



Provinces Tracking Report

**PTI, PML-N, & PPP-P's First Year in The Government
June 2013-June 2014**

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)



With support from: Center for International Private Enterprise

PRIME is a public policy think tank working for an open, free and prosperous Pakistan by creating and expanding a constituency for protective function of the state and freedom of the market.

This report is the part of a project, 'Economic Agenda: Manifesto Tracking' of Provincial Governments including KPK, Sindh and Punjab. It aims at initiating and informing policy dialogue and public debate on the implementation of the economic agenda promised by various political parties at a provincial level in the general election held in May 2013. The project is being supported by Center for International Private Enterprise (CIPE).

Published by: Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

© PRIME Institute

Recommended Citation: PRIME Institute 2014, Provinces Tracking Report (June 2013-June 2014), Islamabad.

Published in: July 2014

ISBN: 978-969-9824-02-9

For inquiries:

PRIME Institute

Suite No. 714, Silver Oaks Apartments

F-10 Markaz, 44000 Islamabad – Pakistan

Tel: 00 92 (51) 8 31 43 37 - 38 Fax: 00 92 (51) 8 31 43 39

www.primeinstitute.org

Email:info@primeinstitute.org

Provinces Tracking Report

June 2013-June 2014

Authors

Dr. Khalil Ahmad & Ali Salman

Research Support: Wajeeha Riaz

Available at:

www.govpolicyscorecard.com.pk

Provinces Tracking Report

Introduction

Provincial Tracking Report reviews economic performance of three provinces, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh by tracking the progress made on the implementation of economic manifesto announced by the parties in power in these respective provinces i.e. Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) and Pakistan Peoples Party-Parliamentarians (PPP-P). The purpose is to initiate and inform policy dialogue and public debate on the progress made on their electoral promises. This tracking directly serves the basic principle of a functioning democracy: accountability.

Structure

The report picks seven overlapping and common areas in the manifestoes of three parties pertaining to economic development, governance and social development. These common “Areas” include: Agriculture and Livestock, Taxation, Labor and Human Resources, Transport, Housing, E-Governance, and Industrial Development. These areas are then divided into “Components” and “Sub-components”. In most cases, these are based on a simple reproduction of text of the manifesto, and in some cases, some editing has been carried out for the purpose of clarification and structure, but without altering the meaning of the authors of the manifesto. While maximum care has been taken to keep common grounds for the sake of comparison, some differences remain.

In all, the report identifies measurable “targets” and allocates scores on all of them, subject to information availability, on the basis of three distinct parameters: policy and legislative developments, institutional reforms, and implementation. Policy and Legislative Development indicate the presence, or absence, of a supportive legal environment; Institutional Reforms indicate the quality of governance structure and Implementation shows the actual progress made on the policy.

Scoring

The scorecard quantifies the status of implementation on announced goals in the economic agenda of three respective parties. For each of the target area, the score is assigned from 0 to 10 with 10 being the highest. The score is sub-divided in three categories namely Legislative and Policy Developments (2.5), Institutional Reforms (2.5), and Implementation (5).

The team has developed and consistently applies a set of rules to minimize discretion.

1. Averages are computed on non-weighted basis. All “areas” and their constituting components and sub-components carry same weight towards the overall score.
2. Negative scoring is not allowed as it has a disproportionate impact on the overall score of each category.
3. Score of 2 to 2.5 is assigned in “Policy and Legislative Development”, if one already exists or has been developed.
4. Score of 1 to 1.5 is assigned in “Institutional Reforms” if some progress is being shown.
5. Score of 1 to 2 is assigned in “Implementation” if some progress has started. A goal is considered to be achieved, if the related policy is implemented.

6. Score of zero is assigned if progress has been reversed.
7. Score of 'Nil', if no progress is made, though positive policy direction is announced.
8. Score of "As yet no development", if work in the particular area or component is yet to begin. Such components and sub-components are not scored and are discarded while computing average.
9. Same level of score over various editions of scorecard is assigned, if the level of progress is maintained.
10. If a goal is achieved, then in the subsequent editions, it is mentioned as "Target Stands Achieved" and is not counted towards taking averages more than once.
11. Previous report is used as benchmark time period. Subject to information availability, the data included in the report pertain to the time period for which the scorecard is being published.

The structure and methodology of the report has been shared with a select group from the business community, politicians and economists for the purpose of feedback and has undergone several revisions.

The scoring gives a snapshot view on the performance of the government in a particular area as well as an aggregate perspective. These snapshots are more meaningful over time as performance would vary. Thus a new score is issued every quarter. Based on three months progress, a narrative report is prepared.

Interpretation of Scoring

For interpretation of score, following guidelines have been developed.

- Zero: Progress has been reversed.
- Nil: No progress made.
- 1 to 4.9: Policy direction is not clear, institutional bottlenecks exist and no or very little implementation has started.
- 5 to 7.9: Policy direction is supportive, institutional reforms are in progress and some implementation has started.
- 8 to 10: Policy direction is supportive, governance structure is functional and implementation is complete.

By 'complete implementation', one should not necessarily interpret it as having achieved the ultimate goals of the policy, e.g., welfare or industrial productivity, which does not lend to easy assessment.

Data Sources

In order to develop a comprehensive scorecard, the team collects the data from publically available documents and secondary data sources including Quarterly Reports of the State Bank of Pakistan, Federal Budget, Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Trade Policy, Proceedings of Parliament and newspapers. The team tracks five newspapers on daily basis and develops portfolio of news on the basis of classification system of the scorecard. These newspapers become the basis of an interim assessment of the "current status", which is then verified, endorsed or rectified in the light of secondary data available.

The Team

The report and scorecard has been compiled by a team comprising political scientists and economists. The tool development was primarily undertaken by Mr. Ali Salman and the narrative report is developed by Dr. Khalil Ahmad. From PRIME research staff, Ms. Wajeeha Riaz also contributed in compiling this report.

- **Mr. Ali Salman:** Ali is the Executive Director Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME). Ali has worked as a consultant economist for major international development organizations, public sector organizations and non-profits in Pakistan and other countries. He is author of several studies and monographs and regularly writes for Express Tribune. Ali is a visiting fellow at the Institute of Economic Affairs, London; an alumnus of International Academy of Leadership, Germany and Atlas Leadership Academy, USA. He holds master degrees in Economics, Public Policy and Business Administration.
- **Dr. Khalil Ahmad:** Ahmad is a political philosopher by training, and is the founder of the first free market think tank of Pakistan, Alternate Solutions Institute. He is a writer, and his latest books include the path-breaking 'Pakistan Mein Riyasati Ashrafiya Ka Urooj' (The Rise of State Aristocracy in Pakistan) and later, *Siyasi Partian Ya Siyasi Bandobast: Pakistani Siyasat Ke Pech-o-Kham Ka Falsafiyana Muhakma* (Political Parties or Political Arrangements: A Philosophical Analysis of Politics in Pakistan). Khalil holds a PhD in philosophy and has taught graduate and post-graduate classes in various institutions. He is the only member from Pakistan of a prestigious society of political philosophers, economists, and intellectuals, *The Mont-Pelerin Society*.

Disclaimer: *This project is being implemented by Policy Research Institute of Market Economy- PRIME with support from Center for International Private Enterprise. The views expressed in the report are those of the authors and not those of either the PRIME or the CIPE. PRIME or CIPE, or the authors of this report, do not take the responsibility of statistical errors as the report uses the publicly available secondary sources.*

Provinces Tracking Report

In lieu of an introduction

Since the 1st Tracking Report in respect of the Federal Government published in January this year, there is this demand which has constantly been made that the similar tracking reports for the provincial governments are need of the hour.

Since all the provincial governments belong to different political parties, i.e. Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa is ruled by Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, Sindh by Pakistan Peoples Party (Parliamentarian), Balochistan by National Party, and Punjab by Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz), a sense of competition prevails between them.

