



PTI



PML-N



PPP

Provincial Tracking Reports

2016-2017

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)



With support from: Center for International Private Enterprise

PRIME is a public policy think tank working for an open, free and prosperous Pakistan by creating and expanding a constituency for protective function of the state and freedom of the market.

This report is the part of a project, 'Economic Agenda: Manifesto Tracking' of Provincial Governments including KPK, Punjab and Sindh. It aims at initiating and informing policy dialogue and public debate on the implementation of the economic agenda promised by various political parties at a provincial level in the general election held in May 2013. The project is being supported by Center for International Private Enterprise (CIPE).

Published by: Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

© PRIME Institute

Recommended Citation: PRIME Institute 2017, Provincial Tracking Reports (2016-2017) Islamabad.

Published in: May 2017

For inquiries:

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

Office No. 401, 4th Floor Muhammad Gulistan Khan House

82-East, Fazal-ul-Haq Road, Blue Area, Islamabad.

Tel: 00 92 (51) 831 43 37-8 Fax: 00 92 (51) 831 43 39

Provincial Tracking Reports

2016 - 2017

Authors

Dr. Khalil Ahmad & Ali Salman

Research Support: Syed Talha Kazmi, Shehryar Aziz

Available at:

www.govpolicyscorecard.com.pk

Provincial Tracking Report

Introduction

Provincial Tracking Report reviews economic performance of three provinces, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh by tracking the progress made on the implementation of economic manifesto announced by the parties in power in these respective provinces i.e. Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) and Pakistan People’s Party-Parliamentarians (PPP-P). In case of Balochistan, the report includes a commentary on the socio-economic status of the province instead of following any manifesto because of a mid-term change in the government. The purpose of the Provincial Tracking Report is to initiate and inform policy dialogue and public debate on the progress made by political parties vis-à-vis their electoral promises. This tracking directly serves the basic principle of a functioning democracy: accountability.

Structure

As far as the scorecard is concerned, the report picks seven overlapping and common areas in the manifestoes of three leading parties pertaining to economic development, governance and social development. These common “Areas” include: Agriculture and Livestock, Taxation, Labor and Human Resources, Transport, Housing, E-Governance, and Industrial Development. These areas are then divided into “Components” and “Sub-components”. In most cases, these are based on a simple reproduction of text of the manifesto, and in some cases, some editing has been carried out for the purpose of clarification and structure, but without altering the meaning of the authors of the manifesto. While maximum care has been taken to keep common grounds for the sake of comparison, some differences remain.

In all, the report identifies measurable “targets” and allocates scores on all of them, subject to information availability, on the basis of three distinct parameters: policy and legislative developments, institutional reforms, and implementation. Policy and Legislative Development indicate the presence, or absence, of a supportive legal environment; Institutional Reforms indicate the quality of governance structure and Implementation shows the actual progress made on the policy.

Scoring

The scorecard quantifies the status of implementation on announced goals in the economic agenda of three respective parties. For each of the target area, the score is assigned from 0 to 10 with 10 being the highest. The score is sub-divided in three categories namely Legislative and Policy Developments (2.5), Institutional Reforms (2.5), and Implementation (5).

The team has developed and consistently applies a set of rules to minimize discretion.

1. Averages are computed on non-weighted basis. All “areas” and their constituting components and sub-components carry same weight towards the overall score.
2. Negative scoring is not allowed as it has a disproportionate impact on the overall score of each category.

3. Score of 2 to 2.5 is assigned in “Policy and Legislative Development”, if one already exists or has been developed.
4. Score of 1 to 1.5 is assigned in “Institutional Reforms” if some progress is being shown.
5. Score of 1 to 2 is assigned in “Implementation” if some progress has started. A goal is considered to be achieved, if the related policy is implemented.
6. Score of zero is assigned if progress has been reversed.
7. Score of ‘Nil’, if no progress is made, though positive policy direction is announced.
8. Score of “As yet no development”, if work in the particular area or component is yet to begin. Such components and sub-components are not scored and are discarded while computing average.
9. Same level of score over various editions of scorecard is assigned, if the level of progress is maintained or if adequate and updated information is not available.
10. If a goal is achieved, then in the subsequent editions, it is mentioned as “Target Stands Achieved” and is not counted towards taking averages more than once.
11. Subject to information availability, the data included in the report pertain to the time period for which the scorecard is being published. For this report, the data largely focuses on the calendar year of 2016.

The structure and methodology of the report has been shared with a select group from the business community, politicians and economists for the purpose of feedback and has undergone several revisions.

The scoring gives a snapshot view on the performance of the government in a particular area as well as an aggregate perspective. Based on one year progress, a narrative report is prepared.

Interpretation of Scoring

For interpretation of score, following guidelines have been developed.

- Zero: Progress has been reversed.
- As Yet No Development: No progress made.
- 1 to 4.9: Policy direction is not clear, institutional bottlenecks exist and no or very little implementation has started.
- 5 to 7.9: Policy direction is supportive, institutional reforms are in progress and some implementation has started.
- 8 to 10: Policy direction is supportive, governance structure is functional and implementation is complete.

By ‘complete implementation’, one should not necessarily interpret it as having achieved the ultimate goals of the policy, e.g., welfare or industrial productivity, which does not lend to easy assessment. This should be interpreted as output achieved rather than the outcome.

Data Sources

In order to develop a comprehensive scorecard, the team collects the data from publically available documents and secondary data sources including provincial government websites, provincial budgets, statements by public officials and newspapers. The team tracks five newspapers on daily basis and develops portfolio of news on the basis of classification

system of the scorecard. These newspapers become the basis of an interim assessment of the “current status”, which is then verified, endorsed or rectified in the light of secondary data available.

The Team

The report and scorecard has been compiled by a team comprising political scientists and economists. The tool development was primarily undertaken by Mr. Ali Salman and the narrative report is developed by Dr. Khalil Ahmad. From PRIME research staff, Syed Talha Hasan and Shehryar Aziz significantly contributed in compiling this report by searching and verifying the data.

- **Mr. Ali Salman:** Ali is Founder Executive Director Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME). Ali has worked as a consultant economist for major international development organizations, public sector organizations and non-profits in Pakistan and other countries. He is author of several studies and monographs and regularly writes for Express Tribune. Ali is currently based in Kuala Lumpur. He holds master degrees in Economics, Public Policy and Business Administration.
- **Dr. Khalil Ahmad:** Ahmad is a political philosopher by training, and is the founder of the first free market think tank of Pakistan, Alternate Solutions Institute. He is a writer, and his latest books include the path-breaking ‘Pakistan Mein Riyasati Ashrafiya Ka Urooj’ (The Rise of State Aristocracy in Pakistan) and later, *Siyasi Partian Ya Siyasi Bandobast: Pakistani Siyasat Ke Pech-o-Kham Ka Falsafiyana Muhakma* (Political Parties or Political Arrangements: A Philosophical Analysis of Politics in Pakistan). Khalil holds a PhD in philosophy and has taught graduate and post-graduate classes in various institutions. He is the only member from Pakistan of a prestigious society of political philosophers, economists, and intellectuals, *The Mont-Pelerin Society*.

