been strict action against the practice of hiring friends and family which usually resulted in several illiterate and under qualified workers.²

The overall implementation of the plans set by PTI in their economic agenda has been done according to plan; however the pace might not have been right and there have been some additional setbacks and hindrances. Some of the other components have also faced significant improvement. However, in order to bring about further change the existing state of affairs needs to be dealt with for them to not hinder the progress of the province and for effective implementation of the party manifesto.

² Imran Khan's party improves services in Pakistan's wildest province, June 8, 2017; Date Accessed: April 23, 2018; <https://www.economist.com/news/asia/21723144-can-pti-stay-power-imran-khans-party-improves-services-pakistans-wildest-province>

Surpassing Others; PML-N Socio-Economic Agenda Tracking Report

Out of all the provincial governments, PML-N has dominated the scores of both the previous scorecards, and this one as well. With an average score of 6.30, the government performance in Punjab has remained satisfactory. Multiple institutional reforms are in progress and certain components have seen some implementation and completion of reforms.

During the past five years, Punjab witnessed major infrastructural growth, and city administration reforms. Punjab reduced the number of provincial taxes, develop District Health Authorities, administer vaccinations and incentivize education to improve enrollment rates. The Punjab government had noteworthy performance in governance sector, where monitoring dashboards have been set up with public access to real-time data for multiple sectors. Individual performance was also emphasized on greatly; according to Allah Bakhsh Malik, Punjab's education secretary, about 30% of district heads were sacked for poor results in 2017.³

The education section of the manifesto has the second best performance in Punjab, receiving a score of 8.09 out of 10. Punjab has observed major progress in the education sector. According to an article published in The Economist⁴, there has been a 10 percent increase in primary-school enrollment since September 2016; 68,000 teachers have been hired on the basis of merit; and a steady increase in the share of correct answers on a biannual test of literacy and numeracy has been witnessed. In April 2016, as part of a scheme, private providers took over the running of 1,000 of the Punjab government's primary schools. This number increased to 4,300 by the end of 2017. By the end of 2018 the Punjab government intends this number to increase to 10,000. Special emphasis is now being put on education for marginalized communities in Punjab, such as transgenders and convicts. Technology was integrated efficiently to establish Monitoring Units for education departments, where it helped improved teachers' attendance.

Integration of technology in the health sectors led to an enhancement in performance of health workers and improved monitoring of vaccination campaigns. The health department has made access to health services easier for the poor with the introduction of health insurance scheme. Currently around 0.8 million families are benefitting from it. Punjab also succeeded in having 97% vaccination coverage in the country, and no case for polio has being reported so far in 2018. According to The Nation⁵, infrastructure and services have also been an area of focus in the

³ Pakistan is home to the most frenetic education reforms in the world, January 4, 2018; Date Accessed: April 18, 2018; <https://www.economist.com/news/briefing/21733978-reformers-are-trying-make-up-generations-neglect-pakistan-home-most-frenetic>

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ On health reforms in Punjab, Jahanzeb Ahmed Khan, April 14, 2018; Date Accessed: April 19, 2018; <https://nation.com.pk/14-Apr-2018/punjab-health-sector>

sector of health by the government of Punjab. There are 800 Basic Health Units that are operating 24/7 throughout Punjab and basic to middle level treatment is given in these health units providing 86% free medication.

One of the most significant developments which occurred in Punjab during these past five years was the introduction of mass transit systems in major cities. Major developments in physical infrastructure were also seen, improving regional connectivity. The agricultural reforms have now made it easier for small farmers to have access to credit under the Kissan Package. And Rs. 432 billion were disbursed during the first 6 months out of a target Rs. 1001 billion set by SBP under the agricultural credit disbursement. There has been increased emphasis on research to produce high yielding varieties to enhance productivity and reduce the cost of production. Within the agriculture sector, the government has prompted public-private partnerships to improve the post-harvest processes and facilitate processing and efficient storage of grains.

Housing component remained the lowest scoring component of Punjab. Multiple housing scheme plans were launched in various cities of Punjab such as Faisalabad, Lahore, Sahiwal; for people earning as low as Rs. 20,000 per month. The housing schemes announced for Lahore became rather controversial and due to allegations of corruption levelled against the housing scheme. A special committee was formed to look into the matter and carry out investigations as a result of which former LDA chairman was arrested by NAB. Some subcomponents of the manifesto failed to see any reporting. No Tripartite Provincial Productivity Council was established; issues pertaining to provincial infrastructure bonds or project specific bonds in order to develop secondary centers of industrial activities were not addressed and remained unsolved; the manifesto included provisions for extension of irrigation facilities to additional areas including major program of aquifer recharge in arid and semiarid areas of Cholistan, which unfortunately could not be initiated.

Punjab government has out done itself in most sectors and have remained the top performing province throughout the term. And the execution of the manifesto set by PML-N in their manifesto set for Punjab has being carried out effectively; however there still remains room for improvement and the hindrances faced could be easily overcome through better accountability and standardization of processes.

A Government Imagined? PPP Socio-Economic Agenda Tracking Report

2018- Pakistan Peoples Party's (PPP) final leg in the current 5-year term. The year also marks, the party's 10th straight year in power at the provincial level. Apart from having the majority number of seats in the Sindh Provincial Assembly, the leaders of opposition in both houses of parliament belong to PPP. Moreover, during the period under review in this report, the Chairman of Senate and the Chairman of the federal Public Accounts Committee also belonged to PPP.

This is to say that if the party had considerable power to exercise its check over the federal government, and hence had strong bargaining power. Provincial legislative aside, even if the party wanted to introduce any legislative reforms at the federal level, it had considerable power it could have used to leverage its negotiations.

This economic agenda tracking report assigns the PPP government an overall average score of 2.99 out of 10. This is a fall in score from the previous score of 3.71, assigned in the last issue of the report in 2017. While the scorecard details progress on each subcomponent, the following paragraphs explain in brief the main factors behind the scores.

PPP has fared low on the component of 'Agriculture and Livestock'. The populist political party, whose electoral constituency is predominantly rural and agricultural, has been assigned a component average score of 3 out of 10, in this report. This score should be interpreted to mean policy direction is unclear, institutional bottlenecks exist and no or very little implementation has started.

The low score is mainly due to the provincial government's complete failure in delivering upon its promises to introduce flat-rate electricity tariff, set up cooperatives of farmers for the provision of collective credit, set up agriculture markets at Taluka level; and to set up grain storage silos under Public-Private Partnership mode.

Revenue collection has improved but score on 'Resource Mobilization' remains low. The manifest of this report is to score the performance of the government strictly on the basis of publicly available reports on progress towards fulfilling election promises, as enlisted in the economic agenda of the governing political party. Ergo, although Sindh Board of Revenue has registered a 47% growth in its revenue collection, but due to the manifest of this report, PPP government has been assigned a component average score of 4.67 out of 10.

In the area of Resource Mobilization, PPP had promised elimination of indirect taxes on agriculture. On this sub-component, a score of zero has been assigned for non-deliverance, and

this has had a great impact on the average score of the component, which only has three sub-components.

‘Health’ has been scored as 2.83 out of 10, in the report. Full Immunization Coverage rate at 45% does not even extend to half the target population. Nothing has been done to set up micro-insurance health units. Population growth rate, recorded at 3.37 percent, is considerably higher than the targeted 1.6 percent. Provision of MNCH services was to be extended to every Basic Health Unit (BHU) and Rural Health Centre (RHC) in each district. Updated data on this indicator is not available but what is certain is that the government is nowhere near to achieving this goal yet. As per MICS 2014, 40 percent of children under five were underweight; 73 percent of children under five were anemic; and half of under-five child population in Sindh was classified as stunted. So far, in 2018, 155 deaths of children have been reported from Thar due to malnutrition. 50 fatalities have occurred in March alone.

In 2018, Pakistan has decided to reconduct the National Nutrition Survey, after a gap of seven years. This time around, data will be collected not at the provincial, but at the district level. Even MICS report was last published in 2014.

‘Education’ got a score of 3.43 out of 10, which is a slight deterioration from the previous score of 3.58. Chief reasons for this low score include the failure to bring about a change in the curriculum, lack of incentives for girls to enroll in schools, and a low primary school enrolment rate at just 33 percent.

As per Sindh Education Profile 2016-17, released in January 2018, the number of unsafe school buildings in the province has been identified as 5,998. As per a report by Alif Ailaan, on the measure of primary school infrastructure score index, Karachi East as the top ranked district in the province⁶. The dismal state of education infrastructure can be judged from this that the top ranked district of the province is at the 62nd place in national rankings.

On ‘Labor and Human Resources’, Government of Sindh scored 4 out of 10. Given the party’s ideological socialist leanings, one would expect that the government would have initiated new projects to address the plight of labor. The Benazir Income Support Programme launched in 2008 still remains PPP’s flagship program. No successor scheme has been launched in the current 5-year term 2013-18.

The promised labor committees at the district level have not been set up. A labor housing complex was announced to be set up in Karachi but the project has seen no on-ground work yet.

⁶ Sindh Education Report; Date Accessed: April 16, 2018; <https://elections.alifailaan.pk/wp-includes/file/SindhEducationReport18.pdf>

The report however welcomes the introduction of an online registration portal for industrial workers which has seen the registration of 0.7 million workers, so far. A lot more needs to be done to increase the number of registered workers, so that the underlying aim behind this registration portal can be achieved.

‘Transport’ got scored as 3 out of 10. The component has two subcomponents in the PPP economic agenda 2013. One is to improve public bus service, and on this front, work on the Green Line Bus Rapid Transit project is underway in Karachi. The second subcomponent was to float municipal bonds to raise funds for transportation projects. On this agenda, there is no development so far.