The same is corroborated by various reports and surveys making headlines in the newspapers and TV channels in recent months, which try to evaluate the performance of each party and their chief minister in their respective provinces.

This fact positively reflects on the wider interest in the opinion circles and may result in future in an enhanced sense of competition between the provincial governments by whichever party they are ruled; and in due time it may influence the voters to make their choices while they go to poll.

This time the Tracking Team has made its first attempt to track the implementation of the economic manifestoes of political parties in their respective provinces.

However, it could not find relevant data as far as the National Party's government in Balochistan is concerned. Out of the two main sources, the newspapers furnish insufficient information and in most cases that information is not verifiable from the government records since the relevant websites of the government of Balochistan are not up to date.

That is why in respect of Balochistan, manifesto tracking report could not be prepared. The next time the team will try to request the relevant Balochistan authorities to provide verified data so that performance of the National Party could be evaluated as per its own manifesto.

The other three tracking reports are being presented hereunder.

On another note, it may be admitted that the process of gleaning the targets from the "economic manifestoes" of the three parties is itself reflective of an important characteristic.

The economic manifestoes of the three parties, as they are being implemented in their respective provinces, are mostly social and welfarist, and far less policy-oriented in terms of their economic agenda.

Here it may be noted that the original intent of the tracking report aims at evaluating the implementation of the economic agenda promised by various political parties in the general elections held in May last year. In case of the federal tracking report, which evaluates the implementation of the economic agenda of the PML-N in the center, same is the case.

However, as far as tracking of the implementation of economic agenda of political parties in their respective provinces is concerned, the case is quite different.

A cursory look at their agenda as pledged in their election manifestos presents a very different picture. Their agendas appear more to be social and welfarist, and less to be economic.

That it may be linked to the issue of provincial autonomy is all the more evident. However, that's not the whole story; there is more to it than the politicization of the issue of provincial autonomy here.

With the passage of the 18th amendment in the constitution, Pakistan has entered a new period vis-à-vis federation versus the provinces debate and the issues relating to governance. This substantially increased provincial autonomy has far-reaching implications in the realm of economic policy; however, it has yet to realize the possibilities it may have for the policy-makers at the provincial level.

It's no place to go into the details of what the 18th amendment has achieved for the provinces such as jurisdiction on the matters of: sales tax on services; duties in respect of succession to property; and, estate duty in respect of property; however, in order to have an idea what has really happened, at least at the constitutional level, if not on the ground, here is a list of those 21 subjects, which has been transferred from the federal to the provincial governments:

1. Agriculture
2. Livestock and Dairy Development
3. Board of Revenue
4. Environment
5. Excise and Taxation
6. Health
7. Home
8. Higher Education
9. School Education
10. Literacy and Non-Formal Basic Education
11. Special Education
12. Information, Culture and Youth Affairs
13. Labor and Human Resources
14. Population Welfare
15. Social Welfare and Women Development
16. Tourism
17. Zakat and Ushr
18. Transport
19. Local Government and Community Development
20. Law and Parliamentary Affairs
21. Auqaf

It needs to be mentioned here that many a thing is happening on the ground also, since there has already been instituted a commission which is overseeing and facilitating the implementation process in respect of the transference of the ministries, departments, etc. from the federal to the provincial governments.

However, two impediments are yet to be overcome and slowing the process: first, the parties ruling in their respective provinces seem shy of probing and asserting the autonomy in their

rightful policy domains. Despite the fact that electorally they are generally confined to their

Provincial governments are afraid of accepting responsibilities and liabilities the autonomy implies and burdens them with.

respective provinces, it reveals their un-satiated appetite for the federal clout. Moreover, provincial governments are afraid of accepting responsibilities and liabilities the autonomy implies and burdens them with.

The second impediment is the center's reluctance to allow the provinces enjoy their newly acquired powers; and, no doubt, there are developments which hint at federal attempts to regain the lost domains.

But this point must be noted that most of the time parties ruling both in center and the provinces are somehow the same. That's the case with PML-N presently; it is ruling both in the center and Punjab. Also, the same was the case with the previous government of the Peoples Party, when it was in power both in the center and Sindh. So, in essence, the "issue of center versus provinces" is political and will stand resolved the day political parties want it so.

It is in this perspective that the provincially ruling parties' prepossession with the social agenda may properly be understood.

So most of the targets all of the 3 parties focus on, are social and / or welfarist.

Here it is necessary to stop a while and try to see how the term Welfare is understood in Pakistan.

As everyone talking and writing in Pakistan finds himself / herself in complete agreement with the concept of a welfare state, no one ever bothers to think what it really amounts to. While advocating the distribution of wealth in the name of equality or in the name of poor, the welfarists actually plead for a redistributive state.

It is this political opinion in favor of welfarism, which overwhelmingly prevails in Pakistan,

It is this political opinion in favor of welfarism, which overwhelmingly prevails in Pakistan, has provided the state and its beneficiaries with justifications of this or that sort to expand the state's powers of taxing and regulating everything in Pakistan.

has provided the state and its beneficiaries with justifications of this or that sort to expand the state's powers of taxing and regulating everything in Pakistan.

Also, it is in this perspective that the social agenda of all the political parties, which is predominantly welfarist, may be understood.

However, lately there has risen a group of Libertarian thinkers in Pakistan who has started contesting the concept of welfarism and the arguments put forward in its favor. The present writer being one of them holds that in an ultimate sense the argument of welfarism, whether it derives its inspiration from equality or poverty or any other such notion, at the end of the day benefit those who live off the state, i.e. the State Aristocracy, as he has demonstrated in his book "Pakistan Mein Riyasati Ashrafiya Ka Urooj" (The Rise of State Aristocracy in Pakistan).

As a matter of fact, the welfare spending, i.e. doling out cash to the needy and / or helping them with welfare goods, which may come in the form of cheaper food items such as Sasta Aata and Sasti Roti, or subsidized goods such as provided at the Utility Stores.

Welfarist spending may be characterized as such spending which mostly results in further temptations as well as more and more dependence on the part of the receivers. Also, such spending needs to be differentiated from the one which is provided to the affected people in cases of natural or social calamities.

Hence, a glance at the targets gleaned from the “economic agenda” of respective political parties helps them classify as follows:

- About 90 % of targets are social
- About 5 % policy-oriented
- About 5 % relating to infrastructure

That combination may vary in case of this or that party’s manifesto, but not in such a great measure that could change the nature of their economic agenda. That the nature of their economic agenda is essentially welfaristic is at the same time surprising and disappointing. They all try to sell welfarist slogans to the freedom-deprived and rights-starved citizens of Pakistan!

All of the 3 parties, i.e. Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, Pakistan Peoples Party Parliamentarians, and Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz) are obsessively given to education and health, which tells of their social preferences instead of economic; though they seek to work varyingly on the following also:

1. Agriculture and Livestock
2. Taxation
3. Labor and Human Resources
4. Transport
5. Housing
6. E-Governance
7. Industrial Development

In the end, it may be added that a Social Agenda envisages only social changes bringing smaller improvements here and there, without effecting any changes in the economic structure of the state and society.

Idealism without any ideals: PTI Socio-Economic Agenda – Tracking Report

The Socio-Economic Agenda of Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf seems to be overwhelmed with education and health. The component of *Education* contains 8 sub-components, more than any other of the 9 components. The *Health* component consists of 5 sub-components, more than the only one component of *Agriculture and Livestock*, which has 6 sub-components.

Doesn't that hint at the influences coming down from the agenda of most of the non-governmental organizations working in Pakistan? Also, that raises a question: how to differentiate between non-governmental organizations on the one hand and the government of Pakistan as a governmental organization on the other?

Other components are: *Taxations* (1 sub-component); *Labor and Human Resources* (3 sub-components); *Transport* (2 sub-components); *Industrial Development* (2 sub-components); *Housing* (1 sub-component); and *E-Governance* (4 sub-components).