Disclaimer: *This project is being implemented by Policy Research Institute of Market Economy- PRIME with support from Center for International Private Enterprise. The views expressed in the report are those of the authors and not those of either the PRIME or the CIPE. PRIME or CIPE, or the authors of this report, do not take the responsibility of statistical errors as the report uses the publicly available secondary sources.*

Provincial Tracking Reports: 2016 - 2017

Introductory Remarks:

The 1st Provincial Tracking Report was released in July 2014. Since then the Tracking Team has not been able to follow and track all those economic and social developments that took place in all the provinces.

Thus after a gap of about two years when the Tracking Team once again began to search for the provincial data, it found the task quite a tougher one. Pakistani media, especially print media, generally and regularly, is always focused on federal government. This slanting allows it not to shift its attention to what happens in the provincial domains; but only to that which has got a political sense of drama. That's true, at best, in the case of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab, and Sindh.

As for Balochistan, if 50% data may be found for the three fortunate provinces; for the province of Balochistan, only 5% data may be extracted. The Tacking Team also tried its luck with the Balochistan's government websites, but in vain.

In fact, why the Tracking Team was not able to score what developments took place in Balochistan through the last four years may be excused for another reason also! The 1st half of the 5 year tenure came to the share of National Party and it ruled Balochistan under the chief ministership of Dr. Abdul Malik till December 2015. After that it's the PML-N's turn to rule Balochistan. That explains the difficulty of ascribing what developments to which political party and how.

Let it be confessed here that despite our best efforts we were not able to track and assign score to any political party's government in Balochistan, be it National Party or PML-N. We are failing Balochistan haplessly and helplessly!

At the very beginning it may be noted that economic manifestoes of the 3 parties, i.e. Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, ruling in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan Muslim League (N) ruling in Punjab, and Pakistan Peoples Party (P), ruling in Sindh, are mostly social and welfarist, and may be termed least policy-oriented.

A glance at their "economic agenda," (if it may be termed economic agenda in the true sense of the term) presents quite a different picture. At best, their agendas are more of a social and welfarist nature.

Here is how the targets which their "economic agenda" contains help them to be classified as follows:

- About 90 % of targets are social
- About 5 % are policy-oriented
- About 5 % are related to infrastructure

That this percentage may vary in case of this or that party's agenda is true; but that doesn't change the inherent trend of their economic agenda, which is essentially welfaristic. They all try to sell welfarist slogans to the protection-seeking, justice-denied, freedom-deprived and rights-starved citizens of Pakistan! Their sustained effort is to make them realize that they are poor and need this or that party to alleviate their poverty.

All of the 3 parties, i.e. PTI, PML (N), and PPP are obsessively preoccupied with education and health, instead of economic reforms, and that reveals their social preferences instead of economic. Also, no party has any penchant for establishing rule of law and prompt provision of justice.

They all seek to work varyingly on the following sectors:

1. Agriculture and Livestock
2. Taxation / Resource Utilization
3. Labor and Human Resources
4. Transport
5. Housing
6. Governance, and
7. Industrial Development

Let it be clarified here that a Social Agenda envisages only social changes bringing smaller improvements here and there, without effecting any sustainable changes in the economic structure of the state and society. Embracing Social Agenda does not make the political parties focus their efforts on good governance.

Doing it like doing nothing: PTI Socio-Economic Agenda – Tracking Report [4.69]

The Economic Agenda of Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf seems to be overwhelmed with education and health. The component of Education contains 9 sub-components, more than any other of the 9 components. The Health component consists of 5 sub-components, as does the component Agriculture and Livestock.

Doesn't that hint at the influences coming down from the agenda of most of the non-governmental organizations working in Pakistan?

Other components are: *Resource Utilization* (1 sub-component); *Labor and Human Resources* (3 sub-components); *Transport* (2 sub-components); *Industrial Development* (2 sub-components); *Housing* (1 sub-component); and *Governance* (4 sub-components).

The tally of components and sub-components PTI targets contain stands as follows:

Components: 9

Sub-Components: 33

The average score of the PTI's Economic Agenda Tracking Report is 4.69 out of 10. Previously it was 3.82. It shows an improvement of 0.9 point.

Let's have a look first at the important targets with some policy implications, and focusing on infrastructural priorities and governance:

In the component, *Agriculture tax from large landowners (15 % agriculture tax would be introduced on land-holdings exceeding 50 acres)*, a score of 2.5 has been assigned corresponding with the positive developments such as improvement in the share of income from agriculture income tax from 0.4% to 0.6%.

The component of *Computerizing all the land records* has won a score of 6.0, as the almost 60% of the revenue department record stands computerized.

In the component, *Develop industrial infrastructure and estate with basic facilities in every district*, a score of 6.0 has been awarded. Under this target, sufficient progress has already been made with the establishment of a Board of Investment and Trade, and other developments are taking place.

Another target is to set up District Finance Commissions (DFCs) for every district to ensure equal distribution of funds to tehsils and villages, in it a full 10 score has been allotted since DFCs have been established in all the 25 districts of KP.

As the component of *Electronic mapping of property* has seen no development through the years, it has won no score.

As for all the other components and sub-components, they somehow build the case for a social agenda only!

Now let's try to have an overview of the average score the 9 components succeeded in obtaining:

The component of *Agriculture and Livestock* got an average score of 3.5. It has 5 sub-components the scores for which lie in the range of 2 to 6. The sub-component, *Public/Private partnership to build grain silos* has got a score of 2; and the score of 6 has been granted to the sub-component, *Computerize all land record*, as has already been mentioned.

In the component of *Resource utilization*, since it has only one sub-component, the individual and average score is the same, i.e. 2.5.

The average score for the *Health* component stands at 4.17. Its 6 sub-components have got scores 5, 4, 3, 5, 2, and 6. As far as individual sub-components' performance is concerned, it shows steady progress towards providing healthcare facilities.

In *Education*, the average score is 6. This component consists of 9 sub-components, and they have won scores in the range 4 to 10. The two sub-components, 4.2 and 4.9, saw no development.

The component of *Labor and Human Resources* got an average score of 5.5. Out of its 3 sub-components, 2 got a score of 5.5 each for *Establishing jawan markaz in every district / tehsil to facilitate local entrepreneurs* and *Improving labor skills, reducing employment, and starting vocational training*. The 3rd, *Improving the plight of the labor*, as yet, after about 4 years, saw no development.

In the component of *Transport*, the average score stands at 4. It's one sub-component got a score of 4. Here it requires to be mentioned that after Punjab built the metro-bus service, regardless of the fact whether it was need of the hour or not, willy-nilly there ensued a competition among the provinces, and both KP and Sindh went for the same.