The final component of the PPP economic agenda, tracked in this report, is ‘Housing’. The component has three sub-components: construction of 500,000 houses for homeless poor under public-private partnership mode; construction of low-cost housing developments on government land with a 20-year mortgage facility; and providing tax credit to those low-cost housing schemes which use alternative energy as the primary source of power. On all these three preceding sub-components of ‘Housing’, this report assigns a score of zero.

PPP government has received a dismal overall average score of 2.99 out of 10, which is a significant drop from the already low score of 3.66, in the last report. After ten consecutive years in power at the provincial level, one should certainly expect better.

Political Coalition Outcomes: An Insight to Balochistan's Scenario

The performance of Balochistan Government is a complex matter. The question of how it has performed in the past five years is one which does not have a simple answer to it. This is mainly due to the fact that the province did not have a stable government in the past five years. The two parties namely the National Party and PML-N formed a coalition in terms of a power-sharing deal where the first half of the term was to be governed by the National Party while the second half by the PML-N. However, what needs to be considered is if such a short time period will be adequate for a government to deliver effectively on its agenda and will it be fair to judge its performance over a time period that is half of other provincial governments'.

As far as the performance of the provincial government is concerned, it is evaluated on the basis of achievement of targets and goals as outlined by the ruling political party in their agendas. However, due to the absence of an economic agenda to track, this report includes only a narrative on Balochistan.

Governance instability as well as other problems that plague Balochistan has hindered its progress. The province suffers from various issues such as poor education and health, poverty, unemployment, water and energy crisis etc. According to the Alif Ailaan's District Education Report⁷, education has been a low priority area due to the 'unique topography, demography and the political instability' that prevails in the province. However, effort has been made to address the education crisis through the inception of Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-18. Resultantly, the Education Sector has witnessed some improvement in terms of student enrolment and the number of primary, middle and high schools. However, a lot more needs to be done as 35 percent children between the ages of 5 to 16 in the province are out of school of which 70 percent are girls. The primary attendance rate is 42 percent and only 27 percent of the children who start school, complete grade 5.

On the other hand, the Health Sector displays a rather dismal state. Around 11 million kids die before reaching the age of five due to malnutrition. Maternal Mortality Rate is alarming with 785 per 100,000 live births while Infant Mortality Rate is 97 per 1000 live births.⁸ Health services in general are of poor quality and hospitals lack adequate supply of necessary equipment and staff. There has been little or no tangible outcome of the expenditure allocated for health. There is a dire need in the province for improved provision of emergency health care services and a nutrition surveillance system.

⁷ Alif Ailaan 2017. Pakistan District Education Rankings 2017. Islamabad: Alif Ailaan. vi-66 pp; Date Accessed: April 16, 2018.

⁸ Health Sector in Balochistan- Problems and Solutions; February 18, 2015; Date Accessed: April 16, 2018; <http://thebalochistanpoint.com/exclusive-report-health-sector-in-balochistan-problems-and-solutions/>

Another issue plaguing the province is that of poverty and unemployment. According to UNDP's Poverty Report⁹, Balochistan has been declared the poorest province of Pakistan. Despite being the least populated province in the country, more than 52 percent of its population lives below the poverty line and nearly one-third of its population is unemployed. The lack of an industrial base is probably the biggest cause of unemployment. In order to resolve these issues, the government claims CPEC to bring an end to this by making the province a major beneficiary of the multi-billion dollar economic development project. A large investment is being made by the government to develop Gwadar port into a strategic economic hub and create employment opportunities for the citizens.

In terms of water availability, Balochistan suffers from acute water shortage. According to the reports 62 percent of the province is deprived of safe drinking water and almost 58 percent of its land is uncultivable due to water scarcity.¹⁰ To address the issue of water scarcity, the government has installed a large number of tube wells. According to the Quetta Water and Sanitation Authority (QWASA), work is underway at Mangi Dam located in Ziarat. The dam is expected to be functional in two years and provide Quetta with 80 million gallons of water daily.

Apart from the water crisis, Energy shortage is another impediment to Balochistan's growth. As per available data, total electricity demand of Balochistan is around 1,650 megawatt (MW). However, the electric grid network in the province has the capacity to transmit only up to 650MW of electricity.¹¹ The province does not acquire the stipulated amount of power mainly due to the line losses, theft, diversion of power to other provinces and unchallengeable dominance of other provinces on the Ministry of Power and Water. Recently, the Balochistan Government has shown a keen interest in overcoming the energy crisis by diverting towards the use of Solar Energy System. Under a special project, a 300MW solar power plant would be constructed in Kuchlak area of Quetta district. Hence, the power supply is expected to be converted into solar energy system.

In order to alleviate other issues such as economic deprivation, social inequality and environmental degradation, the Government of Balochistan along with other partner organizations namely NRSP, RSPN and BRSP has implemented a five-year rural development

⁹ UNDP Poverty Report: Balochistan ranked poorest province of Pakistan; February 20, 2018; Date Accessed: April 17, 2018;
<https://dunyanews.tv/en/Pakistan/428456-UNDP-poverty-report-Balochistan-ranked-poorest-province-of-Pakistan>

¹⁰ Water and Electricity Shortage in Gwadar, June 6, 2017; Date Accessed: April 17, 2018;
<http://thebalochistanpoint.com/letter-water-and-electricity-shortage-in-gwadar/>

¹¹ Energy Crisis in Balochistan, June 14, 2016; Date Accessed: April 17, 2018;
<https://pakobserver.net/energy-crisis-in-balochistan>

program called the 'Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Programme (BRDCEP)'.¹² The project initiated on June 2017 and targets 8 districts of Balochistan. It aims to empower the local citizens through an inclusive and community driven socio-economic development interventions.

In short, both the provincial governments in Balochistan have spent more on infrastructure than on social services. Thus, poverty still remains a significant issue in the province. The province has a long way ahead of it. It needs to catch up with other provinces in terms of law and order as well as socio-economic development by utilizing its share of NFC efficiently.

¹² Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Programme; Date Accessed: April 17, 2018; <http://www.rspn.org/index.php/current-projects/eu-rspn-balochistan-rural-development-and-community-empowerment-programme-brdcep/>

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PTI Economic Agenda: Tracking Report

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Agriculture and Livestock			3.5	4.7
Computerize all land record	Only 6.2% of the project amount has been utilized, so far. Two service delivery centers have been made partially functional, in Peshawar and Mardan. 60 percent of the revenue department records has been computerized Launch of Computerized Land Record from July 2014.	Seven districts under phase-1, 12 yet to be added. PTI claims 25% land record to be complete, opposition rejects claims, remarking that there is no work being done on ground. PTI says they've yet to hire computer operators and construct centers. ¹³	6	7.5

osition rejects KP minister's claims of land record computerization, October 21, 2017; <https://dailytimes.com.pk/128459/opp-rejects-kp-ministers-land-record-computerisation/>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Ensure access to credit	Rs. 25,000 per acre agricultural loans will be provided farmers. Rs. 200 million allocated through Cooperative Bank.	Banks shying away from extending credit to private sector within KPK, keen to engage in cross-provincial lending. Lending ratio of 1.3pc against deposit ratio of 7.4pc. Growing disconnect between banks' lending and their deposit mobilization. Banks are discouraged by the government's strict condition of 200pc to 300pc collateral requirement. ¹⁴	2.5	0

credit eludes KP businesses, December 04, 2017; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1374313>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Ensure access to Agricultural inputs	Free of cost provision of seeds for plantation of olives. Rs. 15m allocated in budget for building growing capacity of small farmers. Rs150m for 100 solar-powered pumps in the province announced in budget.	100% budget for agriculture sector utilized; special seeds distributed among farmers and a special orchard on fertile agrarian land set up to boost fruit production. ¹⁵	4	8
Connect provincial agriculture department with universities	Graduate courses have been offered.	Previous status maintained. ¹⁶	3	3

a projects jeopardising PTI govt's development slogan, June 08, 2017 ; <https://nation.com.pk/08-Jun-2017/mega-projects-jeopardising-pti-govt-s-development-slogan>

e Paper 2017-18 , June 07, 2017; <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/attachments/article/337/white-paper-2017-18.pdf>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Public/Private partnership for establishing grain silos	Proposal forwarded for the year 2016-2017 to the Planning and Development Department for construction of steel silos in District Tank, Hangu, Dir Upper, Malakand, and Chitral. Allocations made for feasibility study.	Construction of multiple food grain godowns. ¹⁷ Multiple districts with varying capacity. ¹⁸	2	5
Resource Utilization			2.5	6

P approves developmental projects costing Rs20082.250mn, December 21, 2017; <https://www.brecorder.com/2017/12/21/388453/pdwp-approves-developmental-projects-costing-rs20082-250mn/>
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, ADP 2017-2018; <http://food.kp.gov.pk/page/adp>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Agriculture tax from large landowners	KP improved its share of income from Agriculture Income Tax to 0.6% from the previous 0.4%. Agricultural Income Tax (AIT) collection in 2015-2016 stood at Rs. 80 million as against target of Rs. 1bn. There are 27,794 farmers who own land in excess of 5 acres but only a few hundred are registered as AIT payers.	Land Tax and Agricultural Income Tax Ordinance to be extended to the previously tax-exempt Provincially Administered Tribal Areas. ¹⁹ Rs. 88 million collected under agriculture tax and Rs.2.78 million collected as Rent of Agriculture Land for single year. ²⁰	2.5	6
Health			4.17	7.5

govt set to extend land, agriculture tax ordinance to PATA, April 21, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1390272/k-p-govt-set-extend-land-agriculture-pata/>