The tally of components and sub-components PTI targets contain stands as follows:

Components: 9

Sub-Components: 32

The average score of the PTI's Economic Agenda Tracking Report is 3.82 out of 10.

Let's have a look first at the important targets with some policy implications, and focusing on infrastructural priorities and governance:

In the component, *Agriculture tax from large landowners (15 % agriculture tax would be introduced on land-holdings exceeding 50 acres)*, since the Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa cabinet has proposed 5 to 10 % tax on the agricultural land, a score of 1.5 has been granted.

The component of *Computerizing all the land records* has won a score of 6. It may be appreciated that about 60 % of the land record in the department of revenue has already been computerized.

In the component, *Develop industrial infrastructure and estate with basic facilities in every district*, a score of 2.5 has been awarded. Under this target, some progress has been made with the establishment of a Board of Investment and Trade, and decision to set up Small Industrial Colonies in 3 areas.

Another target is to set up District Finance Commissions (*DFCs*) for every district to ensure equal distribution of funds to *tehsils and villages*, and as yet there is no development took place, it got no score.

Also, as the component of *Electronic mapping of property* has seen no development through the year, it has won no score.

As is evident, out of these 5 important targets, only 3 have been awarded scores the average of which stands at 3.3.

All the other components and sub-components somehow build the case for a social agenda only!

Now let's try to have an overview of the average score the 9 components succeeded in obtaining:

The component of *Agriculture and Livestock* got an average score of 3.42. It has 6 sub-components the scores for which lie in the range of 2 to 6. The sub-component, *Public/Private partnership to build grain silos* has got a score of 2; and the score of 6 has been granted to the sub-component, *Computerize all land record*.

In the component of *Taxation*, the individual and average score is the same, i.e. 1.5, since it has only one sub-component.

The average score for the *Health* component stands at 3.9. Its 5 sub-components have got scores 4, 2.5, 3, 4, and 6. As far as individual sub-components' performance is concerned, it shows steady progress towards providing healthcare facilities.

In *Education*, the average score is 6.25. This component consists of 8 sub-components, and they have won scores in the range of Zero to 9. The Zero score is for the sub-component, *Double the number of girls high schools in 5 years*; and 9 score came to the share of the sub-component, *All postings / transfers of teachers within their districts of choice*.

As far as the sub-component, *Double the number of girls school in 5 years* is concerned, it behooves we stop for a while and try to understand the miraculous.

The Finance Department of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa publishes a White Paper every year which provides a 'non-technical description of the salient features of the budget'. This year's (2014-15) White Paper "portrays a comprehensive depiction of the Government's finances covering all major areas, including current revenue receipts and expenditures, capital receipts and expenditures, development budget, funds management, local government finances, debt management and major public financial management reforms."

Its page 6 is worth reading, where one table reveals that during the year 2013-14, only one high school was established. Is that really the case? The PTI, which was so vocal for declaring Education Emergency, succeeded in building one high school only and that within a whole year! That's idealism without any ideals!

The component of *Labor and Human Resources* got an average score of 3.75. Out of its 3 sub-components, 2 got a score of 5.5 and 2 respectively for *Establishing jawan markaz in every district / tehsil to facilitate local entrepreneurs* and *Improving labor skills, reducing employment, and starting vocational training*. The 3rd, *Improving the plight of the labor*, saw no development through the year.

The PTI, which was so vocal for declaring Education Emergency, succeeded in building one high school only and that within a whole year! That's idealism without any ideals!

In the component of *Transport*, the average score stands at 4. Its one sub-component got a score of 4, and the other was not scored, since with this sub-component, *All public transport will require fitness certificate*, it is already the same case.

The component, *Industrial Development*, got an average score of 2.75. The score for one component is 2.5, while in the next one, *Encouraging provincial infrastructure development schemes and project for exports*, it is 3.

The component of *Housing* is itself its sub-component. It got an average score of 5.5, since 4 big housing schemes were to be launched as per the announcement made in February this year.

In the component of *E-Governance*, which is otherwise must be considered an important development, the score stands at 3 only. Other than itself, its 4 sub-components have as yet seen no development through the year. The score of 3 is based on two developments: that the Microsoft is to help the KPK in instituting E-Government, and online FIR system has been launched in certain police stations.

Excluding the *Taxation*, *Industrial Development*, and *E-Governance* components, for the other 6 components which form the core of PTI's Social Agenda, the average score is 4.52.

The overall score or the implementation status of the PTI in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa stands at 3.82 out of 10.

Giving in to the social temptations – PML-N Socio-Economic Agenda: Tracking Report

As far as "Socio-Economic Agenda" of the PML-N being implemented in the province of Punjab is concerned, it is not much different from the Tehreek-e Insaf's in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa and Peoples Party's in Sindh. It is as much a Social Agenda as is theirs.

In respect of welfarist tendencies, it is similar with both; however, with regard to policy reform it is a bit different from each.

It needs to be mentioned here that unlike the Peoples Party's and Tehreek-e-Insaf's "Economic Agendas", PML-N's "Economic Agenda" for Punjab is heavily social and, thus, welfarist also. It is borne out by the components of *Education* and *Health* both of which together consist of 19 sub-components; though other components and sub-components may also be brought forward in support of the argument.

On the one hand, it shares its rural inclinations with Peoples Party; on the other its urban inclinations are similar with those of Tehreek-e-Insaf's.

Social Agenda of the PML-N as being implemented in Punjab is imbued both with rural and urban inclinations.

It is in the above-mentioned respects that the Social Agenda of the PML-N as being implemented in Punjab is imbued both with rural and urban inclinations. That means it tries to address the social issues facing both rural and

urban populations.

Here is an analysis of the targets based on its Economic Agenda which outlines its similarities with and differences from the PPPP and PTI:

The components which are similar with Peoples Party and Tehreek-e Insaf:

Agriculture and Livestock (7 sub-components); *Taxation* (3 sub-components); *Health* (8 sub-components); *Education* (11 sub-components); *Labor and Human Resources* (3 sub-components); *Transport* (1 sub-component); and, *Housing* (1 sub-component).

It is in the component of *E-Governance* that PML-N's agenda is different from the Peoples Party's and similar with that of the Tehreek-e Insaaf's.

Let's have a look at those components' score which may have some policy implications:

In order of importance, the first such component is *Reducing number of provincial taxes*, which got a score of 2.5 only. The second one is *Reforming tax administration*, to which a score of 3 has been allotted. *Updating of revenue of property records using modern information technology* is the third component for the score stands at 5.5. The last such component is *Establishing of Land Development Corporations with majority equity of the poor and managed by professional managers*, which as yet saw development taking place.

Here is the final tally of the average score the each component of PML-N's "Economic Agenda" has been granted.

In *Agriculture and Livestock* the average score stands at 4. The *Taxation* could find a score of 3 only. In the component of *Health* with 8 sub-components the average score is just 3; whereas in *Education* with 11 sub-components, a reasonable score of 5.38 has been deemed fit. The *Labor and Human Resources* component's average score is a meager 2.25. In the component of *Transport* a score of 5.5 has been awarded. The component of *Housing* too got a good score of 7. The same is the case with the component of *E-Governance*, the average score for which stands at 7.

Excluding the *Taxation* and *E-Governance* components, for other 6 components which form the core of PML-N's Social Agenda, the average score is 4.52.

Thus the overall performance of the PML-N in the province of Punjab in terms of average score stands at 4.60 out of 10.

Staying on the rural inclinations - PPP-P Socio-Economic Agenda: Tracking Report

The Socio-Economic Agenda of Pakistan Peoples Party (Parliamentarians) is surprisingly similar to the one Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaaf espouses.

It consists of the same components such as: *Agriculture and Livestock*; *Taxation*; *Health*; *Education*; *Labor and Human Resources*; *Transport*; and, *Housing*.

The difference between the two parties lies in two components, which Tehreek-e-Insaaf additionally possesses: *Industrial Development*; and, *E-Governance*.