The component, *Industrial Development*, got an average score of 4.5. The score for one component is 6.0, while in the next one, *Encouraging provincial infrastructure development schemes and project for exports*, it is 3.

The component of *Housing* is itself its sub-component. It got an average score of 5.5, since various big housing schemes and mega projects are in the process of being implemented.

In the component of *Governance*, which is otherwise must be considered an important development, the score stands at 6.5. Its 5 sub-components, 9.1 and 9.2, have got a score of 3

and 10 respectively. The other 3 sub-components have as yet, after about 4 years, seen no development.

Excluding the *Resource utilization*, *Industrial Development*, and *Governance* components, for the other 6 components which form the core of PTI's Social Agenda, the average score is 4.9.

The overall score or the implementation status of the PTI in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa vis-à-vis its election manifesto stands at 4.69 out of 10.

Here is the PTI performance at a glance:

Targets as set by PTI (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa)	Average Score
Agriculture& Livestock	3.5
Resource Utilization	2.5
Healthcare	4.17
Education	6.0
Labor and Human Resources	5.5
Transport	4.0
Industrial Development	4.5
Housing	5.5
Governance	6.5

Doing it in order to show it: PML-N Economic Agenda: Tracking Report [5.45]

As far as "Economic Agenda" of the PML-N being implemented in the province of Punjab is concerned, it is not much different from the Tehreek-e-Insaf's in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa and Peoples Party's in Sindh. It is as much a Social Agenda as is theirs.

In respect of welfarist tendencies, it is similar with both; however, with regard to policy reform it is a bit different from each.

It needs to be mentioned here that unlike the Peoples Party's and Tehreek-e-Insaf's "Economic Agendas", PML-N's "Economic Agenda" for Punjab is heavily social and, thus, welfarist also. It is borne out by the components of *Education* and *Health* both of which together consist of 19 sub-components; though other components and sub-components may also be brought forward in support of the argument.

On the one hand, it shares its rural inclinations with Peoples Party; on the other hand, its urban inclinations are similar with those of Tehreek-e-Insaf's.

It is in the above-mentioned respects that the Social Agenda of the PML-N as being implemented in Punjab is imbued both with rural and urban inclinations. That means it tries to address the social issues facing both rural and urban populations.

Here is an analysis of the targets based on its Economic Agenda which outlines its similarities with and differences from the PPP and PTI:

Components: 8

Sub-Components:35

The components which are similar with Peoples Party and Tehreek-e-Insaf:

Agriculture and Livestock (7 sub-components); *Taxation / Resource Mobilization* (3 sub-components); *Health* (8 sub-components); *Education* (11 sub-components); *Labor and Human Resources* (3 sub-components); *Transport* (1 sub-component); and, *Housing* (1 sub-component).

It is in the component of *E-Governance* that PML-N’s agenda is different from Peoples Party’s and similar with that of the Tehreek-e-Insaf’s.

Let’s have a look at those components’ score which may have some policy implications:

In order of importance, the first such component is *Reducing number of provincial taxes*, which got a score of 2.5 only. The second one is *Reforming tax administration*, to which a score of 3 has been assigned. As for the 3rd sub-component, *Issuing infrastructure bonds*, it has seen no development.

Here is the final tally of the average score each of the 8 components of PML-N’s “Economic Agenda” has been granted:

Targets as set by the PML-N	Average Score
Agriculture& Livestock	4.8
Taxation/Resource Mobilization	2.75
Health	5.31
Education	5.77
Labour & Human Resources	4.5
Transport	6.5
Housing	7.0
E-Governance	7.0

Thus the overall performance of the PML-N in the province of Punjab in terms of average score stands at 5.45 out of 10.

The less you do the more you have: PPP Socio-Economic Agenda: Tracking Report [3.66]

The Economic Agenda of Pakistan Peoples Party is surprisingly similar to the one Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf espouses.

It consists of the same components such as: *Agriculture and Livestock; Resource Utilization; Health; Education; Labor and Human Resources; Transport; and, Housing.*

The difference between the two parties lies in two components, which Tehreek-e-Insaf additionally possesses: *Industrial Development; and, E-Governance.*

That difference of two components makes a substantial difference between the two agendas: they are elementally poles apart. The Economic Agenda of the Peoples Party exhibits rural inclinations. The most cogent internal evidence available in favor of this observation is not only that it has set no target to promote or facilitate the industrial development and e-governance, but that two of its targets states clearly that: *No indirect taxes on agriculture; and that Flat rate electricity for tube wells.* For the 1st, the score stands at 2, and for the 2nd, at 10 out of 10.

It may be interpreted in a manner that the Sindh province is still predominantly rural and thus it is justified that any party ruling there should focus on rural development and other such factors; however, that's a matter of policy and it may be argued that any party ruling there requires such an economic agenda which should focus on bringing out the rural Sindhis from poverty and backwardness. Moreover, another counter-argument may bring it to the fore that the Sindh province owns the greatest wealth creating hub in the form of Karachi city; why the Peoples Party's economic agenda entirely ignores it!

In this regard only two components may be mentioned: there is one component of *Transport*, with two sub-components one of which is: *Improve public bus service.* Another component, *Housing* too promises to construct houses for the urban homeless.

In contrast to the Peoples Party's, Tehreek-e-Insaf's "economic agenda" appears to be somehow driven mostly by urban inclinations. But as far as their social agenda is concerned, both of them are on the same page.

Like Tehreek-e-Insaf, Peoples Party too seems to be obsessed with education and health, both of which are on top of the local and international NGOs' agenda.

Let's have an analysis of Peoples Party's Economic Agenda (the targets) which is basically social:

Components: 7

Sub-Components: 32

The component of *Education* consists of 7 sub-components followed by *Health* which comprises 6 sub-components. There is only one other such component which has 7 sub-components, and it is *Agriculture and Livestock*. That hints at the predominance of rural inclinations.

As far as other components are concerned, here is their detail: Resource Utilization (2 sub-components); *Labor and Human Resources* (4 sub-components); *Transport* (2 sub-components); and, *Housing* (3 sub-components).

For each component, the tally of average score is as follows:

Targets as set by PPP	Average Score
Agriculture & Livestock	5.14
Resource Utilization	2.0
Health	2.3
Education	3.58
Labor & Human Resources	4.0
Transport	4.0
Housing	5.0

The overall score which highlights the implementation status of Peoples Party's Social Agenda in Sindh is 3.31 out of 10.

Comparative and Concluding Remarks:

Since all the provincial governments belong to different political parties, i.e. Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa is ruled by Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, Punjab by Pakistan Muslim League (N), and Sindh by Pakistan Peoples Party, it may be surmised that a sense of competition should have prevailed among them. On the contrary, what prevails is worst form of political rivalry. However, the little that has come out of sort of a competition may not be attributed to the sense of competition, but to a sense of burning envy; and it has shown itself in the form of a Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) project. The provinces of KP and Sindh followed Punjab's suit in embracing the same project they in the first instance rejected and ridiculed, but then adopted, lest its absence hurt their vote-bank.