Annual Budget Statement 2017-18, Page 19, June 07, 2017; <http://www.pakp.gov.pk/2013/wp-content/uploads/annual-budget-17-18.pdf>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Free primary healthcare system for poor	Health insurance card scheme announced for KP. Families would be covered up to Rs. 210,000. Scheme to benefit 1,800,000 families.	Currently 14.5 million people have the health insurance card, the government intends to add 2.4 million individuals: together these form approximately 70pc of the population. ²¹ 'Sehat Cards' will be issued to the transgender community through which they will be able to avail free medical treatment facilities from nominated hospitals, both public and private. ²²	5	8

2.4m more people to get health cards in K-P, May 29, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1421728/2-4m-people-get-health-cards-k-p/>
 Health for all: KP Government enrolls transgender community, January 12, 2018; <https://nation.com.pk/12-Jan-2018/health-for-all-kp-government-enrolls-transgender-community>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69			
	Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Modernization of DHQs	Targets set out in the 2016-17 white paper include standardization of all DHQs/THQs in K-P, and improvement of emergency services in all DHQs and teaching hospitals. 3 new DHQs completed.	All hospitals' records have been digitalized; laboratory receipts are available online; biometric attendance of doctors. ²³	4	8

a projects jeopardising PTI govt's development slogan, June 08, 2017; <https://nation.com.pk/08-Jun-2017/mega-projects-jeopardising-pti-govt-s-development-slogan>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA) Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Create jobs in healthcare (doctors, nurses, paramedics)	<p>The numbers of doctors/ radiologists in the province saw no change during Jan 2014- Jan 2015. Dental surgeons were reduced from 167 to 161. The number of nurses increased from 3620 to 3673. The strength of LHWs fell from 1138 to 1034.</p> <p>Doctors inducted to fulfill vacant posts.</p>	<p>Record number of medical staff and doctors recruited in various hospitals.²⁴</p> <p>Ratio of doctors per 1,000 people increased to 0.24 from 0.16.²⁵</p>	3	6

a projects jeopardising PTI govt's development slogan, June 08, 2017; <https://nation.com.pk/08-Jun-2017/mega-projects-jeopardising-pti-govt-s-development-slogan>

n Khan's party improves services in Pakistan's wildest province, June 08, 2017; <https://www.economist.com/news/asia/21723144-can-pti-stay-pc-hans-party-improves-services-pakistans-wildest-province>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA) Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Provide clean drinking water	140 out of 240 clean drinking water schemes have been completed in the province. Water quality monitoring laboratories have been established in Districts Mardan, Abbottabad, Kohat and Dera Ismail Khan. Work on gravity flow water schemes is underway in Drosh and Batkhela.	16pc of schools in KPK still do not have access to clean drinking water. ²⁶ Rs. 9 billion spent on more than 900 clean drinking water schemes, in over six districts. 445 out of these 900+ schemes have been completed. ²⁷	5	7

eeli? Progress, but many a mile to destination still, January 3, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1599182/1-tabdeeli-progress-many-mile-desti>

ompletes 445 water schemes in southern districts, January 21, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1614051/1-k-p-completes-445-water-scheme:n-districts/>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Initiate mega population control program	Rs. 230 million have been allocated for population welfare in Annual Development Program. Only 18.1% of ADP budget 2015-16 allocated for population welfare was utilized.	Allocation of Rs. 230 million has been made for total of four projects; three ongoing projects, worth Rs. 182 million and one new project with an allocation of Rs. 48 million. ²⁸ According to Population Welfare Department, KP witnessed an increase of 11.3 in Couple Years of Protection and has the highest overall Contraceptive Prevalence Rate of 46pc compared to other provinces. ²⁹	2	6

e Paper 2017-18, Page 87, June 07, 2017; <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/attachments/article/337/white-paper-2017-18.pdf>
 Population planning and growth, September 15, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1506431/population-planning-growth/>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Healthcare awareness campaign and drug abuse campaigns	<p>Sehat ka Insaf (phase 2) launched. It is a complete health package to eradicate polio and other health diseases.</p> <p>CM inaugurated two new buildings in Hayatabad for drug rehabilitation; Sakoon Kore 3, and 4.</p> <p>Sehat ka Insaf Campaign Launched in Jan 2014 to immunize 8lakh children in Peshawar during 3 months. Confirmed Polio Cases 9/67 as of 22nd May 2014.</p> <p>Out of 1.4 m children 1.3m were immunized in 4 districts.</p>	<p>Breast Cancer awareness symposium organized by Khyber Medical University.³⁰</p> <p>Door-to-door campaign launched for awareness regarding Dengue Virus: need based campaign after five deaths.³¹</p> <p>Awareness session regarding AIDS held at Jamrud.³²</p> <p>Under the BESC program, schools to provide free mental health counselling and drug awareness in Mardan and Peshawar.³³</p>	6	10

Organizes Breast Cancer Awareness Symposium At KGMC, February 01, 2018; <https://www.urdupoint.com/en/health/kmu-organizes-breast-cancer-symposium-253669.html>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Education			6	5.89
One education system	The Higher Education Department of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has decided to formulate a uniform model statutes for public sector universities. Class-based education system had been replaced with unified English medium education all over the province.	Parvez Khattak, approves release of grants worth Rs. 284 million, said that the government would ensure equal educational facilities throughout the province for the welfare of a society. ³⁴ The government to standardize education at 402 higher secondary schools across the province. ³⁵ 88 Higher Secondary Schools have been standardized. ³⁶	5	6

govt launches door-to-door campaign as five die from dengue in Peshawar, August 22, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1487225/k-p-govt-launches-door-campaign-five-die-dengue-peshawar/>
awareness session organised in FATA, December 5, 2017; <https://dailytimes.com.pk/152971/aids-awareness-session-organised-fata/>
launches health support programme, November 15, 2017; <https://dailytimes.com.pk/139922/beccs-launches-health-support-programme/>
VI presides over FEF board of directors' meeting, August 06, 2017; <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2017/08/06/kp-cm-presides-over-fef-board-meeting/>
o 'standardise' education in 402 public schools, July 13, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1456635/k-p-standardise-education-402-public-schools/>
e Paper 2017-18, Page 21, June 07, 2017; <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/attachments/article/337/white-paper-2017-18.pdf>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Urdu and one local language medium of instruction till 8th grade	Such scheme to teach regional languages in schools had already been initiated by the ANP government in 2013-14 school year.	KPK government introduced English language as medium of instructions in schools.	No score	0
English to be medium of instruction in universities	Medium of instruction in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been changed from Urdu to English from April 2014.	80,000 teachers trained to use English as a medium of instruction; 45,000 teachers currently undergoing training. ³⁷	10	10

eeli? Progress, but many a mile to destination still, January 03, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1599182/1-tabdeeli-progress-many-mile-tion-still/>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA) Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
All hiring of teachers within their district of choice	In KPK, the government allows teachers to specify five nearby schools of their choice in the entry forms during the recruitment process. Promulgation of the rationalization policy for schools in 5 districts including Peshawar, Charsadda, Nowshera, Mardan, and Swabi. Later extended throughout the province. Under the policy, teachers in all these districts would be transferred and posted in schools of their nearest places of choice. Later there would be complete ban on transfers.	Previous status maintained.	9	9

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Need based voucher system to fund students where govt schools are not enough	14000 children have benefitted from voucher scheme. In February 2017, a survey was initiated to extend this scheme to 16000 students in six districts. Rs.500-800 is provided per child per month depending upon level of education. Cabinet approved the Introduction of Education Voucher Scheme with an allocation of Rs.500 million.	50,000 poor students given education vouchers through Iqra Farogh-e-Taleem Education Voucher Scheme; a public-private partnership targeting out-of-school children. ³⁸	4	8

eeli? Progress, but many a mile to destination still, January 03, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1599182/1-tabdeeli-progress-many-mile-tion-still/>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Stipends for poor students	Monthly stipends of Rs. 200 for female students of class VI-X.	300 scholarships ranging from Rs. 15,000 to Rs. 40,000 offered to minority community students enrolled in any grade from intermediate to PhD. ³⁹	4.0	6
Double number of girls' high schools in 5 years.	Number of high schools for females in the province has increased to 722 in 2014-15 compared to 676 in 2013-14.	Government girl's primary school reopened in Mardan, Mattani. ⁴⁰ 285 girls' community schools established. ⁴¹	3	6

minority community: K-P announces scholarships, January 01, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1597585/1-minority-community-k-p-announce-ships/>

govt reopens 561 non-functional schools, October 29, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1544074/1-k-p-govt-reopens-561-non-functional-schools>
e Paper 2017-18, Page 20, June 07, 2017; <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/attachments/article/337/white-paper-2017-18.pdf>

Incentives for girls' education (uniforms, free books, meals, scholarships & transportation)	<p>443,204 female students were provided stipends in Qtr 4, 2016-17. KP government approved bill calling for education to be imparted free of cost in all public sector education institutions. Primary and secondary education to be made compulsory for all children between 5-16 years of age. Parents would be punishable with imprisonment up to one month and/or fine of Rs.100 per day.</p> <p>An amount of Rs.100 million was approved as stipend @ Rs.200/- per month for girl students enrolled in primary schools of seven selected districts of Hangu, Peshawar, Bannu, Lakki, D.I.Khan, Shangla and Nowshera</p> <p>7 lakh children enrolled in schools during 2013-14.</p> <p>Free books distributed among 54lakh students.</p>	Over 415,000 students were provided with stipends under the 'girls' stipend program' (GSP) across 23 districts. ⁴²	7	7
--	---	---	---	---