That difference of two components makes hell of a difference between the two agendas: they are elementally poles apart. The Economic Agenda of the Peoples Party exhibits rural inclinations. The most cogent internal evidence available in favor of this observation is not only that it has set no target to promote or facilitate the industrial development and e-governance, but that two of its targets states clearly that: *No indirect taxes on agriculture*; and that *Flat rate electricity for tube wells*. For the 1st the score stands at 2, and for the 2nd at 10 out of 10.

It may be interpreted in a manner that the Sindh province is still predominantly rural and thus it is justified that any party ruling there should focus on rural development and other such factors; however, that's a matter of policy and it may be argued that any party ruling

there requires such an economic agenda which should focus on bringing out the rural

The Sindh province owns the greatest wealth creating hub in the form of Karachi city, why the Peoples Party's economic agenda has mostly ignored it!

Sindhis from poverty and backwardness. Moreover, another counter-argument may bring it to the fore that the Sindh province owns the greatest wealth creating hub in the form of Karachi city, why the Peoples Party's economic agenda has mostly ignored it!

In this regard only two components may be mentioned: there is one component of *Transport*, with two sub-components one of which is: *Improve public bus service*. Another component, *Housing* too promises to construct houses for the urban homeless.

In contrast to the Peoples Party's, Tehreek-e Insaaf's "socio-economic agenda" appears to be somehow driven mostly by urban inclinations. But as far as their social agenda is concerned, both of them are on the same page.

Like Tehreek-e-Insaaf, Peoples Party too seems to be obsessed with education and health, both of which are on top of the local and international NGOs' agenda.

Let's have an analysis of Peoples Party's Socio-Economic Agenda (the targets) which is basically social:

The component of *Education* consists of 7 sub-components followed by *Health* which comprises 6 sub-components. There is only one other such component which has 7 sub-components, and it is *Agriculture and Livestock*. That may hint at the dominance of rural inclinations.

As far as other components are concerned, here is their detail: *Taxation* (1 sub-component); *Labor and Human Resources* (4 sub-components); *Transport* (2 sub-components); and, *Housing* (3 sub-components).

For each component, the tally of average score is as follows:

Agriculture and Livestock: 5.0; *Taxation*: 2; *Health*: 4.0; *Education*: 2.2; *Labor and Human Resources*: 2; *Transport*: 3; and, *Housing*: 5.

And, here is the score for the two important targets with some policy implications:

First is, *No indirect taxes on agriculture*; and the second is, *Flat rate electricity for tube wells*. They got a score of 2 and 10 respectively.

Excluding the *Taxation* component, the average score for the PPP-P's Social Agenda stands at 3.50.

The overall score which highlights the implementation status of Peoples Party's Social Agenda in Sindh is 3.31 out of 10.

Standings of the provincial governments at a glance

As per the 1st Tracking Report the implementation status for each provincial government stands as given below:

Province	Score
Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf - Khyber- Pakhtunkhwa	3.82
Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz) - Punjab	4.60
Pakistan Peoples Party (Parliamentarians) - Sindh	3.31

As no single party enjoys an enviable score, PTI and PPP-P are almost in the same queue with a difference of half a point (0.51); PTI a bit better than PPP-P.

Though PML-N's performance may be judged somehow better than PTI and PPP-P; its difference with PTI's is just 0.78; however, in comparison with PPP-P, it is 1.29 better.

In conclusion, it is hoped that by the time next Tracking Report is issued, which is to be prepared in December this year, the overall performance of each party in its respective province, as per its own "Economic Agenda", would have been improved effectively! Presently it may be observed that each of them has got a long way to go!

Here is a comparative table detailing the average score for each component:

S. No.	Targets	Total Score (out of 10)		
		KPK	Punjab	Sindh
1.	Agriculture and Livestock	3.42	4.13	5
2.	Taxation/Resource Mobilization	1.5	2.75	2
3.	Health	4.2	3	4
4.	Education	6.25	5.17	2.2
5.	Labour and Human Resources	3.75	2.25	2
6.	Housing	5.5	7	5
7.	Transport	4	5.5	3
8.	E-Governance	3	7	-
9.	Industrial Development	2.75	-	-
Total Score (Average)		3.82	4.60	3.31

Khalil Ahmad

July 11, 2014

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PTI Economic Agenda: Tracking Report (KPK)

Average Score= 3.82 (10)

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
1.	Agriculture and Livestock					3.42
1.1	Computerize all land record	60 percent of the revenue department records has been computerized ¹ Launch of Computerized Land Record from July 2014. ²	1.5	1.5	3	6
1.2	Ensure access to credit for farmers	Rs. 200 million allocated through Cooperative Bank.	2	0.5	0	2.5
1.3	Ensure access to inputs for farmers	Rs15m allocated in budget for building growing capacity of small farmers. Rs150m for 100 solar-powered pumps in the province announced in budget. ³	1.5	1	1.5	4
1.4	Connect provincial agriculture dept with universities	Graduate courses have been offered ⁴ .	2	1	0	3

¹ Truth Tracker, All land and revenue records will be digitized – PTI, November 21st 2013. <http://www.truthtracker.pk/all-land-and-revenue-record-will-be-computerized-pti/>

² Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

³ Express Tribune, Azm-e nau Budget: K-P presents Rs404.80b budget, June 14th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/721758/over-rs400b-budget-to-be-presented-in-k-p-assembly-today/>

⁴ Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Planning and Development Department, White Paper 2014-15.

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
1.5	Public/Private partnership to establish grain silos	Allocations made for feasibility study ⁵ .	2	0	0	2
1.6	Initiate community livestock programs for dairy and meat products at village level	Treatment and vaccinations provided to 30 lakh animals. Loans on lenient terms to promote livestock farming allocated. ⁶	1.5	0	1.5	3
2.	Taxation					1.5
2.1	Agriculture tax from large landowners (15 percent agriculture tax would be introduced on land holding exceeding 50 acres)	5 to 10 % income tax on agricultural land proposed by KPK Cabinet. ⁷	1.5	0	0	1.5
3.	Health					4.20
3.1	Free primary healthcare system for poor	Opening free of cost emergency in hospitals to the citizens, setting up of Insulin bank and launching of free of cost dialysis. ⁸	1	1	2	4
3.2	Modernization of DHQs	As yet no development. 3 new DHQs completed. ⁹	2	1	1	4
3.3	Create jobs in healthcare (doctors, nurses, paramedics)	600 doctors inducted to fulfill vacant posts. ¹⁰	0	1	2	3
3.4	Provide clean drinking water and	Insaf Sehat Kits door-to- include soap, water-	0.5	1	2.5	4

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

⁷ Dunya News, KPK cabinet approves 2014-15 budget proposals, June 14th 2014. <http://dunyanews.tv/index.php/en/Pakistan/225442-KPK-cabinet-approves-201415-budget-proposals>

⁸ The News, KP govt to bridge rich-poor gap: Khattak, May 19th 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-2-250967-KP-govt-to-bridge-rich-poor-gap-Khattak>

⁹ Finance Department KPK, White Paper. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

¹⁰ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	sanitation facilities	cleaning tablets, and containers for drinking water launched in Feb 2014 in Peshawar. ¹¹ During 2013-14, 13 schemes for clean drinking water completed. ¹²				
3.5	Healthcare awareness campaign and immunization drive	Sehat ka Insaf Campaign Launched in Jan 2014 to immunize 8lakh children in Peshawar during 3 months. ¹³ Confirmed Polio Cases 9/67 as of 22 nd May 2014. ¹⁴ Out of 1.4 m children 1.3m were immunized in 4 districts. ¹⁵	1	1	4	6
4.	Education					6.25
4.1	One education system	Class-based education system had been replaced with unified English medium education all over the province. ¹⁶	1	1	3	5
4.2	Urdu and one local language as media of instruction till 8 th grade.	As yet no development.				Not scored.
4.3	English as medium of instruction in universities	As yet no development.				Not scored.