Here it may also be noted quite interestingly that the Provinces' Tracking Report not only comes up to the perceptions that already prevails in the political and public circles but it is corroborated as well by various reports and surveys that make headlines in the newspapers

and TV channels now and then, and which try to evaluate the performance of each party and their chief minister in their respective provinces.

Once again, it needs to be highlighted that the economic manifestoes of the 3 parties, as they are being implemented in their respective provinces, are mostly social and welfarist, and far less policy-oriented in terms of their economic agenda. A cursory look at their agenda as pledged in their election manifestos presents quite a different picture. Their agendas appear more of a social and welfarist nature, and far less economic.

With the passage of the 18th amendment in the constitution, Pakistan has entered a new period vis-à-vis federation versus the provinces debate and the issues relating to governance. This substantially increased provincial autonomy has far-reaching implications in the realm of economic policy; however, it has yet to realize the possibilities it may have for the policy-makers at the provincial level.

This point must be noted that most of the time parties ruling both in center and the provinces are somehow the same. That's the case with PML-N presently; it is ruling both in the center and Punjab. Also, the same was the case with the previous government of the Peoples Party, when it was in power both in the center and Sindh. So, in essence, the "issue of center versus provinces" is political and will stand resolved the day political parties want it to be resolved.

It is in this perspective that the provincially ruling parties' prepossession with the social agenda may properly be understood.

Here it is necessary to stop a while and try to see how the term 'Welfare' is understood in Pakistan.

As almost everyone talking and writing in Pakistan finds himself / herself in complete agreement with the concept of a welfare state, no one ever bothers to think what it really amounts to and what strange implications it may have. While advocating the distribution of wealth in the name of equality or in the name of poor, the welfarists actually plead for a redistributive state.

It is this political opinion in favor of welfarism, which overwhelmingly prevails in Pakistan, that has provided the state and its beneficiaries with justifications of this or that sort to expand the state's powers of taxing and regulating everything in Pakistan.

Also, it is in this perspective that the social agenda of all the political parties, which is predominantly welfarist, may be understood.

However, lately there has risen a group of classical liberal thinkers in Pakistan who have started contesting the concept of welfarism and the arguments put forward in its favor. This author being one of them holds that in an ultimate sense the argument of welfarism,

whether it derives its inspiration from equality or poverty or any other such notion, at the end of the day it benefit those who live off the state, i.e. the State Aristocracy, as he has demonstrated in his book “*Pakistan Mein Riyasati Ashrafiya Ka Urooj*” (The Rise of State Aristocracy in Pakistan).

Welfarist spending may be characterized as such spending which mostly results in further temptations as well as more and more dependence on the part of the receivers. Also, such spending needs to be differentiated from the one which is provided to the affected people in cases of natural or social calamities.

Now at this stage it needs to be demonstrated how successful the Social Agenda of the PTI, PPPP, and PML-N has been. No doubt, their agenda is heavily tilted especially in favor of Education and Health; let’s see what they did achieve in both sectors:

Sector	Average Score: PTI – Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Average Score: PML-N - Punjab	Average Score: PPP - Sindh
Education	6.0	5.77	3.58
Health	4.17	5.31	2.3
Average	5.08	5.54	2.94

In implementing its Social Agenda, Punjab is at the top; it achieved a score of 5.54 points on its performance. Closely following is the PTI, which achieved a score of 5.08. As far as PPP’s performance is concerned, it gets the 3rd position by having an average score of 2.94. However, it is evident that it stands nowhere in the race.

Here is a picture of their overall performance after about four years of their rule:

Targets	KP	Punjab	Sindh
Agriculture & Livestock	3.5	4.5	5.14
Taxation/Resource Utilization	2.5	2.75	2.0
Health	4.17	5.31	2.3
Education	6.0	5.77	3.58
Labor & Human Resources	5.5	4.5	4.0
Transport	4.0	6.5	4.0
Housing	5.5	7.0	5.0
Governance	6.5	7.0	N/A
Industrial Development	4.5	N/A	N/A
Average Score:	4.69	5.45	3.71

It is interesting to note here that as per the previous provinces’ tracking report that was released in July 2014, both PTI and PPP were in competitive positions with an average score of 3.82 and 3.31 respectively, while Punjab enjoyed a singular status with an average score of

4.60. This time PTI with an average score of 4.69 has made a bit of progress and is competing with Punjab which now enjoys an average score of 5.45; while PPP as usual is lagging far behind with an average score of 3.71.

Province	July 2014 - Report	May 2017 - Report	Average Score
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	3.82	4.69	4.25
Punjab	4.60	5.45	5.02
Sindh	3.31	3.71	3.51

Though PML-N's performance may be judged better than PTI and far better than PPP; its difference with PTI is just 0.76; however, in comparison with PPP, it is 1.79 better.

In conclusion, and with caution, it may be noted that as far as their own Social Agenda is concerned, PTI, PML-N, and PPP, all of the three, whatever they have accomplished up to now, it seems they have achieved nothing substantial. That's the limitation of a social agenda pursued in isolation.

As a matter of fact, in addition to their social agenda, what they urgently require to focus on are the chronic issues of governance; such as maintenance of law and order; provision of prompt justice; reform of state services and delivery mechanisms; police reforms. And, no doubt, long- term economic reforms.

It is in this context that their social and welfarist agendas prove quite insufficient and out of the place. No doubt, be it PTI, PML-N, or PPP, all of them have got a long way to go in order to bring their politics to face and address the issues that have since long made the life of ordinary people of Pakistan miserable!

Khalil Ahmad

April 30, 2017

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PTI Economic Agenda: Tracking Report

Average Score= 4.69 (10)

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
1.	Agriculture and Livestock					3.5
1.1	Computerize all land record	<p>Only 6.2% of the project amount has been utilized, so far. Two service delivery centres have been made partially functional, in Peshawar and Mardan.¹</p> <p>60 percent of the revenue department records has been computerized²</p> <p>Launch of Computerized Land Record from July2014.³</p>	1.5	1.5	3	6

¹ Dawn, Computerisation of land record still a far cry, November 22, 2016, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1297905>

² Truth Tracker, All land and revenue records will be digitized – PTI, November 21st 2013. <http://www.truthtracker.pk/all-land-and-revenue-record-will-be-computerized-pti/>

³ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
1.2	Ensure access to credit	Rs. 25,000 per acre agricultural loans will be provided farmers. ⁴ Rs. 200 million allocated through Cooperative Bank.	2	0.5	0	2.5
1.3	Ensure access to Agricultural inputs	Free of cost provision of seeds for plantation of olives. Rs. 15m allocated in budget for building growing capacity of small farmers. Rs150m for 100 solar-powered pumps in the province announced in budget. ⁵	1.5	1	1.5	4
1.4	Connect provincial agriculture department with universities	Graduate courses have been offered ⁶ .	2	1	0	3
1.5	Public/Private partnership	Proposal forwarded for the year 2016-	2	0	0	2

⁴ The Times of Islamabad, KPK government agriculture reforms for farmers, October 5, 2016, <https://timesofislamabad.com/kpk-government-agriculture-reforms-farmers-2/2016/10/05/>

⁵ Express Tribune, Azm-e nau Budget: K-P presents Rs404.80b budget, June 14th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/721758/over-rs400b-budget-to-be-presented-in-k-p-assembly-today/>

⁶ Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Planning and Development Department, White Paper 2014-15.