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Improve adult literacy 15-30 age group	As yet no development	To rehabilitate prisoners through education, adult literacy and non-formal basic education center inaugurated at Central Jail Peshawar. 30 prisoners enrolled. A container library was also set up and different books, novels, newspapers will be available for the prisoners. ⁴³	No score	1
Labour and Human Resources			5.5	5

eeli? Progress, but many a mile to destination still, January 03, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1599182/1-tabdeeli-progress-many-mile-tion-still/>

t literacy centre set up in Peshawar jail, May 21, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1415057/adult-literacy-centre-set-peshawar-jail/>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Jawan Markaz to be established in every district/tehsil to facilitate local entrepreneurs	Decision to set up a youth commission. Rs. 1 billion earmarked for establishment of youth centre. Loans worth Rs2.1 b distributed amongst unemployed youth under self-employment scheme. Scholarship worth Rs2000 for unemployed graduate students.	Directorate of Youth Affairs and LUMS launched a youth-friendly program of business ideas, <i>Jawan Markaz</i> : established at divisional headquarter level and Rs. 1 billion allocated for this purpose. ⁴⁴	5.5	7

providing job security for educated youth prime responsibility of govt: CM Khattak, February 15, 2018;
www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/02/15/providing-job-security-for-educated-youth-prime-responsibility-of-govt-cm-khattak/

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Vocational training programs	Special assistant to CM announced in May 2016 that a technical university would be set up in Nowshera. Training centre for women entrepreneurs would be established in KP under the KP Women Skill and Entrepreneurship Development Programme (plan approved by federal govt organization). 2842 students were provided free technical education. 2200 persons placed by employment exchanges.	2,842 students have been trained against the total target of 3500 under the free technical education special initiatives. 24,046 persons were enrolled/trained in 67 TEVT Institutes in 2016-17. MOU with the World Learning Organization for training in Information Technology in 6 institutes for training of 1,350 persons per year. Chinese Language introduced in 4 institutes with enrolment of 404 students in first batch. ⁴⁵	5.5	8

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69			
	Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Tripartite board consisting of the employer, labor and inspectors for each sector to improve plight of labor (prevent unemployment, occupational safety, working hours)	As yet no development	No development as yet.	No score	0
Transport			4	6

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Cost Effective and Efficient transport services	Work on Bus Rapid Transit system to begin in Jan 2017 and be completed by Dec 2017. Mass transit system approved at a cost of Rs. 25bn for Peshawar. 5 corridors for Metro Bus and One for rail service have been selection work start from September 2014 from Chamkani to Hayatabad KPK govt approved Rs10b for Peshawar mass transit.	Project to be completed by March and the service to be functional by April 2018. ⁴⁶ 80 buses will run on main routes and 300 buses on eight feeder routes. 40 pc of KP's total population has no access to any form of transport. ⁴⁷	4	6
Industrial Development			4.5	4.5

er construction, January 26, 2018; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/272995-under-construction>
ng transport easier in KP, November 06, 2017; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1368728>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Develop industrial infrastructure & estate with basic facilities in every district	Project underway for establishment of industrial estates at Chitral, Mansehra, Dargai, Malakand; and for establishment of small industrial estate Abbottabad-II. Programme ongoing for purchase of land for establishment of industrial estates at the border of Karak and Kohat; for 2 nd industrial estate at Peshawar; small industrial estate at Swat.	Purchase of land for establishment of Industrial Estate at the Border of Karak and Kohat (Phase-I), and for 2 nd industrial estate in Peshawar. ⁴⁸	6	5

White Paper 2017-18, Page 82, June 07, 2017; <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/attachments/article/337/white-paper-2017-18.pdf>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Encourage provincial infrastructure development schemes and projects for exports	25% subsidy on cost of land, 25% payment by the government on electricity bills for three years. Government will bear 25% transportation charges on machinery and plant transportation. Government will also share 25% of the total investment of those who would come to invest in the industrial sector in the provinces. Establishment of small industrial estate Abbottabad-II. Establishment of Mineral Based Industrial Estate at Chitral.	Introduced trade-friendly policies and simplified the processes for business and industrial activities. ⁴⁹	3	4
Housing			5.5	6

er Pakhtunkhwa anticipates resumption of industrial activities, May 2, 2017; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/201854-Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa-ates-resumption-of-industrial-activities>

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
Provide incentives to meet massive backlog of housing	CM Khattak said four housing schemes would be launched in the province-one each in Peshawar, Nowshera, Hangu and Chitral. Mega Education City, M-1, Nowshehra, Mega Sports City Peshawar, New City Abbottabad and New City and Tourism Resort Booni, Chitral.	Rs. 540 million allocated for 16 projects; 07 worth Rs. 432 million are ongoing and 09 new projects including Hangu Townships, Khpal Kor-Low Cost Housing in Il, Aboha Hosing Scheme Swat, planning and Designing of Apartments and Shopping Complex on Warsak Road, Peshawar with allocation of Rs.108.001 Million. ⁵⁰	5.5	6
Governance			6.5	5.4

Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)		
		Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
E-governance	KP assembly becomes the first to launch e-governance system making the assembly proceeding paper-less. Performance Management and Reforms Unit has enabled online performance monitoring of provincial departments. Launch of KP citizens' portal to allow citizens to register their complaints about service delivery. Microsoft to help KPK e-government Online FIR Registration.	Province's first online treatment facility launched in the Bilahi area of district Mansehra, the center is equipped with diagnostic laboratory as well as electrocardiogram. ⁵¹ Rs. 3 million allocated for establishment of E-Governance Cell under Drinking Water & Sanitation department. ⁵²	3	6

K-P launches province's first online healthcare facility, October 16, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1532677/e-ilaj-k-p-launches-provinces-fir-healthcare-facility/>

ial Development Budget 2017-18, Page 66, June 2017; <http://www.pndkp.gov.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/ADP-2017-18-Finale.pdf>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69 Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
A DFC for every district to ensure equal distribution of funds to Tehsils and villages	District Performance Monitoring Framework for effective online monitoring of all 25 district governments in province has been established.	Government still unable to finalize sixth PFC, continues to use interim arrangement. Share of 11 districts exceeds actual funds, while other districts receive less than their share. ⁵³	10	6
Electronic Mapping of Property	As yet, no development	Seven districts under phase-1, 12 yet to be added. Government claims 25% land record to be complete. ⁵⁴	No score	5
Introduce socio-economic measurement structure at Union Council Level	As yet, no development	No specific measures taken.	No score	0

at to finalise PFC formula, 31 December, 2017; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1379805>

osition rejects KP minister's claims of land record computerization, October 21, 2017; <https://dailytimes.com.pk/128459/opp-rejects-kp-ministers-land-record-computerisation/>

Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)			
	Previous score: 4.69			
	Current Score: 5.67			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total 10
GPRS based system to match availability and need for teachers	As yet, no development	System was introduced.	No score	10

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PML-N Economic Agenda: Tracking Report

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45		
		Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Agriculture and Livestock			4.8	5.4
Ensure availability of credit to small farmers	Banks have made agricultural credit disbursement of Rs. 598.3 billion against the targeted 600bn in FY2016.	2016-17 Kissan Package was barely able to identify eligible farmers, in 2017-18 the government has allocated Rs. 15 billion again. Statistics show that most farmers are unaware of the package. ⁵⁵ Agricultural credit disbursement target of Rs. 1001 billion set by SBP, Rs. 432 billion disbursed during the first 6 months. ⁵⁶	7.7	9

irity of small farmers knocked out of Khadim-e-Punjab Kissan Package, November 08, 2017; <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2017/11/08/maj-l-farmers-knocked-out-of-khadim-e-punjab-kissan-package/>

Asks Banks To Ensure Agri Credit Target of Rs. 1 Trillion in FY18, February 01, 2018; <https://propakistani.pk/2018/02/01/sbp-asks-banks-ensure-ag-target-rs-1-trillion-fy18/>

N Manifesto	Implementation Status (PUNJAB) Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Revamp all research on agriculture sector and intensify research to bring down cost of production for agriculture sector which has gone up due to high petroleum prices	Work on construction of new agricultural offices complex at Murree Road, and Soil Construction, Agricultural Engineering Workshops and Offices at Adyala Road, Rawalpindi started on July 1st 2013 (3 years project). Strengthening of research facilities at Fodder Research Sub-station, AARI Faisalabad for the development of Silage type corn varieties Strengthening of Food Technology Section & PHRC, Ayub Agricultural Research Institute, Faisalabad. Development of Genetic Engineering Facilities at Agri. Biotechnology Res. Institute, AARI, Faisalabad Multiple government organizations are working in this regard: Ayub Agriculture Research Institute, Faisalabad; National Institute for	Research projects, being run to increase yield and hence indirectly reduce cost of production, such as Nutritional Enhancement of Agricultural Wastes and its use in Animal Feeding) to enhance productivity and development of short duration, sunflower hybrids with better yield. ⁵⁷	6	8
Annual Tracking Report	Biotechnology and Genetic Engineering, Faisalabad; National Institute for Agriculture and Biology, Faisalabad;			P

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45		
		Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Improve arrangements for storage and subsidized distribution to ensure relative price stability throughout the year including post-harvest storage and marketing systems	In budget 2016-17, amount has been allocated for construction of 30,000 tonnes capacity, concrete silos at Ahmadpur (East) and Chishtian.	ADB approved multiple developmental loans, including loans for establishment of food grain silos under public private partnership. ⁵⁸	2	4

ab Agricultural Research Board, Government of the Punjab, Accessed on: March 05, 2018; http://parb.agripunjab.gov.pk/project_ongoing approves \$480mln in loans to help improve economy, December 19, 2017; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/257677-adb-approves-480mln-in-improve-economy>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45		
		Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Establishment of Land Development Corporations with majority equity of the poor and managed by professional managers	As yet, no development	Ashiana e Iqbal, Ashiana e Quaid, housing scheme launched in Lahore for people earning less than Rs. 50, 000/month and Rs. 20, 000/month. Ashiana Housing Scheme launched in Sahiwal and Faisalabad for people earning less than Rs. 30, 000/month. ⁵⁹	No score	4
Extension of irrigation facilities to additional areas including major program of aquifer recharge in arid and semiarid areas of Cholistan	As yet, no development	Not announced.	No score	0

ab Land Development Company Limited, Government <http://pldc.gop.pk/ashiana-e-iqbal-barki-road-lahore/#1515364068650-18b73e7c-9f64f1430-5d93>