¹¹ Express Tribune, Sehat ka Insaf: 'Invest in children for a better Pakistan tomorrow', January 26, 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/663441/sehat-ka-insaf-invest-in-children-for-a-better-pakistan-tomorrow/>

¹² Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

¹³ PTI, Imran Khan launches "Healthcare Justice" campaign, January 25th 2014. <http://www.insaf.pk/chapters/khyber-pakhtoonkhwa/peshawar/item/1787613-imran-khan-launches-%E2%80%9Ccricket-talent-hunt-program%E2%80%9D-%E2%80%9Chealthcare-justice%E2%80%9D-campaign>

¹⁴ Expanded Program on Immunization Confirm Polio Cases 2014 By Province/ Region/ Agency. http://www.epikp.gov.pk/polio_updates.php

¹⁵ Frontier Post, 1.3 Million Children immunized in Sehat Ka Insaf Program: Shahram, April 7th 2014. <http://thefrontierpost.com/article/87405/1.3-Million-Children-immunized-in-Sehat-Ka-Insaf-Program-Shahram/>

¹⁶ Dawn, Students get books free at launch of enrolment drive, April 9th 2014. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1098647>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
4.4	All hiring of teachers within their districts of choice	Promulgation of the rationalization policy for schools in 5 districts including Peshawar, Charsadda, Nowshera, Mardan and Swabi. Later extended throughout the province. Under the policy, teachers in all these districts would be transferred and posted in schools of their nearest places of choice. Later there would be complete ban on transfers. ¹⁷	2.5	2.5	4	9
4.5	Need based voucher system to fund students where government schools are not enough	Cabinet approved the Introduction of Education Voucher Scheme with an allocation of Rs.500 million. ¹⁸	2.5	1.5	0	4
4.6	Double the number of girls high schools in 5 years	In 2013-14, one new high school was built, and there is no provision of a new high school in 2014-15, whereas there is a provision of upgradation of 10-12 girls middle schools to high schools, which is significantly less than 2013-14.	0	0	0	0
4.7	Incentives for girls education (uniforms, free books, meals, scholarships & transportation)	An amount of Rs.100 million was approved as stipend @ Rs.200/- per month for girl students enrolled in primary schools of seven selected districts of Hangu, Peshawar, Bannu, Lakki, D.I.Khan, Shangla and Nowshera ¹⁹	2	2	3	7

¹⁷ Pakistan Tehreek-e Insaf, CM KP Pervaiz Khattak announces rationalization policy for schools (April 24, 2014), <http://www.insaf.pk/component/k2/item/1787956-cm-kp-pervaiz-khattak-announces-rationalization-policy-for-schools-april-24-2014>

¹⁸ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, Minister information KP briefing about cabinet meeting (Nov 5, 2013), [http://www.insaf.pk/news/national-news/item/17538-Minister%20information%20KP%20briefing%20about%20cabinet%20meeting%20\(Nov%205,%202013\)](http://www.insaf.pk/news/national-news/item/17538-Minister%20information%20KP%20briefing%20about%20cabinet%20meeting%20(Nov%205,%202013))

¹⁹ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, Minister information KP briefing about cabinet meeting (Nov 5, 2013), [http://www.insaf.pk/news/national-news/item/17538-Minister%20information%20KP%20briefing%20about%20cabinet%20meeting%20\(Nov%205,%202013\)](http://www.insaf.pk/news/national-news/item/17538-Minister%20information%20KP%20briefing%20about%20cabinet%20meeting%20(Nov%205,%202013))

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		7 lakh children enrolled in schools during 2013-14. ²⁰ Free books distributed among 54lakh students. ²¹				
4.8	Improve adult literacy 15-30 age group	As yet no development. (60% adult literacy) ²²				Not scored.
5.	Labour and Human Resources					3.75
5.1	To establish Jawan Markaz in every district/tehsil to facilitate local entrepreneurs	Loans worth Rs2.1 b distributed amongst unemployed youth under self-employment scheme. ²³ Scholarship worth Rs2000 for unemployed graduate students. ²⁴	1.5	1.5	2.5	5.5
5.2	To improve labour skills and reduce unemployment, starting vocational training programs (To increase number of youth beneficiaries from 500,000 to 2 million per annum)	Appointed 1 st chairperson of KPK Technical and Education and Vocational Training Agency (TEVTA) ²⁵ Technical University and Air University at Azakhel will be set up. ²⁶	1.5	0.5	0	2

²⁰ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

²¹ Ibid

²² Finance Department KPK, White Paper <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

²³ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

²⁴ Ibid

²⁵ Pakistan Today, KPK forms TEVTA with foreign collaboration, April 27th 2014. <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2014/04/27/national/kpk-forms-tevta-with-foreign-collaboration/>

²⁶ Pakistan Tehreek-e- Insaf, Insaf Youth Wing meets CM KP (May 31, 2014), <http://www.insaf.pk/component/k2/item/1788222-insaf-youth-wing-meets-cm-kp-may-31-2014>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
5.3	To improve the plight of labour (prevent unemployment, occupational safety, working hours) and set up Tripartite board consisting of the employer, labour and inspectors for each sector.	As yet no development.				Not scored.
6.	Transport					4
6.1	All major cities will have mass transport systems	5 corridors for Metro Bus and One for rail service have been selection work start from September 2014 from Chamkani to Hayatabad ^{27 28} KPK govt approved Rs10b for Peshawar mass transit ²⁹	2	2	0	4
7.	Industrial Development					2.75
7.1	Develop industrial infrastructure & estate with basic facilities in every district	Board of Investment and Trade established in KPK. Small Industrial Colonies will be established in 3 areas. ³⁰	1.5	1	0	2.5
7.2	Encourage provincial infrastructure development	Establishment of small industrial estate Abbottabad-II. Establishment of Mineral Based Industrial Estate at Chitral. ³¹	2	0	1	3

²⁷ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, CM KP Inaugurates Police Assistance Lines for Citizens at Peshawar (May 13, 2014), <http://www.insaf.pk/component/k2/item/1788097-cm-kp-inaugurates-police-assistance-lines-for-citizens-at-peshawar-may-13-2014>

²⁸ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, CM KP Pervaiz Khattak chairs high level on Rapid Mass Transit System for Peshawar, decisions taken (May 12, 2014), <http://www.insaf.pk/component/k2/item/1788076-cm-kp-pervaiz-khattak-chairs-high-level-on-rapid-mass-transit-system-for-peshawar-decisions-taken-may-12-2014>

²⁹ Business Recorder, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa government approves Rs 10 billion Peshawar mass transit project, June 12th 2014. <http://www.brecorder.com/business-a-economy/189/1191660/>

³⁰ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	schemes and projects for exports					
8.	Housing					5.5
8.1	Provide incentives to meet massive backlog of housing	Mega Education City, M-1, Nowshehra, Mega Sports City Peshawar, New City Abbottabad and New City and Tourism Resort Booni, Chitral. ³²	2	1.5	2	5.5
9.	E-Governance					3
9.1	E-governance	Microsoft to help KPK e-government ³³ Online FIR Registration ³⁴	1.5	1	0.5	3
9.2	A DFC for every district to ensure equal distribution of funds to Tehsils and villages	As yet no development				Not scored.
9.3	Electronic Mapping of Property	As yet no development				Not scored.
9.4	Introduce socio-economic measurement structure at Union Council Level	As yet no development				Not scored.
9.5	GPRS based system to match availability and need for teachers	As yet no development				Not scored.