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	for establishing grain silos	2017 to the Planning and Development Department for construction of steel silos in District Tank, Hangu, Dir Upper, Malakand, and Chitral. ⁷ Allocations made for feasibility study ⁸ .				
2.	Resource Utilization					2.5
2.1	Agriculture tax from large landowners	KP improved its share of income from Agriculture Income Tax to 0.6% from the previous 0.4%. Agricultural Income Tax (AIT) collection in 2015-2016 stood at Rs. 80 million as against target of Rs. 1bn. There are 27,794 farmers who own land in excess of 5 acres but only a few hundred are registered as AIT payers. ⁹	0.5	0.5	1.5	2.5
3.	Health					4.17
3.1	Free primary healthcare	Health insurance card scheme announced	1.5	1	2.5	5

⁷ Finance Department, Government of KP, White Paper 2016-17, June 14, 2016, <http://www.kpkep.gov.pk/documents/White%20paper%202016-17.pdf>

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Pakistan Observer, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Govt. regressive tax policy, July 14, 2016, <http://pakobserver.net/khyber-pakhtunkhwa-govts-regressive-tax-policy/>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	system for poor	for KP. Families would be covered up to Rs. 210,000. Scheme to benefit 1,800,000 families. ¹⁰				
3.2	Modernization of DHQs	Targets set out in the 2016-17 white paper include standardization of all DHQs/THQs in K-P, and improvement of emergency services in all DHQs and teaching hospitals. 3 new DHQs completed. ¹¹	2	1	1	4
3.3	Create jobs in healthcare (doctors, nurses, paramedics)	The numbers of doctors/ radiologists in the province saw no change during Jan 2014- Jan 2015. Dental surgeons were reduced from 167 to 161. The number of	0	1	2	3

¹⁰ Radio Pakistan, Imran announces to launch health insurance card scheme in K-P, June 26, 2016, <http://www.radio.gov.pk/26-Jun-2016/imran-announces-to-launch-health-insurance-card-scheme-in-k-p>

¹¹ Finance Department KPK, White Paper. <http://www.financекpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		nurses increased from 3620 to 3673. The strength of LHWs fell from 1138 to 1034. ¹² Doctors inducted to fulfill vacant posts. ¹³				
3.4	Provide clean drinking water	140 out of 240 clean drinking water schemes have been completed in the province. Water quality monitoring laboratories have been established in Districts Mardan, Abbottabad, Kohat and Dera Ismail Khan. Work on gravity flow water schemes is underway in Drosh and Batkhela. ¹⁴	1.5	1.5	2	5
3.5	Initiate mega population control program	Rs. 230 million have been allocated for population welfare in Annual Development Program. Only 18.1% of ADP budget 2015-16 allocated for population welfare was utilized. ¹⁵	0.5	0.5	1	2

¹² Bureau of Statistics, Development statistics of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa 2016, June 3, 2016, <http://kpbos.gov.pk/files/1464939108.pdf>

¹³ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financекpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

¹⁴ Radio Pakistan, KP government completes 140 clean drinking water schemes, September 12, 2016, <http://www.radio.gov.pk/12-Sep-2016/kpk-govt-completes-140-clean-drinking-water-schemes>

¹⁵ Finance Department, Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, White Paper 2016-17, <http://www.kpkep.gov.pk/documents/White%20paper%202016-17.pdf>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
3.6	Healthcare awareness campaign and drug abuse campaigns	<p>Sehat ka Insaf (phase 2) launched. It is a complete health package to eradicate polio and other health diseases.¹⁶ CM inaugurated two new buildings in Hayatabad for drug rehabilitation; Sakoon Kore 3, and 4.</p> <p>Sehat ka Insaf Campaign Launched in Jan 2014 to immunize 8lakh children in Peshawar during 3 months.¹⁷ Confirmed Polio Cases 9/67 as of 22nd May 2014.¹⁸ Out of 1.4 m children 1.3m were immunized in 4 districts.¹⁹</p>	1	1	4	6
4.	Education					6

¹⁶ Ibid

¹⁷ PTI, Imran Khan launches "Healthcare Justice" campaign, January 25th 2014. <http://www.insaf.pk/chapters/khyber-pakhtoonkhwa/peshawar/item/1787613-imran-khan-launches-%E2%80%9Ccricket-talent-hunt-program%E2%80%9D-%E2%80%9Chhealthcare-justice%E2%80%9D-campaign>

¹⁸ Expanded Program on Immunization Confirm Polio Cases 2014 By Province/ Region/ Agency. http://www.epikp.gov.pk/polio_updates.php

¹⁹ Frontier Post, 1.3 Million Children immunized in Sehat Ka Insaf Program: Shahram, April 7th 2014. <http://thefrontierpost.com/article/87405/1.3-Million-Children-immunized-in-Sehat-Ka-Insaf-Program-Shahram/>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
4.1	One education system	The Higher Education Department of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has decided to formulate a uniform model statutes for public sector universities. ²⁰ Class-based education system had been replaced with unified English medium education all over the province. ²¹	1.0	1.0	3	5
4.2	Urdu and one local language medium of instruction till 8 th grade	As yet, no development by PTI government. Such scheme to teach regional languages in schools had already been initiated by the ANP government in 2013-14 school year.	-	-	-	-
4.3	English to be medium of instruction in universities	Medium of instruction in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been changed from Urdu to English from April 2014. ²²	2.5	2.5	5.0	10
4.4	All hiring of teachers within their district of	In KPK, the government allows teachers to specify five nearby schools of their	2.5	2.5	4	9

²⁰ DAWN, Uniform statutes for varsities being prepared, January 19, 2015, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1158003>

²¹ Dawn, Students get books free at launch of enrolment drive, April 9th 2014. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1098647>

²² DAWN, Will change in medium of instruction improve education in KP?, September 28, 2014, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1134809>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	choice	<p>choice in the entry forms during the recruitment process.²³</p> <p>Promulgation of the rationalization policy for schools in 5 districts including Peshawar, Charsadda, Nowshera, Mardan and Swabi. Later extended throughout the province. Under the policy, teachers in all these districts would be transferred and posted in schools of their nearest places of choice. Later there would be complete ban on transfers.²⁴</p>				
4.5	Need based voucher system to fund students where govt schools are not enough	14000 children have benefitted from voucher scheme. In February 2017, a survey was initiated to extend this scheme to 16000 students in six districts. Rs.500-800 is provided per child per	2.5	1.5	0	4