N Manifesto	Implementation Status (PUNJAB) Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Update of revenue and property records using modern Information Technology	According to Senior Member of Punjab Board of Revenue, the Computerization of land record to be completed by December 2014. Punjab Land Record Authority inaugurated in December 2016. Computerization of land record underway.	Land Record Management and Information System launched; land search, property registry search, and mobile application for public use. ⁶⁰	5.5	8
Modernize agriculture education and curriculum of agriculture universities.	Training ongoing	Rs. 500 million allocated to upgradation of curriculum, teaching methodology and lab standards at UAF, Burewala. Promote R&D activities. ⁶¹	3	5
Taxation/Resource Mobilization			2.75	5.3

⁶⁰ Land Records Authority, Government of Punjab, 2017 <http://plra.punjab-zameen.gov.pk/>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Issue Provincial Infrastructure bonds or project specific bonds in order to develop secondary centers of Industrial activities.	As yet, no development	As yet, no development	No score	0
Reform of tax administration at the provincial level	The International Finance Corporation & Punjab government signed agreement to reform the province's sales tax system.	New reforms provided a framework to pursue areas of improvements. Old reforms have helped improve Punjab's Open Budget Index by 24.6 percent from 55 in 2014 to 68 in 2017. 20,000 new potential taxpayers identified from 22 districts. ⁶²	3	6
Reduce Number of Provincial taxes	Abolished bed tax on hotels; Imposed luxury tax on houses of 2 Kanals.	Certain taxes and duties abolished, rationalized or merged under the Punjab Finance Act. It proposes to merge Capital Value Tax into stamp duty. ⁶³	2.5	10

ab government focuses on sustainable tax growth, September 05, 2017; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/227751-Punjab-government-focuses-on-sustainable-tax-growth>

PUNJAB FINANCE ACT 2017, 16 June 2017; <http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2686.html>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Health			5.31	6.2
Health Insurance scheme for the most vulnerable and poor segment to avail basic healthcare in a government hospital or by a general practitioner at concessional rates	Health insurance program initiated in Districts Rahim Yar Khan, Khanewal, Narowal and Sargodha. 3 more districts to be included during Jan-Jun 2017. Vision is to extend it to all 36 districts by end of 2018.	Health Insurance Scheme to be expanded to thirty-two districts. ⁶⁴ 0.8 million families benefitting from the health insurance card scheme. Cards worth Rs. 50,000 to be launched in 13 more districts, 56 private hospitals empanelled. ⁶⁵	4.5	7

Health Insurance Scheme will expand to 32 districts of Punjab: CM Shahbaz, May 19, 2017; <https://nation.com.pk/19-May-2017/pm-s-health-ce-scheme-will-expand-to-32-districts-of-punjab-cm-shahbaz>
 th insurance card scheme being extended to 13 more districts: health minister, January 13, 2018;
www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/01/13/health-insurance-card-scheme-being-extended-to-13-more-districts-health-minister/

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Existing Basic Health Units will be strengthened and where possible leased to private medical practitioners in public-private partnership model	To appoint doctors at BHUs, grant of MBBS degree has been made conditional with serving at BHUs. In Jan 2017, Punjab govt said it had decided to introduce public-private partnership in health sector.	Ultrasound machines being provided to 700 BHUs and 200 Colour Doppler machines to RHCs. ⁶⁶ Upgradation of 2800 BHUs, Rs. 1.25 billion allocated to provide modern equipment to 2500 BHUs and 315 RHCs. ⁶⁷	2.5	5
Develop District Healthcare Authority (DHA) at each district level	DHAs established all over the province under the administrative control of Deputy Commissioners.	Recruitment for the DHAs has begun and operations are underway. Functions of the authority include monitoring policies standards, provide technical expertise, approve appropriations and lead fund-raising activities. ⁶⁸	10	10

baz enumerates Punjab's health feats, February 06, 2018; <https://nation.com.pk/06-Feb-2018/shehbaz-enumerates-punjab-s-health-feats>
) basic, rural health centres to be upgraded in Punjab, August 14, 2017, <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2017/08/14/2800-basic-rural-health-to-be-upgraded-in-punjab/>
 ict Health Authority Conduct of Business Rule, Date accessed: March 05, 2018;
[gcd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/District Health Authorities Conduct of Business Rules 2016.pdf](http://gcd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/District_Health_Authorities_Conduct_of_Business_Rules_2016.pdf)

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
At least 1,000 mobile health units will be launched to provide basic health facilities in remote areas and isolated localities	6 Mobile Health Units are already operational. Government has decided to outsource these six to private firms. CM has also approved purchase of 14 more.	54 more mobile hospitals to be set up by May 2018. ⁶⁹ 6 Mobile Health Units operational in 7 Southern districts installed with X-ray and laboratory facilities and are equipped with two doctors (male & female), medicines and a small operation theatre. ⁷⁰	2	4
Within 5 years, 100% vaccination of children	Punjab remained polio-free in 2016. First registered polio case of 2017 is from Punjab- after a period of 14 polio-free months for the province. Immunization coverage improved from 64% in 2014 to over 86% in one year.	Vaccine coverage reached 97%, with 5 districts achieving the 100% target. ⁷¹	8	9

baz enumerates Punjab's health feats, February 06, 2018; <https://nation.com.pk/06-Feb-2018/shehbaz-enumerates-punjab-s-health-feats>
e of the Chief Minister of Punjab, Accessed on March 05, 2018; <http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/healthsector>
ab Child Vaccination, Expanded Program on Immunization, Accessed on March 04, 2018; <http://open.punjab.gov.pk/evaccs/>

N Manifesto	Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
	Previous Score: 5.45				
	Current Score: 6.30				
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score	
Within 5 years 50% reduction in maternal and infant mortality	<p>Failure to achieve MDGs regarding infant and maternal mortality rate. Punjab government has launched MNCH program. Neo-natal mortality rate increased from 58 to 63 deaths per 1,000 births. Under-five mortality rate has reached 105 deaths per 1,000 live births.⁶⁷</p> <p>Rotavirus vaccine introduced in EPI immunization schedule of Punjab; should reduce diarrhea related deaths in children below five.</p>	Infant mortality rate has increased from 63 to 77 per 1000 live births. Maternal mortality ratio is estimated to be 300 per 100,000 live births, lower than the national figure of 350. ⁷²	4.5	2	

ab Health Profile, Health Department Punjab, Accessed on March 04, 2018; http://health.punjab.gov.pk/Punjab_Health_Profile

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Provision of clean drinking water and safe sewerage disposal will be given high priority	<p>Punjab Saaf Pani Company, work to restart, total estimated cost of the project was Rs12 billion under which 1,479 filtration plants were to be installed in 33 districts of Punjab⁶⁸ Formation of Waste management companies in 6 cities⁶⁹</p> <p>Allocation of Rs. 45bn in 2016-17 budget by Punjab government for providing adequate and safe drinking water and sanitation facilities. Allocation in 2015-16 budget was Rs. 24bn.</p>	<p>2.8 million people were reportedly suffering from water-borne disease in Punjab. 13% access to clean drinking water in rural areas compared with 43% in urban areas.⁷³</p> <p>98% of households had a flushing toilet in urban Punjab and 70% in rural Punjab.⁷⁴</p> <p>Punjab Saaf Pani Company has successfully installed 116 filtration plants in 5 southern tehsils - Minchinabad, Khanpur, Hasilpur, Lodhran, and Dunyapur - serving 0.35 million people. 274 previously dysfunctional rural water schemes rehabilitated.⁷⁵</p>	6.5	7

Provision of safe drinking water top priority of Punjab govt, December 03, 2017; <https://nation.com.pk/03-Dec-2017/provision-of-safe-drinking-water-of-punjab-govt>

Education, health, water, sanitation and economy sectors, June 11, 2017; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/209958-Education-health-water-sanitation-and-economy-sectors>

Punjab's dedicated efforts for provision of Potable Water, March 21, 2018; <https://pakobserver.net/punjab-dedicated-efforts-for-provision-of-potable-water>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45		
		Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Private sector will be encouraged to expand pharmaceutical manufacturing and setup manufacturing of diagnostic equipment	Fourth drug testing laboratory and research centre in the country at Sundar industrial estate, costing Rs100 million, where 166 pharmaceutical units have been sanctioned.	PBS data shows that in July-November pharmaceuticals grew by 3.71pc. ⁷⁶	4.5	6
Education			5.77	8.0

falls 2.02 percent in November as food output decline, January 20, 2018; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/270515-lsm-falls-2-02-percent-in-ber-as-food-output-decline>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45		
		Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Initiate legislation to provide a road map for achieving 100% enrollment up to the middle level and 80% universal literacy and strive to meet the target of 'Education For All (EFA)' and 'Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)'	44% children are out-of-school. In terms of school enrolment, Punjab ranks third after Islamabad and AJK in education score.	Current school enrollment of 93.6% with a dropout rate of 4.2%. ⁷⁷	4.5	8

llment Comparison, Target 2017, Date Accessed: March 06 2018; <http://open.punjab.gov.pk/schools/sis?pane=summary>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
To reduce drop-out rate at primary level, missing facilities in schools to be provided	Primary education got the lowest share of 4% in 2015-16 development budget. Rs8bn to be spent on uplift of 15,000 schools.	Rs. 230 billion allocated for District Education Authorities, which is 36.6% more than last year's budget. Parho Punjab Barho Punjab initiative to continue. ⁷⁸	6	8
Provide special incentives like free books to girls	Free books already being provided to boys and girls at primary level.	Scholarship for girls increased by five times in 16 under-developed districts, with a budgetary allocation of Rs. 6.5 billion. 0.46 million girls expected to benefit. ⁷⁹	3.5	10