³¹ Finance Department KPK, White Paper. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

³² The News, KP government to launch four mega housing schemes, February 23rd 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-7-234459-KP-government-to-launch-four-mega-housing-schemes>

³³ Saach.Tv, PTI KPK Government 90 Days Report, September 9th 2013. <http://www.saach.tv/2013/09/09/pti-kpk-government-90-days-report/>

³⁴ KP Police, Online FIR. <http://kppolice.gov.pk/css/firadd.php>

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PML-N Economic Agenda: Tracking Report (Punjab)

Average Score= 4.60 (10)

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
1.	Agriculture and Livestock					4.13
1.1	Ensure availability of credit to small farmers	As yet, no specific data available.				Not scored.
1.2	Revamp all research on agriculture sector and intensify research to bring down cost of production for agriculture sector which has gone up due to high petroleum prices	Work on construction of new agricultural offices complex at Murree Road, and Soil Construction, Agricultural Engineering Workshops and Offices at Adyala Road, Rawalpindi started on July 1 st 2013 (3 years project). Strengthening of research facilities at Fodder Research Sub-station, AARI, Faisalabad for the development of Silage type corn varieties ³⁵ Strengthening of Food Technology Section & PHRC, Ayub Agricultural Research Institute, Faisalabad. ³⁶	2	1	3	6

³⁵ Government of Punjab, Planning and Development Department, 2014-15

³⁶ Ibid

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		Development of Genetic Engineering Facilities at Agri. Biotechnology Res. Institute, AARI, Faisalabad ³⁷ Provincial Pesticide Reference Laboratory K.S.K. Sheikhpura ³⁸				
1.3	Improve arrangements for storage and subsidized distribution to ensure relative price stability throughout the year including post-harvest storage and marketing systems	Punjab Grain Storage Project, a public private partnership in pipeline ³⁹	2	0	0	2
1.4	Establishment of Land Development Corporations with majority equity of the poor and managed by professional managers	As yet no development.				Not scored.
1.5	Extension of irrigation facilities to additional areas including major program of aquifer recharge in arid and semiarid areas of Cholistan	As yet no development.				Not scored.
1.6	Update of revenue and property	According to Senior Member of Punjab Board of	2	1.5	2	5.5

³⁷ Ibid

³⁸ Ibid

³⁹ Public Private Partnership Cell, Pipeline Projects. <http://ppp.punjab.gov.pk/projects>

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	records using modern Information Technology	Revenue, the Computerisation of land record to be completed by December 2014. ⁴⁰				
1.7	Modernize agriculture education and curriculum of agriculture universities.	Training on going	1	1	1	3
2.	Taxation/Resource Mobilization					2.75
2.1	Issue Provincial Infrastructure bonds or project specific bonds in order to develop secondary centers of Industrial activities.	As yet no development.				Not scored.
2.2	Reform of tax administration at the provincial level	The International Finance Corporation & Punjab government signed agreement to reform the province's sales tax system. ⁴¹	2	1	0	3
2.3	Reduce Number of Provincial taxes	Abolished bed tax on hotels; Imposed luxury tax on houses of 2 Kanals.	1	1	0.5	2.5
3.	Health					3
3.1	Health Insurance scheme for the most vulnerable and poor segment to avail basic healthcare in a government hospital or by a	To be launched soon in Hafizabad, Chakwal, Rajanpur, and Layyah districts; will be extended to the whole province under a phased programme. ⁴²	1.5	0	0	1.5

⁴⁰ Office of the Chief Minister Punjab, Punjab Cabinet gives approval to Multan, Faisalabad and Rawalpindi-Islamabad Metro bus, February 3rd 2014.

<http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/?q=node/2847>

⁴¹ Dawn, IFC to advise Punjab on tax reforms, August 1st 2013. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1033338>

⁴² The Office of the Chief Minister Punjab, Huge funds being spent on provision of modern health facilities to masses: Cm, February 23rd 2014.

<http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/?q=node/2842>

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	general practitioner at concessional rates					
3.2	Existing Basic Health Units will be strengthened and where possible leased to private medical practitioners in public-private partnership model	As yet no development.				Not scored.
3.3	Develop District Healthcare Authority (DHA) at each district level	Punjab Government has decided to form District Health Authorities in 36 districts ⁴³	1.5	0	0	1.5
3.4	At least 1,000 mobile health units will be launched to provide basic health facilities in remote areas and isolated localities	Provision for approval of 10 Mobile Health Units. ⁴⁴	1	0	0	1
3.5	Within 5 years, 100% vaccination of children	2 new polio cases confirmed in Punjab in June. ⁴⁵ As of May 22 nd 0/67 cases ⁴⁶ As yet, no specific data available on the percent vaccination of children.				Not scored.
3.6	Within 5 years 50% reduction in maternal	As yet, no specific data available.				Not scored.

⁴³ Pakistan Today, Punjab govt decides to form District Health Authorities, August 25th 2013. <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2013/08/25/city/lahore/punjab-govt-decides-to-form-district-health-authorities/>

⁴⁴ Daily Time, CM okays Daanish school in Fort Munro, 10 mobile units for south Punjab, June 8th 2014. <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/punjab/08-Jun-2014/cm-okays-daanish-school-in-fort-munro-10-mobile-units-for-south-punjab>

⁴⁵ The Nation, Two new polio cases surface in Punjab, June 9th 2014. <http://www.nation.com.pk/lahore/09-Jun-2014/two-new-polio-cases-surface-in-punjab>

⁴⁶ WHO, Point in Time Comparison of polio cases by province/region 2013 & 2014, www.whopak.org

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	and infant mortality					
3.7	Provision of clean drinking water and safe sewerage disposal will be given high priority	Punjab Saaf Pani Company, work to restart, total estimated cost of the project was Rs12 billion under which 1,479 filtration plants were to be installed in 33 districts of Punjab ⁴⁷ Formation of Waste management companies in 6 cities ⁴⁸	2	2	2.5	6.5
3.8	Private sector will be encouraged to expand pharmaceutical manufacturing and setup manufacturing of diagnostic equipment	Fourth drug testing laboratory and research centre in the country at Sundar industrial estate, costing Rs100 million, where 166 pharmaceutical units have been sanctioned. ⁴⁹	2	2	0.5	4.5
4.	Education					5.17
4.1	Initiate legislation to provide a road map for achieving 100% enrollment up to the middle level and 80% universal literacy and strive to meet the target	Enrollment Drive 2014 launched in April. ⁵⁰ target of admission of 40 lakh students in schools during the campaign. ⁵¹ Alif Ailaan and SDPI's District Education Rankings 2014 revealed that Punjab was ahead of other provinces with 14 Punjab districts in the top 20. ⁵²	2	1	1	4

⁴⁷ Dawn, Saaf Pani project 'back to square one', May 26th 2014. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1108602/saaf-pani-project-back-to-square-one>

⁴⁸ Lahore Waste Management Company, Formation of Waste management companies in 6 cities. http://www.lwmc.com.pk/sixcitiesconsultancy.php?cms_id=38

⁴⁹ The News, Fourth drug testing centre to begin soon, May 28th 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-3-252538-Fourth-drug-testing-centre-to-begin-soon>

⁵⁰ The Office of the Chief Minister Punjab, CM formally inaugurates enrollment campaign, <http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/?q=node/2803>

⁵¹ The Office of the Chief Minister Punjab, Enrollment of all children in schools to be ensured by. <http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/?q=node/2809>

⁵² Pakistan Today, Punjab ahead of all provinces but education still in bleak state, May 22nd 2014. <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2014/05/22/national/punjab-ahead-of-all-provinces-but-education-still-in-bleak-state/>

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	of 'Education For All (EFA)' and 'Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)'					
4.2	To reduce drop-out rate at primary level missing facilities in schools to be provided	Rs8bn to be spent on uplift of 15,000 schools. ⁵³	2	2	2	6
4.3	Provide special incentives like free books to girls	Special incentives included in Education Affairs Services- increased over last year by 4%.	1.5	1	1	3.5
4.4	Education Endowment Funds shall be set up in the province to award merit scholarships to poor and needy students for higher education.	Education Endowment Fund already established and it awarded 16,881scholarships worth Rs 962 million awarded to students in Punjab during 2013-14. ⁵⁴	2	2	3	7
4.5	Computer labs shall be established in all the government high schools in the first phase.	4280 Labs have been set up in schools in Punjab. ⁵⁵	2	2	2	6
4.6	All merit students in public universities shall be provided laptops to link them with the digital revolution	200,000 laptops given during the current year. ⁵⁶	2	2	3	7
4.7	Distance learning programs will	Punjab Information Technology Board has	2	2	3	7