²³The Express Tribune, The state of teacher recruitment in Pakistan, May 01, 2015, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/973856/the-state-of-teacher-recruitment-in-pakistan/>

²⁴ Pakistan Tehreek-e Insaf, CM KP Pervaiz Khattak announces rationalization policy for schools (April 24, 2014), <http://www.insaf.pk/component/k2/item/1787956-cm-kp-pervaiz-khattak-announces-rationalization-policy-for-schools-april-24-2014>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		month depending upon level of education. ²⁵ Cabinet approved the Introduction of Education Voucher Scheme with an allocation of Rs.500 million. ²⁶				
4.6	Stipends for poor students	Monthly stipends of Rs. 200 for female students of class VI-X. ²⁷	1.0	1.0	2.0	4.0
4.7	Double number of girls high schools in 5 years.	Number of high schools for females in the province has increased to 722 in 2014-15 compared to 676 in 2013-14. ²⁸	1.5	0.5	1	3
4.8	Incentives for girls education(uniforms, free books, meals, scholarships	443,204 female students were provided stipends in Qtr 4, 2016-17. KP government approved bill calling for education to be imparted free of cost in all	2	2	3	7

²⁵ The Express Tribune, Survey begins: K-P to provide 16,000 children with fee vouchers, January 13, 2017, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1293348/survey-begins-k-p-provide-16000-children-fee-vouchers/>

²⁶ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, Minister information KP briefing about cabinet meeting (Nov 5, 2013), [http://www.insaf.pk/news/national-news/item/17538-Minister%20information%20KP%20briefing%20about%20cabinet%20meeting%20\(Nov%205%202013\)](http://www.insaf.pk/news/national-news/item/17538-Minister%20information%20KP%20briefing%20about%20cabinet%20meeting%20(Nov%205%202013))

²⁷ Pakistan Today, KP unveils Rs. 505 billion 'balanced' budget, June 15, 2016, <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2016/06/15/kp-unveils-rs-505-billion-balanced-budget/>

²⁸ Bureau of Statistics, Development statistics of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa 2016, June 3, 2016, <http://kpbos.gov.pk/files/1464939108.pdf>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	&transportation)	<p>public sector educational institutions. Primary and secondary education to be made compulsory for all children between 5-16 years of age. Parents would be punishable with imprisonment up to one month and/or fine of Rs. 100 per day.²⁹</p> <p>An amount of Rs.100 million was approved as stipend @ Rs.200/- per month for girl students enrolled in primary schools of seven selected districts of Hangu, Peshawar, Bannu, Lakki, D.I.Khan, Shangla and Nowshera³⁰ 7 lakh children enrolled in schools during 2013-14.³¹</p> <p>Free books distributed among 54lakh</p>				

²⁹ Dawn, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa govt approves bill making secondary education compulsory, February 6, 2017, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1313087>

³⁰ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, Minister information KP briefing about cabinet meeting (Nov 5, 2013), [http://www.insaf.pk/news/national-news/item/17538-Minister%20information%20KP%20briefing%20about%20cabinet%20meeting%20\(Nov%205,%202013\)](http://www.insaf.pk/news/national-news/item/17538-Minister%20information%20KP%20briefing%20about%20cabinet%20meeting%20(Nov%205,%202013))

³¹ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		students. ³²				
4.9	Improve adult literacy 15-30 age group	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-
5.	Labour and Human Resources					5.5
5.1	Jawan Markaz to be established in every district/tehsil to facilitate local entrepreneurs	Decision to set up a youth commission. Rs. 1 billion earmarked for establishment of youth centre. ³³ Loans worth Rs2.1 b distributed amongst unemployed youth under self-employment scheme. ³⁴ Scholarship worth Rs2000 for unemployed graduate students. ³⁵	1.5	1.5	2.5	5.5
5.2	Vocational training programs	Special assistant to CM announced in May 2016 that a technical university would be set up in Nowshera. ³⁶	1.5	2	2	5.5

³² Ibid

³³ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, KP government has announced first ever policy in KPK, November 28, 2016, <http://www.insaf.pk/news/khyber-pakhtunkhwa/item/1793014-kp-government-has-announced-first-ever-youth-policy-in-kpk>

³⁴ Finance Department KPK, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

³⁵ Ibid

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		Training centre for women entrepreneurs would be established in KP under the KP Women Skill and Entrepreneurship Development Programme (plan approved by federal govt organization). 2842 students were provided free technical education. 2200 persons placed by employment exchanges. ³⁷				
5.3	Tripartite board consisting of the employer, labour and inspectors for each sector to improve plight of labour (prevent unemployment, occupational safety, working hours)	As yet no development	-	-	-	-
6.	Transport					4
6.1	Cost Effective and	Work on Bus Rapid Transit system to	2	2	0	4

³⁶ Business Recorder, KP government to set up technical university in Nowshera: Ghani, May 9, 2016, <http://fp.brecorder.com/2016/05/2016050944211/>

³⁷ Performance Management and Reforms Unit- Govt of KP, KPIs data for financial year 2016-17, http://pmru.gkp.pk/pdmf/department.php?department_id=50

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	Efficient transport services	begin in Jan 2017 and be completed by Dec 2017. Mass transit system approved at a cost of Rs. 25bn for Peshawar. ³⁸ 5 corridors for Metro Bus and One for rail service have been selection work start from September 2014 from Chamkani to Hayatabad ³⁹⁴⁰ KPK govt approved Rs10b for Peshawar mass transit ⁴¹				
7.	Industrial Development					4.5
7.1	Develop industrial infrastructure & estate	Project underway for establishment of industrial estates at Chitral, Mansehra,	2	2	2	6

³⁸ Samaa, Peshawar to get Mass Transit System costing Rs 25 bln: minister, July 26, 2016, <https://www.samaa.tv/economy/2016/07/peshawar-to-get-mass-transit-system-costing-rs-25-bln-minister/>

³⁹ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, CM KP Inaugurates Police Assistance Lines for Citizens at Peshawar (May 13, 2014), <http://www.insaf.pk/component/k2/item/1788097-cm-kp-inaugurates-police-assistance-lines-for-citizens-at-peshawar-may-13-2014>

⁴⁰ Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, CM KP Pervaiz Khattak chairs high level on Rapid Mass Transit System for Peshawar, decisions taken (May 12, 2014), <http://www.insaf.pk/component/k2/item/1788076-cm-kp-pervaiz-khattak-chairs-high-level-on-rapid-mass-transit-system-for-peshawar-decisions-taken-may-12-2014>