Isome funds allocated for uplift of different sectors: Dr Ayesha, June 04, 2017; <http://dunyanews.tv/en/Pakistan/391324-Handsomeness-funds-allocated-for-different-sectors>

ab education budget increases by 10%, June 3, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1426110/punjab-education-budget-increases-10/>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Education Endowment Funds shall be set up in the province to award merit scholarships to poor and needy students for higher education.	44,000 active scholarships by Punjab Educational Endowment Fund (PEEF) during the year 2016-17 (in process). ⁷⁵ Education Endowment Fund already established and it awarded 16,881scholarships worth Rs 962 million awarded to students Punjab during 2013-14.	Punjab Educational Endowment Fund endowment has now been increased to Rs. 17.10 billion. 235,000 merit scholarships awarded to needy students. Few fully funded merit based foreign scholarships to Pakistan students for PhD level studies. ⁸⁰	7	10

baz rule marks revolutionary policies, innovation, February 26, 2018; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/285727-shahbaz-rule-marks-revolution-in-innovation>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Computer labs shall be established in all the government high schools in the first phase.	Budget allocation made in 2015-16 budget to establish computer labs in 990 high schools. No data on % of schools with computer labs; not all high schools have such facility so far. 4280 Labs have been set up in schools in Punjab.	IT Labs in 4,286 government middle schools in Punjab have been established. ⁸¹	6	8
All merit students in public universities shall be provided laptops to link them with the digital revolution	CM approved purchase of 150,000 laptops to be distributed in Punjab in 2016. 200,000 laptops given during the last reporting period.	300,000 laptops distributed among students. ⁸² Laptops distributed among meritorious students at the Islamia University, Bahawalpur. ⁸³	7	8

bs, Office of the Chief Minister of Punjab; Date Accessed: March 06, 2018; <http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/educationsector>
00 laptops distributed among students in Punjab, May 08, 2018; <https://www.techjuice.pk/300000-laptops-distributed-among-students-in-punjab>
rnor honours shining students with laptops, January 24, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1616279/1-governor-honours-shining-students-laptops>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45		
		Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Distance learning programs will be given priority to expand in public and private sector educational institutions	Punjab Information Technology Board has developed videos, animations, simulations and assessments to enhance learning values of textbooks grade 6th -10th Science.	EdX courses being taught to students under the direct supervision of the Information Technology University faculty, using digital study materials and technological platform. ⁸⁴ 1000 prisoners enrolled at AIOU, they will receive free education under the distant learning program. ⁸⁵	7	9

on its way to becoming first digital varsity of Pakistan', May 30, 2017; <https://dailytimes.com.pk/9078/itu-on-its-way-to-becoming-first-digital-varn/>

1,000 prisoners sign up for Allama Iqbal Open University courses <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1603053/1-1000-prisoners-sign-allama-iqbal-open-ity-courses/>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Madrassas will be provided financial assistance and other incentives to bring their syllabus and standards in conformity with the mainstream education.	Ittehad Tanzeem-ul-Madaris has unanimously decided to adopt the syllabus of Federal Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (FBISE) for Matriculation and Intermediate.	Wafaqul Madaris has agreed that the seminaries will follow the same syllabus which is being taught in schools and colleges. ⁸⁶	2.5	4
Promotion of teachers will be linked with their qualifications and performance.	Promotion Policy 2014 links promotion with qualification, not with performance as yet.	Punjab Government has decided to stop promotions of teachers under 3- tier formula of Chief Minister Package. ⁸⁷	2	4

n Iqbal calls for resolving larger political issues, January 30, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1622252/1-ahsan-iqbal-calls-resolving-larger-political-issues>

sion to abolish teachers' promotions resented, August 13, 2017; <https://nation.com.pk/13-Aug-2017/decision-to-abolish-teachers-promotions-resented>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45		
		Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
To improve administration of education sector, establish autonomous District Education Authorities (DEAs)	DEAs have been established in all 36 districts of Punjab. DEO would be chairman in every district and EDO would be secretary.	District Education Authorities to monitor education service delivery in the districts, with administrative and financial autonomy to develop and implement their own financial plans independently. ⁸⁸	10	10

ilaan's comment on Punjab Education Budget 2017-18, June 07, 2017; <https://nation.com.pk/07-Jun-2017/alif-ailan-analyses-punjab-education-b>
8

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Set up autonomous monitoring and evaluations authorities and use of modern technology to check the performance of education sector.	Government of the Punjab has established autonomous body which collects real-time data, based on monthly spot visits, across schools in Punjab. The data is available on the Program Monitoring & Implementation Unit-powered by Punjab Information Technology Board.	Under the Program Monitoring and Implementation Unit, School Education Department real time monitoring of schools provides access to real time data powered by Punjab Information Technology Board; including teachers' attendance, enrollment statistics, monthly indicators and comparative annual performance based on data from 52,230 schools from 36 districts. ⁸⁹	8.0	10
Labour and Human Resources			4.5	4.3

ram Monitoring and Implementation Unit, accessed March 04, 2018; <http://open.punjab.gov.pk/schools/>

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Youth training and skill development program shall be initiated to create one million positions for apprenticeship in trade and industry	73.2% employability rate of traceable pass-outs at PVTC. Together, PVTC, TEVTA and Punjab Skills Development Fund have completed a number of vocational training projects and there a number of such projects that are ongoing or are in the pipeline.	Punjab Skill Development Fund to launch Faisalabad based industry specific training for 5,000 youth to begin in July. FCCI has been engaged to identify sectors in need of skilled labour. ⁹⁰ In collaboration with Punjab Skill Development Fund 94 trainees of five vocational training courses - Livestock, Agriculture and Food processing - awarded certificates at Arid Agriculture University Rawalpindi. ⁹¹	5	7
Vocational and technical education will be promoted, especially in rural areas.	Punjab Vocational Training Council had 59,129 graduates in 2016. Annual Pass out capacity is 145,000.	Annual pass out capacity increased from 145,000 to 200,000. With 326 Vocational Training Institutes, having a 74% employability and student to trainee ratio of 17:1. ⁹²	4	6

's vocation training plan on the cards, February 17, 2018; <https://nation.com.pk/17-Feb-2018/psdf-s-vocation-training-plan-on-the-cards>
 university trains 94 in food processing, January 19, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1612402/1-arid-university-trains-94-food-processing/>
 Statistics, Punjab Vocational Training Council, Date accessed: March, 01, 2017; <http://www.pvtc.gov.pk/AtGlance.aspx#STAT>

N Manifesto	Implementation Status (PUNJAB) Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Establish Tripartite Provincial Productivity Council	As yet no development.	Not established.	No score	0
Transport			6.5	8
Build mass transit facilities in all major cities	Metro bus project completed in Rawalpindi and Multan. Orange Line Metro train project ongoing in Lahore.	<p>Orange Line Metro train started trial run in Lahore, it is expected to facilitate up to 250,000 commuters every day. 12km track still needs to be complete.⁹³</p> <p>Feeder Routes Operation to be enhanced and increased in Multan and Rawalpindi.⁹⁴</p> <p>Asian Development Bank and the government signed two loans totaling USD 380 million for projects to help improve transport sectors.⁹⁵</p>	6.5	8

ge Line Metro train runs on trial basis in Lahore, February 26, 2018; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/latest/285872-orange-line-metro-train-run-on-i-lahore>

ab Mass Transit Authority, 2017; <http://www.pma.punjab.gov.pk/>

approves \$480mln in loans to help improve economy, December 19, 2017; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/257677-adb-approves-480mln-in-improve-economy>

N Manifesto	Implementation Status (PUNJAB) Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Housing			7	4
1,000 clusters of 500 houses each for lower income families will be developed on a public private partnership mode.	<p>Apna Ghar Housing Scheme announced in 2013 is yet to materialize. MoU signed with Turkey to construct 50,000 low-cost houses.</p> <p>The Ashiana Housing Scheme already in progress in upcoming projects in Lahore, Faisalabad, Rawalpindi, Sargodha and Gujranwala.</p> <p>Faisalabad and Sahiwal ready to be allotted. Upcoming in Chiniot, Kasur and Bahawalpur.</p>	Construction of affordable housing units started under the public-private partnership mode, after ADB approved a USD 100 million loan to improve and strengthen development and delivery of public-private partnership. ⁹⁶	7	4
E-Governance			7	9