⁵³ Express Tribune, Education for all Punjab govt to spend Rs8bn on 15000 schools, June 20th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/728307/education-for-all-punjab-govt-to-spend-rs8-billion-on-15000-schools/>

⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Business Recorder, Punjab government establishes 4,280 IT labs in schools, January 10th 2014. <http://www.brecorder.com/general-news/172/1142298/>

⁵⁶ The Office of Chief Minister Punjab, One lakh More Students to be Given. <http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/?q=node/2826>

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	be given priority to expand in public and private sector educational institutions	developed videos, animations, simulations and assessments to enhance learning values of textbooks grade 6 th -10 th Science. ⁵⁷				
4.8	Madrassas will be provided financial assistance and other incentives to bring their syllabus and standards in conformity with the mainstream education.	As yet no development.				Not scored.
4.9	Promotion of teachers will be linked with their qualifications and performance.	Promotion Policy 2014 links promotion with qualification, not with performance as yet. ⁵⁸	1	0	1	2
4.10	To improve administration of education sector, establish autonomous District Education Authorities (DEAs)	As yet no development.				Not scored.
4.11	Set up autonomous monitoring and evaluations authorities and use of modern technology to check the performance of education sector.	Monitoring and Evaluation Department has been set up for surveillance of all projects. ⁵⁹	2	1	1	4
5.	Labour and Human Resources					2.25

⁵⁷ Punjab Information Technology Board January 1st 2014. http://elearn.punjab.gov.pk/home/about_us/

⁵⁸ Promotion Policy 2014. Promotion <http://itest.pk/2014/05/punjab-education-department-introduced-new-promotion-policy-for-teachers/educaion-department-promotion-policy/>

⁵⁹ Ibid.

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
5.1	Youth training and skill development program shall be initiated to create one million positions for apprenticeship in trade and industry	According to CM Punjab 40,000 youths had been imparted training under a skills development program. ⁶⁰ 4 Projects for 765 young people in Punjab approved by NAVTEC. ⁶¹	1.5	0.5	1	3
5.2	Vocational and technical education will be promoted, especially in rural areas.	Punjab Vocational Training Council (PVTC) has introduced a new programme for rural landless families to produce certified Halal butchers to meet the growing domestic and international demand. ⁶²	1	0	0.5	1.5
5.3	Establish Tripartite Provincial Productivity Council.	As yet no development.				Not scored.
6.	Transport					5.5
6.1	Build mass transit facilities in all major cities	Metro bus project already in progress in Rawalpindi, Multan and Faisalabad. ⁶³⁻⁶⁴ Agreement signed to set up a metro train. ⁶⁵	2	1	2.5	5.5
7.	Housing					7

⁶⁰ Express Tribune, Livestock development: Bahawalpur to have modern veterinary university, says CM, May 17th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/709416/livestock-development-bahawalpur-to-have-modern-veterinary-university-says-cm/>

⁶¹ Pak Observer, 22 projects worth Rs. 257.3m approved for youth training: NAVTEC, May 20th 2014. <http://pakobserver.net/detailnews.asp?id=241989>

⁶² The News, Training programme for Halal butchers, May 24th 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-3-251815-Training-programme-for-Halal-butchers>

⁶³ Pak Observer, Shahbaz okays Rs 30b Multan Metro Bus Project, June 6th 2014. <http://pakobserver.net/detailnews.asp?id=243652>

⁶⁴ Office of the Chief Minister Punjab, Punjab Cabinet gives approval to Multan, Faisalabad and Rawalpindi-Islamabad Metro bus, February 3rd 2014. <http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/?q=node/2847>

⁶⁵ Express Tribune, Good news on track: Lahore to get Pakistan's first metro train, May 23rd 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/711864/good-news-on-track-lahore-to-get-pakistans-first-metro-train/>

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
7.1	1,000 clusters of 500 houses each for lower income families will be developed on a public private partnership mode.	The Ashiana Housing Scheme already in progress in upcoming projects in Lahore, Faisalabad, Rawalpindi, Sargodha and Gujranwala. ⁶⁶ Faisalabad and Sahiwal ready to be allotted ⁶⁷ . Upcoming in Chiniot, Kasur and Bahawalpur. ⁶⁸	2.5	2	2.5	7
8.	E-Governance					7
8.1	Create and implement performance monitoring dashboards for all major provincial projects	Pak Turk collaboration in e-governance. ⁶⁹ E-governance projects by use of smart technology under way in various departments such as: Health, Livestock and Dairy, Irrigation, Agriculture, Lahore Waste Management Company, and Police. PITB is working on numerous Department of Health, Livestock and Dairy, Agriculture and Punjab Police are few instances. (Health Watch Program, EDOs, DDOs, DOs and other officers inspect healthcare facilities on regular bases using smart phones. The Irrigation department is also using smart phone based applications to report and monitor daily activities like their daily visits and water level discharge. Punjab Police in the provincial capital is successfully utilising smart phone applications to geo-tag location of FIR and analyze crime hot	2.5	2	2.5	7

⁶⁶ Punjab Land Development Company, Projects. <http://www.pldc.gop.pk/projects.html>

⁶⁷ Pak Real Estate. <http://www.pakrealestatetimes.com/showthread.php?tid=15902>

⁶⁸ Punjab Land Development Company, Projects. <http://www.pldc.gop.pk/projects.html>

⁶⁹ The News, Turkey to help promote e-governance in Punjab, June 3rd 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-5-253702-Turkey-to-help-promote-e-governance-in->

PML-N Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		spots; the Lahore Waste Management Company (LWMC) has been successfully using smart phone applications to report its cleaning activities. ⁷⁰				

⁷⁰ Pakistan Today, Umar Saif's hard work for better e-governance paying off, May 20th 2014. <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2014/05/20/city/lahore/umar-saifs-hard-work-for-better-e-governance-paying-off/>

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PPPP Economic Agenda: Tracking Report (Sindh)

Average Score= 3.31 (10)

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
1.	Agriculture and Livestock					5
1.1	Flat rate electricity for tube wells	2013-14 flat rate of Rs. 10.50 per unit of tube well ⁷¹	2.5	2.5	5	10
1.2	Encourage use of solar tube wells	Installation of 250 Solar Tube wells ⁷²	1	1	2	4
1.3	Provide farmers with land holding of 25 acres with high quality inputs and training under Peoples Agriculture Program	2013-14 Agriculture Research Rs. 470.441M Allocated and Agriculture Mechanization Rs2736.039M. ⁷³	0.5	1	1	2.5
1.4	Provide Capital to farmers through ZTBL	As yet, no specific data available.				Not scored.
1.5	To purchase inputs, issue soft loans for farmers	As yet, no specific data available.				Not scored.
1.6	Set up clusters/cooperatives of	Support small farmers by providing them subsidy	0.5	1	2	3.5

⁷¹ Ibid.

⁷² Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

⁷³ Agriculture, Supply and Prices Department Government of Sindh, Summary Progress Report 2013-14. <http://www.sindhagri.gov.pk/develop.html>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	farmers (Facilities and inputs such as tractors, laser levelers, fertilizer, seeds and pesticides will be accessible through collective credit)	on purchase of 7,350 wheel type tractors, 1250 agriculture implements, 70 solar pumps & 715 tube wells ⁷⁴				
1.7	Set up Public-Private Silos	IFC and Govt of Sindh initiated project bidding in Feb 2014. ^{75 76} Modern grain storage project, developed with the help of International Finance Corporation; In the first phase, storage capacity of 60,000 tons will be built. ⁷⁷	2	1.5	1.5	5
2.	Taxation					2
2.1	No indirect taxes on agriculture	CM Sindh Commission to streamline agri tax as at present not only agriculture income tax, but water tax, drainage tax, local cess and other indirect taxes are also being collected. ⁷⁸	2	0	0	2
3.	Health					4
3.1	Increase coverage of LHWS to 100% rural and urban slums	As yet no development.				Not scored.