⁴¹ Business Recorder, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa government approves Rs 10 billion Peshawar mass transit project, June 12th 2014. <http://www.brecorder.com/business-economy/189/1191660/>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	with basic facilities in every district	Dargai, Malakand; and for establishment of small industrial estate Abbottabad-II. Programme ongoing for purchase of land for establishment of industrial estates at the border of Karak and Kohat; for 2 nd industrial estate at Peshawar; small industrial estate at Swat. ⁴²				
7.2	Encourage provincial infrastructure development schemes and projects for exports	25% subsidy on cost of land, 25% payment by the government on electricity bills for three years. Government will bear 25% transportation charges on machinery and plant transportation. Government will also share 25% of the total investment of those who would come to invest in the industrial sector in the provinces. ⁴³	2	0	1	3

⁴² Planning and Development Department-KP, Annual Development Programme 2016-17, <http://kp.gov.pk/uploads/2016/10/ADP-2016-17.pdf>

⁴³ The News, Meagre amount allocated for industries development: KP businessmen, July 11, 2016, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/133998-Meagre-amount-allocated-for-industries-development-KP-businessmen>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		Establishment of small industrial estate Abbottabad-II. Establishment of Mineral Based Industrial Estate at Chitral. ⁴⁴				
8.	Housing					5.5
8.1	Provide incentives to meet massive backlog of housing	CM Khattak said four housing schemes would be launched in the province-one each in Peshawar, Nowshera, Hangu and Chitral. ⁴⁵ Mega Education City, M-1, Nowshehra, Mega Sports City Peshawar, New City Abbottabad and New City and Tourism Resort Booni, Chitral. ⁴⁶	2	1.5	2	5.5
9.	Governance					6.5
9.1	E-governance	KP assembly becomes the first to launch e-governance system making the assembly proceeding paper-less.	1.5	1	0.5	3

⁴⁴ Finance Department KPK, White Paper. <http://www.financекpp.gov.pk/FD/budget/budget-at-a-glance/251-budget-2014-15.html>

⁴⁵ Khyber News, Four housing schemes to start in KP: CM Khattak, August 2, 2016, <https://khybernews.tv/four-housing-schemes-to-start-in-kp-cm-khattak/>

⁴⁶ The News, KP government to launch four mega housing schemes, February 23rd 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-7-234459-KP-government-to-launch-four-mega-housing-schemes>

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		Performance Management and Reforms Unit has enabled online performance monitoring of provincial departments. Launch of KP citizens' portal to allow citizens to register their complaints about service delivery. ⁴⁷ Microsoft to help KPK e-government ⁴⁸ Online FIR Registration ⁴⁹				
9.2	A DFC for every district to ensure equal distribution of funds to Tehsils and villages	District Performance Monitoring Framework for effective online monitoring of all 25 district governments in province has been established. ⁵⁰	2.5	2.5	5.0	10
9.3	Electronic Mapping of Property	As yet, no development	-	-	-	-
9.4	Introduce socio-economic measurement structure at	As yet, no development	-	-	-	-

⁴⁷ Performance Management and Reforms Unit, <http://pmru.gkp.pk/>

⁴⁸ Saach.Tv, PTI KPK Government 90 Days Report, September 9th 2013. <http://www.saach.tv/2013/09/09/pti-kpk-government-90-days-report/>

⁴⁹ KP Police, Online FIR. <http://kppolice.gov.pk/css/firadd.php>

⁵⁰ District Performance Monitoring Framework, http://dpmf.pmru.gkp.pk/home_new.php

PTI Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	Union Council Level					
9.5	GPRS based system to match availability and need for teachers	As yet, no development	-	-	-	-

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PML-N Economic Agenda: Tracking Report

Average Score= 5.45 (10)

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
1.	Agriculture and Livestock					4.8
1.1	Ensure availability of credit to small farmers	Banks have made agricultural credit disbursement of Rs. 598.3 billion against the targeted 600bn in FY2016. ⁵¹	2	2	3.5	7.5
1.2	Revamp all research on agriculture sector and intensify research to bring down cost of production for	Work on construction of new agricultural offices complex at Murree Road, and Soil Construction, Agricultural Engineering Workshops and Offices at Adyala Road,	2	1	3	6

⁵¹ Black Sea Grain, Pakistan. Banks disburse Rs 598.3 billion agriculture credit in Fiscal Year 2016, August 9, 2016, <http://www.blackseagrains.net/novosti/pakistan-banks-disburse-rs-598-3-billion-agriculture-credit-in-fiscal-year-2016>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	agriculture sector which has gone up due to high petroleum prices	<p>Rawalpindi started on July 1st 2013 (3 years project). Strengthening of research facilities at Fodder Research Sub-station, AARI, Faisalabad for the development of Silage type corn varieties⁵² Strengthening of Food Technology Section & PHRC, Ayub Agricultural Research Institute, Faisalabad.⁵³ Development of Genetic Engineering Facilities at Agri. Biotechnology Res. Institute, AARI, Faisalabad⁵⁴</p> <p>Multiple government organizations are working in this regard: Ayub Agriculture Research Institute, Faisalabad; National Institute for Biotechnology and Genetic Engineering, Faisalabad; National Institute for Agriculture and Biology, Faisalabad; among</p>				

⁵² Government of Punjab, Planning and Development Department, 2014-15

⁵³ Ibid

⁵⁴ Ibid

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		many others. Each of these have completed a number of projects, many are ongoing.				
1.3	Improve arrangements for storage and subsidized distribution to ensure relative price stability throughout the year including post-harvest storage and marketing systems	In budget 2016-17, amount has been allocated for construction of 30,000 tonnes capacity, concrete silos at Ahmadpur (East) and Chishtian. ⁵⁵	0.5	0.5	1	2
1.4	Establishment of Land Development Corporations with majority equity of the poor and managed by professional managers	As yet, no development	-	-	-	-
1.5	Extension of irrigation facilities to additional areas including major program of aquifer recharge in arid and	As yet, no new development	-	-	-	-

⁵⁵Dawn, Punjab budget: A hefty allocation for agriculture, June 14, 2016, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1264728>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	semiarid areas of Cholistan					
1.6	Update of revenue and property records using modern Information Technology	According to Senior Member of Punjab Board of Revenue, the Computerisation of land record to be completed by December 2014. ⁵⁶ Punjab Land Record Authority inaugurated in December, 2016. Computerization of land record underway. ⁵⁷	2	1.5	2	5.5
1.7	Modernize agriculture education and curriculum of agriculture universities.	Training ongoing	1	1	1	3
2.	Taxation/Resource Mobilization					2.75
2.1	Issue Provincial Infrastructure bonds or project specific bonds in	As yet, no development	-	-	-	-

⁵⁶ Office of the Chief Minister Punjab, Punjab Cabinet gives approval to Multan, Faisalabad and Rawalpindi-Islamabad Metro bus, February 3rd 2014. <http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/?q=node/2847>