N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)		
		Previous Score: 5.45 Current Score: 6.30		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Tot Sco
Create and implement performance monitoring dashboards for all major provincial projects	Digital devices and apps are being used by the Monitoring and Evaluation Assistants for Primary and Secondary Health. Digitisation of land record and criminal records of province' 709 police stations, mapping of areas according to intensity of crime and monitoring of schools, hospitals and vaccinators through global positioning system-enabled devices. Pak-Turk collaboration in e-governance. E-governance projects by use of smart technology under way in various departments such as: Health, Livestock and Dairy, Irrigation, Agriculture, Lahore Waste Management Company, and Police. PITB is working on numerous Department of Health, Livestock and Dairy, Agriculture and Punjab Police are few instances. (Health	Dashboards created to monitor vaccinations (Punjab Child Vaccination) and education (PMIU) performance. Real time data available online, field officers submit forms digitally in real time. ⁹⁷ Punjab Police Toolkit, a mobile application developed for investigating officers, allowing real time access to ten basic variables of police data from 36 districts. ⁹⁸ Smartphones with preloaded mobile apps given to farmers to increase digital and financial inclusion. ⁹⁹ Punjab Land Record Authority to put property ownership deeds online and to launch a mobile service for the provision of ownership deeds and other revenue-related documents. ¹⁰⁰	7	9
cial Tracking Report	Watch Program, EDOs, DDOs, Dos and other officers inspect healthcare facilities on regular bases using smart phones. The Irrigation			P

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PPP Economic Agenda: Tracking Report

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status			
	Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total S 10
Agriculture and Livestock			5.14	3
Flat rate electricity	Peak tariff rate retained at Rs. 10.50 per unit. Off-peak tariff rate reduced by Rs. 3.50 to Rs. 5.35(federal government notification). 2013-14 flat rate of Rs. 10.50 per unit of tube well.	Flat rate electricity pricing still does not prevail. However, electricity tariffs are notified by the federal government.	10	0

Open & Real time, Punjab Information Technology Board, 2017; <http://www.open.punjab.gov.pk>
 ab Police Could Now Access Data with “Punjab Police Toolkit”, February 22, 2018; <https://www.researchsnipers.com/punjab-police-could-now-access-punjab-police-toolkit/>
 ulture Department, Government of Punjab New Schemes 2017-2018 <http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/newschemes>
 A to put all ownership deeds online, May 31, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1423252/plra-put-ownership-deeds-online/>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status		
		Previous Score: 3.71		
		Current Score: 2.99		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Encourage use of solar tube wells	Rs. 130 million subsidy announced for solar tube wells in the 2014-15 budget, was not disbursed to farmers. This amount was earmarked to subsidize initially 70 out of the announced 250 solar tube wells. CM Finance, in his budget speech for year 2016-17 stated that 250 tube wells powered by solar energy, at a total cost of around Rs. 2bn, will be installed in various districts of Sindh. The solar tube wells will be installed on cost sharing basis. Installation of 250 Solar Tube wells.	Sindh government is working on 11 separate schemes to install solar-powered tube-wells and pumping stations at a cost of Rs7.8bn. Of this, Rs2.6bn has already been utilized. ¹⁰¹	4	6

hiuddin Aazim, Dawn, Slow progress on solar-powered tubewells, November 13, 2017, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1369971>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status		
		Previous Score: 3.71		
		Current Score: 2.99		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Provide farmers with land holding of 25 acres with high quality inputs and training	CM Finance, in his budget speech announced that 350 laser land leveling equipment, installation of drip irrigation on 5,000, 300 laser land leveling, 100 deep ripping-all will be provided on cost sharing basis to farmers. Besides this, 71 community flood shelters and 200 farmer field schools will be established in different districts of Sindh. 3-14 Agriculture Research Rs. 470.441M allocated and Agriculture Mechanization Rs. 2736.039M.	Rs. 500 million to help farmers purchase wheel type tractors; distribution of 555 agricultural implements to farmers; Rs. 100 million for providing small agricultural tiller/paddy reaper and tillage equipment to farmers on subsidized cost; Rs. 100 million for provision of power drilling rigs machines on renting basis.; provide 141 solar pumps; and installation of two controlled atmosphere store and two hot water treatment plants on farmers' fields for preservation and storage. 5 of 28 agricultural development schemes are related to mechanization in agriculture budget 2017-2018. ¹⁰²	2.5	4

cluster Sindh agriculture budget, June 12, 2017; <https://www.dawn.com/news/1338869>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Provide Capital through ZTBL	Sindh secured 13.5% of ZTBL's loan disbursements in 2015, amounting to Rs. 12,742,769 million	Sindh secured 10.06% of ZTBL disbursements in FY 2016-17. The value of loans amounted to Rs. 70.866 bn. ¹⁰³	3.5	5
Soft Loans to purchase inputs	Banks have disbursed around Rs. 26bn loans to the farmers of Sindh in the first half of the current fiscal year.	Budget 2017-18 sets out Rs. 500 million to provide farmers with wheel type tractors. PKR 100 million provision of other mechanized farm equipment on subsidized rates. Rs. 75 million for provision of harvesters at 50% subsidy. ¹⁰⁴	7.5	9

hiuddin Aazim, Dawn, Farm loans rise, but Punjab takes the lion's share, February 12, 2018, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1388637/farm-loans-r-punjab-takes-the-lions-share>

Finance Department, Government of Sindh, Budget Speech 2017-18, <http://fidsindh.gov.pk/site/userfiles/Budget%202017-18/BUDGET%20SPEECH%20IN%20ENGLISH%202017-18.pdf>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status		
		Previous Score: 3.71		
		Current Score: 2.99		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total S 10
Set up clusters/cooperatives of farmers (Facilities and inputs such as tractors,laser levelers, fertilizer, seeds and pesticides will be accessible through collective credit)	Announced scheme to subsidize 3550 tractors, through the Sindh Bank Limited on a first-come, first-served basis. NAB has barred the government from proceeding on with the scheme, in April 2006. Yet, in August, the scheme was re-announced by the government. Rs. 2 billion has been allocated for Sindh Agriculture Growth Project and Rs. 3 billion for Sindh irrigated Agriculture Productivity Enhancement Project (SIAPEP) in budget 2016-2017. Support small farmers by providing them subsidy on purchase of 7,350 wheel type tractors, 1250 agriculture implements, 70 solar pumps and 715 tube wells.	Collective credit facility for farmers not yet available.	3.5	0

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Set up agriculture markets at the tehsil/taluka level	As yet no development	Not implemented	No score	0
Set up Public-Private Silos	Farmers point out the IFC silo project had run into snags and the government is silent on it. Government clarifies that the budget document is silent on it as the project donor-funded. IFC and Govt of Sindh initiated project bidding in Feb 2014. Modern grain storage project, developed with the help of International Finance Corporation; In the first phase, storage capacity of 60,000 tons will be built.	No further development.	5	0
Resource Mobilization			2	4.67

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
No indirect taxes on agriculture	CM Sindh Commission to streamline agri tax as at present not only agriculture income tax, but water tax, drainage tax, local cess and other indirect taxes are also being collected.	Previous status maintained.	2	0
Provide tax breaks to young entrepreneurs.	As yet no development	Status maintained.	No score	6
Increase revenue generation at provincial level		Sindh Board of Revenue registers 47 percent growth. ¹⁰⁵		8
Health			2.3	2.83
Increase coverage of LHWs to 100% rural and urban slums	As yet no development	Full Immunisation Cover in Sindh last recorded at 45%. ¹⁰⁶	No score	4

<https://www.dawn.com/news/1386719>

Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Pakistan Social And Living Standards Measurement Survey (PSLM) 2014-15 Provincial / District, www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files//pslm/publications/PSLM_2014-15_National-Provincial-District_report.pdf

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status		
		Previous Score: 3.71		
		Current Score: 2.99		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total S 10
Provide MNCH services in every basic health unit (BHU) and rural health centre (RHC) in each district	Agreement of Sindh government with an NGO, Integrated Health Services, to run all RHC except those in Thatta and Sujawal. Sindh CM announced in budget 2016-17 speech that RHCs, BHUs, THQs and DHQs would be upgraded. Rs 1.8 billion have been allocated for foreign funded health projects, which include Sindh Nutrition Support Programme worth Rs 1.4 billion and establishment of Child Health Care Institute at Sukkur worth Rs 400 million with Korean assistance. Community Support Meetings to Improve health services at BHU in Jacobabad, Shikarpur, Ghotki and Larkana. Revival of 200 health units and up gradation of 40 rural health centers A special training program for community midwives. A PPHI	Data not available	4.5	3
cial Tracking Report	Midwifery training institute is being established at RHC Bhit Shah for this purpose.			P

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Micro-insurance health units	CM has agreed to contribute Rs. 2 billion to extend PM's National Health Program in six districts of Sindh. This 3-year program will provide health insurance for the poor.	No such units set up so far.	1	0
Develop community-level interventions that encompass EPI routine immunization.	Rota virus vaccine will be included in routine immunization from April 2017 in Sindh. Coverage of routine immunization has improved to 45%, while it stood at 35% as per PDHS 2012- 2013.	The Expanded Program on Immunisation (EPI) and the Sindh Health Department launched an android-based application -Zindagi Mehfooz Digital Immunization Registry in Sindh. It enables automated SMS reminders for parents to remind them of their child's upcoming vaccination, a decision support system for routine and catch-up immunisations and a real-time tracking and monitoring system for vaccinators. ¹⁰⁷	2.5	5

Vaqar Bhatti, The News, Zindagi Mehfooz Digital Immunisation Registry launched in Sindh, October 5, 2017, [/www.thenews.com.pk/print/234574-Zindagi-Mehfooz-Digital-Immunisation-Registry-launched-in-Sindh](http://www.thenews.com.pk/print/234574-Zindagi-Mehfooz-Digital-Immunisation-Registry-launched-in-Sindh)