⁷⁴ Ibid

⁷⁵ Business Recorder, Grain storage re-tendering: Sindh government to conduct pre-qualifications afresh, January 23rd 2014. <http://www.brecorder.com/agriculture-allied/183:pakistan/1146375:grain-storage-re-tendering-sindh-government-to-conduct-pre-qualifications-afresh/?date=2014-01-23>

⁷⁶ Public Private Partnership Unit, Food Storage Silos. <http://www.pppunitsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php?pid=31>

⁷⁷ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

⁷⁸ Express Tribune, Moving forward: Sindh forms committee to streamline agriculture tax, May 27th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/713517/moving-forward-sindh-forms-committee-to-streamline-agriculture-tax/>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
3.2	Provide MNCH services in every basic health unit (BHU) and rural health centre (RHC) in each district	Community Support Meetings to Improve health services at BHU in Jacobabad, Shikarpur, Ghotki and Larkana. ⁷⁹ Revival of 200 health units and up gradation of 40 rural health centers ⁸⁰ A special training program for community midwives. A PPHI Midwifery training institute is being established at RHC Bhit Shah for this purpose. ⁸¹	1	1	2.5	4.5
3.3	Micro-insurance health units	As yet, no specific data available.				Not scored.
3.4	Provide Clean Drinking Water	500 water HUBS provided throughout the province 79 plants in urban and rural areas ⁸² Installing 750 more RO plants in Tharparker & for providing solar energy for 1050 Reverse Osmosis (R.O) plants installed in different parts of Sindh ⁸³	1.5	1	2	4.5
3.5	Commit to polio eradication as a national priority, integrating it with routine	13.33m children to be immunized against measles in Sindh ⁸⁴ Confirmed Polio Cases till May 22 nd 2014 is 5/67 according to WHO ⁸⁵	1.5	1	2	4.5

⁷⁹ Peoples Primary Health Initiative, Community Support Meetings. <http://pphisindh.org/pphinew/wordpress/2013/05/community-support-meetings/>

⁸⁰ Dunya, Health Facilities in Sindh, June 2nd 2014.

⁸¹ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

⁸² Dunya, Clean Drinking Water for each and every individual in Sindh, June 2nd 2014.

⁸³ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

⁸⁴ The News, 13.33mn children to be immunized against measles in Sindh, May 19th 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/article-148196-1333mn-children-to-be-immunized-against-measles-in-Sindh>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	immunization					
3.6	Develop stronger public–private partnerships for health care delivery systems	Request for Proposal Public Private Partnership for few of its underperforming Public Health Facilities/ Health Services with the objective of improving service delivery through 5-10 years management contracts February 2014. ⁸⁶	1	0.5	1	2.5
4.	Education					2.2
4.1	Comprehensive review of the curriculum	12 Member Advisory Committee formed on textbook reforms ⁸⁷ The Sindh Textbook Board has decided to dub Abdul Sattar Edhi, Malala Yousufzai and Arfa Abdul Kareem as national heroes in its textbooks for grades I to VI while ‘purging’ textbooks of references to “non-democratic heroes”. ⁸⁸	1	1	0.5	2.5
4.2	Stress on both mother tongue instruction as well as appropriate introduction of national and international languages	Sindh Minister for Education has given 1 month deadline in August 2013 to all private schools in the province to duly observe the compulsory education rule of teaching Sindhi language to the students ⁸⁹	1	1	0	2

⁸⁵ World Health Organization, Weekly AFP Surveillance Update Pakistan, May 24th 2014. <http://www.who.int/countries/pak/en/>

⁸⁶ Government of Sindh Initiative of Improving Healthcare: Public Private Partnership for Select Public Health Facilities Services. <http://www.timespacetechnologies.com/portal/Portals/0/data/rfp.pdf>

⁸⁷ Dawn, 12-member body set up for textbook reforms in Sindh, October 15th 2013. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1049764>

⁸⁸ Express Tribune, Education gets politicised as textbooks and heroes are changed, March 25th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/686885/education-gets-politicised-as-textbooks-and-heroes-are-changed/>

⁸⁹ The News, Private schools given one month to start teaching Sindhi language, August 24th 2013. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-4-197731-Private-schools-given-one-month-to-start-teaching-Sindhi-language>

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
4.3	Set Up a Cell within provincial education department to monitor, coordinate and overview district-wise utilization of the education budget	Making school specific budgets for 43,000 schools to ensure that each school gets its earmarked budget and the head of the school has an oversight over expenditure. Rs.1750 million will be transferred to School Management Committees for community identified school improvement investments. ICT Enabled Education Management Information System (EMIS). ⁹⁰	2	0	0	2
4.4	Improve adult literacy rates	As yet no development				Not scored.
4.5	Incentive to girls to enroll in schools	Rs. 1500 million will be spent on stipends for girl students, Rs.1540 million on provision of free textbooks to students. ⁹¹	1.5	1.5	0	3
4.6	Achieve Universal Primary Enrollment by 2018	As yet no specific data available.				Not scored.
4.7	Vocational Training	STEVTA will enroll 5000 more trainees, to increase its enrollment capacity to a total number of 45,000 trainees. ⁹²	0.5	1	0	1.5
5.	Labour and Human Resources					2
5.1	Expand the Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Programme	Target of training 65, 000 unskilled youth of Sindh ⁹³	2	0	0	2

⁹⁰ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

⁹¹ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

⁹² Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

⁹³ Ibid

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
5.2	Set up labour committees at the district level to resolve labour difficulties and disputes	As yet no development.				Not scored.
5.3	Construct a labour housing complex in the provincial capital	As yet no development.				Not scored.
5.4	Issuance of Labour Cards after proper mechanism devised (home based, agriculture, general workers)	As yet no development.				Not scored.
6.	Transport					3
6.1	Improve public bus service	According to ADP, 7 Schemes worth Rs 4,425.922 M. In future, Karachi Bus Project on Public Private Partnership (PPP) Basis. Tower-Malir Cantt Announced. ⁹⁴ Carriage Roads in NawabShah, Khairpur and Sukkur. Through Public Private Partnership built Hyderabad Tando Mohammad Khan Road. ⁹⁵	2	0	1	3
6.2	Float municipal bonds to raise funds	As yet no development.				Not scored.
7.	Housing					5
7.1	More than 500,000 houses will be constructed for the homeless	Shaheed Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Towns scheme launched in 8 districts of Sindh province (Karachi, Hyderabad, Jamshoro, Thatta, Dadu,	2	1	2	5

⁹⁴ Transport and Mass Transit Department, ADP Proposals. <http://www.sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Transport/adp.html>

⁹⁵ Dunya, Infrastructure Development in Sindh, June 2nd 2014.

PPPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	poor in urban and rural areas through Public Private Partnership	Mirpur Khas, Khairpur and Tandou Muhammad Khan) 100,000 plot applications, 27,500 successful allottees, 23 districts balloting on Dec 9 th 2013. ⁹⁶ 1500 plots have been allotted to poor residents and 12000 more houses for poor to be built. ⁹⁷				
7.3	Construct low-cost housing development scheme on government land with a 20-year mortgage facility	As yet no development.				Not scored.
7.4	Provide a tax credit to those low-cost housing schemes that use alternative energy as a primary source of power	As yet no development.				Not scored.

⁹⁶ SHAHEED MOHTARMA BENAZIR BHUTTO TOWNS, <http://www.smbbt.com/>

⁹⁷ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>