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Develop stronger public-private partnerships for health care delivery systems	Government to hand over 50 public hospitals to NGOs under public-private partnership.	Operationalization of Children Hospital at North Karachi (Funded through JICA Grant) at a cost of PKR 1.6 billion through performance based public private partnership arrangement. ¹⁰⁸	2.5	5
Bring the population growth rate down to 1.6 per cent	CM Qaim Ali Shah launched Rs. 51.2 billion five-year family planning plan- Costed Implementation Plan.	Growth recorded at 3.37%. ¹⁰⁹	1	0
Education			3.58	3.43

nce Department, Government of Sindh, Budget Speech 2017-18, <http://fdsindh.gov.pk/site/userfiles/Budget%202017-18/BUDGET%20SPEECH%20GET%20SPEECH%20ENGLISH%202017-18.pdf>

an Ali Kundi, The Nation, Population census 2017: Transgender, disabled count might not be thorough: PBS, February 7, 20018, [/nation.com.pk/07-Feb-2018/population-census-2017-transgender-disabled-count-might-not-be-thorough-pbs](http://nation.com.pk/07-Feb-2018/population-census-2017-transgender-disabled-count-might-not-be-thorough-pbs)

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status		
		Previous Score: 3.71		
		Current Score: 2.99		
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Comprehensive review of the curriculum	12 member Advisory Committee formed on textbook reforms The Sindh Textbook Board has decided to dub Abdul Sattar Edhi, Malala Yousufzai and Arfa Abdul Kareem as national heroes in its textbooks for grades I to VI while 'purging' textbooks of references to "non-democratic heroes".	Previous status maintained.	2.5	0
Stress on both mother tongue instruction as well as the appropriate introduction of national and international languages	Teaching Sindhi made compulsory in all private schools. Sindh education department signed an MoU with the education department of Sichuan province of China for their cooperation in teaching Chinese language in schools of Sindh. University of Sindh has launched a month-long Chinese language course.	Previous status maintained.	6.5	5

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Cell within provincial education departments to monitor, coordinate and overview district-wise utilization of the education budget	Making school specific budgets for 43,000 schools to ensure that each school gets its earmarked budget and the head of the school has an oversight over expenditure. Rs.1750 million will be transferred to School Management Committees for community identified school improvement investments. ICT Enabled Education Management Information System (EMIS).	Reform Support Unit of School Education and Literacy Department is assigned this task. Though the information is supposed to be available online, the data is not available. ¹¹⁰	2	4
Improve adult literacy rates	Work on \$800 million Sindh Education City has been initiated. Sindh's literacy rate (10 years and above) which was 56 percent in 2013-14 reached to 60 percent in 2014-15.	Six-month program launched in Karachi, Hyderabad, Tando Allahyar, Jamshoro and Thatta 300 centers to be established for adults aged 16 and above. ¹¹¹	6	7

Reform Support Unit, School education and literacy department, Government of Sindh, <http://rsu-sindh.gov.pk/home/index.php>
 Government introduces education programme for adults, January 5, 2018; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1601029/1-government-introduces-education-for-adults/>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Incentive to girls to enroll in schools	Government of Sindh going to initiate a scheme to distribute Rs. 950 mn among 350,000 girls to enhance girls' enrolment in schools. Rs. 1500 million will be spent on stipends for girl students, Rs.1540 million on provision of free textbooks to students.	Stipends to girls last paid in 2015, by the Reform Support Unit School Education & Literacy Department. ¹¹² No new schedule has been announced post 2015.	3.0	3
Achieve Universal Primary Enrollment by 2018	As yet no specific data available.	Gross enrolment rate at primary level stood at 33% in Sindh, as per annual school census 2015-16. ¹¹³	No score	0
Vocational Training	STEVTA conducting programs as per mandate	Rs. 587.83 million earmarked for manpower and vocational training in provincial budget 2017-18. ¹¹⁴	1.5	5
Labour and Human Resources			4	4

Reform Support Unit, School education and literacy department, Government of Sindh, <http://rsu-sindh.gov.pk/dashboard/dashboard.php>
 School Education Profile 2015-15, School Education Department, Government of Sindh, <http://rsu-sindh.gov.pk/dashboard/dashboard.php>
 Finance Department, Government of Sindh, Budget 2017-18, <http://fdsindh.gov.pk/site/userfiles/Budget%202017-18/VOLUME%20I%202017-UME%20I.pdf>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Set up labour committees at the district level to resolve labour difficulties and disputes	As yet, no development.	No progress made.	No score	0
Construct a labour housing complex in the provincial capital	ABAD housing society announced. KDA's low-cost housing scheme announced Decision to upgrade 100 katchi abadis to township level.	Government catered to a few rural areas, where limited number of people were provided small houses of one or two rooms. No low-cost housing project initiated in any urban city except Khairpur. Work has not begun on the announced projects in Karachi, Hyderabad, Mirpurkhas and Nawabshah. ¹¹⁵	4	3

-led govt fails to initiate low-income housing schemes , November 13, 2017; <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1556650/1-ppp-led-govt-fails-initiate-l-housing-schemes/>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Promote the registration of workers	As yet no development.	Online registration portal for industrial workers opened under Sindh Employees Social Security, to provide maximum facilities and incentives. More than 0.7 million workers registered, around 5 million are still unregistered. ¹¹⁶	No score	8
Issuance of Labour Cards	As yet no development	Industrial workers to be issued Benazir Mazdoor cards through the National Database Registration Authority. Rs 1 billion were disbursed to the workers and their children in the month of May 2017. ¹¹⁷	No score	5
Transport			4	3

ne registration portal for industrial workers inaugurated, August 04, 2017; <https://nation.com.pk/04-Aug-2017/online-registration-portal-for-industrial-workers-inaugurated>

ndustrial workers to get Benazir Mazdoor Card for SESSI facilities, June 15, 2017; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/210634-All-industrial-workers-get-Benazir-Mazdoor-Card-for-SESSI-facilities>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
Improve public bus service	Karachi Mass Transit Program signed with China includes six Bus Rapid Transport corridors, two mass rapid transit corridors and revitalization of Karachi Circular Railway. ADP for transport is pitched at Rs. 3.2 billion in budget 2016-17, with an increase of 6.2%.	Green Line busway of the Karachi Metrobus project to be completed by May 2018. The government still needs to procure buses. ¹¹⁸ ADB grants \$100m for increasing investment in infrastructure and services. The project is co-financed by DFID, providing \$ 4.75 million in assistance and \$ 19.23 million as grant. ¹¹⁹	4	6
Float municipal bonds to raise funds	No development, as of yet.	Not implemented.	No score	0
Housing			5	0

Green Line busway enters final stage, says governor, November 23, 2017; <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/247591-green-line-busway-enters-final-stage-governor>

ADB to provide \$435m for two key projects in KP, Sindh, September 13, 2017; <https://nation.com.pk/13-Sep-2017/adb-to-provide-435m-for-two-key-projects-in-kp-sindh>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter	Implementation Status Previous Score: 3.71 Current Score: 2.99			
Manifesto Target	Baseline (April 2017)	Current Status	Previous Score	Total Score
More than 500,000 houses will be constructed for the homeless poor in urban and rural areas special public-private partnership.	Shaheed Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Towns scheme launched in 8 districts of Sindh province (Karachi, Hyderabad, Jamshoro, Thatta, Dadu, Mirpur Khas, Khairpur and Tandul Muhammad Khan) 100,000 plot applications, 27,500 successful allottees, 23 districts balloting on Dec 9th 2013. 1500 plots have been allotted to poor residents and 12000 more houses for poor to be built.	No further development.	5	0
Construct low-cost housing developments on government land with a 20-year mortgage facility	As yet no development.	Previous status maintained.	No score	0
Provide a tax credit to those low-cost housing schemes that use alternative energy as a primary source of power	As yet no development.	As yet no development.	No score	0

Provincial Tracking Reports 2017-2018
Government Policy Scorecard
Provincial Tracking Report: May 2017 - April 2018

Current report reviews the progress made on the implementation of economic manifesto announced by the parties in power in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh. The purpose is to initiate and inform policy dialogue and public debate on the progress made on the economic agenda of PTI, PML-N and PPP. This tracking directly serves the basic principle of a functioning democracy: accountability.

“A constructive effort to critique government policy...this is just the kind of analysis and debate we need to improve performance of elected government to help serve the people of Pakistan better.” **Asad Umar** (*MNA and Central Senior Vice President Pakistan Tehreek-e- Insaf*)

“PRIME should be appreciated for the report which is the first such effort to hold political parties to their election campaign promises. The pioneering effort has done a fairly good job but had the time frame been at least a year rather than six months. The policy directions need some more time to show their effect.” **Senator Mohsin Leghari**

“If our Governments are truly to serve the public we need to move beyond rhetoric towards an informed and objective discussion of policy and implementation. This can only happen if tools are available to objectively assess government performance against stated goals and objectives. Ali Salman and his team have produced one such tool and deserve much praise and encouragement for this stellar effort. The results will not make happy reading for the Government, but it is hoped that they will be taken in the right spirit, and efforts made to address the shortcomings identified in the scorecard.” **Senator Osman Saifullah Khan** (*Pakistan People’s Party Parliamentarian*)

“This is a great idea and effort and badly needed too. However, the report should also score reform challenges and progress not directly covered in the manifesto especially in the areas of tax administration.” **Sakib Sherani** (*CEO Macro Economic Insights, and former Chief Economic Adviser to Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan*)

“PRIME has successfully initiated an important exercise whereby civil society can track the economic progress and hold political representatives accountable. Equally important is to mention that this research is being conducted by an independent think tank of Pakistan.” **Dr. Vaqar Ahmad** (*Deputy Executive Director, Sustainable Development Policy Institute*)

“The concept of evaluating government performance on the basis of its promises made in its election manifesto is very unique, remarkable and objective. I congratulate PRIME for formulating tool which can trace direction of the government. Pushing government to fulfill its promises made in manifesto is the only way that Pakistan can progress leaps and bounds in a democratic fashion.” **Khawaja Muhammad Usman** (*Former President, Multan Chamber of Commerce & Industry*)