⁵⁷ The Express Tribune, Computerisation: Punjab's land records go digital, December 3, 2016, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1272168/computerisation-punjabs-land-records-go-digital/>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	order to develop secondary centers of Industrial activities.					
2.2	Reform of tax administration at the provincial level	The International Finance Corporation & Punjab government signed agreement to reform the province's sales tax system. ⁵⁸	2	1	0	3
2.3	Reduce Number of Provincial taxes	Abolished bed tax on hotels; Imposed luxury tax on houses of 2 Kanals.	1	1	0.5	2.5
3.	Health					5.31
3.1	Health Insurance scheme for the most vulnerable and poor segment to avail basic healthcare in a government hospital or by a general practitioner at concessional rates	Health insurance program initiated in Districts Rahim Yar Khan, Khanewal, Narowal and Sargodha. 3 more districts to be included during Jan-Jun 2017. Vision is to extend it to all 36 districts by end of 2018. ⁵⁹	1.5	1.5	1.5	4.5

⁵⁸ Dawn, IFC to advise Punjab on tax reforms, August 1st 2013. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1033338>

⁵⁹ Business Recorder, Rahim Yar Khan: 260 patients benefited from PM's health insurance programme, October 28, 2016, <http://fp.brecorder.com/2016/10/2016102897321/>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
3.2	Existing Basic Health Units will be strengthened and where possible leased to private medical practitioners in public-private partnership model	To appoint doctors at BHUs, grant of MBBS degree has been made conditional with serving at BHUs. ⁶⁰ In Jan 2017, Punjab govt said it had decided to introduce public-private partnership in health sector. ⁶¹	1	1	0.5	2.5
3.3	Develop District Healthcare Authority (DHA) at each district level	DHAs established all over the province under the administrative control of Deputy Commissioners. ⁶²	2.5	2.5	5	10
3.4	At least 1,000 mobile health units will be launched to provide basic health facilities in remote areas and isolated localities	6 Mobile Health Units are already operational. Government has decided to outsource these six to private firms. ⁶³ CM has also approved purchase of 14 more. ⁶⁴	0.5	0.5	1	2

⁶⁰ Dawn, Reluctance to work at BHUs Punjab govt makes MBBS degree conditional, April 6, 2016, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1250285>

⁶¹ Dawn, Public-private partnership to be introduced in health sector, January 24, 2017, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1310355>

⁶² Daily Times, District health authorities established under LG set up across Punjab, January 3, 2017, <http://dailytimes.com.pk/punjab/03-Jan-17/district-health-authorities-established-under-lg-set-up-across-punjab>

⁶³ Daily Times, Govt. decides to outsource six mobile health units of Punjab, October 8, 2016, <http://dailytimes.com.pk/punjab/08-Oct-16/govt-decides-to-outsource-six-mobile-health-units-of-punjab>

⁶⁴ Neo, 14 Mobile Health Units purchase gets Shahbaz Sharif nod, January 8, 2017, <http://en.neonetwork.pk/08-Jan-2017/14-mobile-health-units-purchase-gets-shahbaz-sharif-nod>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
3.5	Within 5 years, 100% vaccination of children	Punjab remained polio-free in 2016. First registered polio case of 2017 is from Punjab after a period of 14 polio-free months for the province. ⁶⁵ Immunization coverage (penta 3) improved from 64% in 2014 to over 86% in one year. ⁶⁶	2	2	4	8
3.6	Within 5 years 50% reduction in maternal and infant mortality	Failure to achieve MDGs regarding infant and maternal mortality rate. Punjab government has launched MNCH program. Neo-natal mortality rate increased from 58 to 63 deaths per 1,000 births. Under-five mortality rate has reached 105 deaths per 1,000 live births. ⁶⁷ Rotavirus vaccine introduced in EPI immunization schedule of Punjab; should reduce diarrhea related deaths in children below five.	1	1	2.5	4.5
3.7	Provision of clean drinking	Punjab Saaf Pani Company, work to restart,	2	2	2.5	6.5

⁶⁵ The nation, Punjab reports first polio case of 2017, February 18, 2017, <http://nation.com.pk/national/18-Feb-2017/punjab-reports-first-polio-case-of-2017>

⁶⁶ Pakistan Observer, Rotavirus vaccine introduced in EPI immunization schedule of Punjab, January 14, 2017, <http://pakobserver.net/rotavirus-vaccine-introduced-in-epi-immunization-schedule-of-punjab/>

⁶⁷ Daily Times, Punjab introduces MNCH system to reduce maternal mortality rate, August 23, 2016, <http://dailytimes.com.pk/punjab/23-Aug-16/punjab-introduces-mnch-system-to-reduce-maternal-mortality-rate>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	water and safe sewerage disposal will be given high priority	total estimated cost of the project was Rs12 billion under which 1,479 filtration plants were to be installed in 33 districts of Punjab ⁶⁸ Formation of Waste management companies in 6 cities ⁶⁹ Allocation of Rs. 45bn in 2016-17 budget by Punjab government for providing adequate and safe drinking water and sanitation facilities. Allocation in 2015-16 budget was Rs. 24bn. ⁷⁰				
3.8	Private sector will be encouraged to expand pharmaceutical manufacturing and setup manufacturing of diagnostic equipment	Fourth drug testing laboratory and research centre in the country at Sundar industrial estate, costing Rs100 million, where 166 pharmaceutical units have been sanctioned. ⁷¹	2	2	0.5	4.5

⁶⁸ Dawn, Saaf Pani project 'back to square one', May 26th 2014. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1108602/saaf-pani-project-back-to-square-one>

⁶⁹ Lahore Waste Management Company, Formation of Waste management companies in 6 cities. http://www.lwmc.com.pk/sixcitiesconsultancy.php?cms_id=38

⁷⁰ The News, Rs45bn set aside for clean drinking water, June 14, 2016, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/127615-Rs45b-set-aside-for-clean-drinking-water>

⁷¹ The News, Fourth drug testing centre to begin soon, May 28th 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-3-252538-Fourth-drug-testing-centre-to-begin-soon>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
4.	Education					5.77
4.1	Initiate legislation to provide a road map for achieving 100% enrollment up to the middle level and 80% universal literacy and strive to meet the target of 'Education For All (EFA)' and 'Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)'	44% children are out-of-school. ⁷² In terms of school enrolment, Punjab ranks third after Islamabad and AJK in education score.	1	1	2.5	4.5
4.2	To reduce drop-out rate at primary level, missing facilities in schools to be provided	Primary education got the lowest share of 4% in 2015-16 development budget. ⁷³ Rs8bn to be spent on uplift of 15,000 schools. ⁷⁴	2	2	2	6

⁷²AlifAilaan, Regional Factsheets, The State of Education in Punjab, 2016, https://d3n8a8pro7vhmx.cloudfront.net/alifailaan/pages/496/attachments/original/1473162743/The_State_of_Education_in_Punjab.pdf?1473162743

⁷³AlifAilaan, The state of education in Punjab, 2016, https://d3n8a8pro7vhmx.cloudfront.net/alifailaan/pages/496/attachments/original/1473162743/The_State_of_Education_in_Punjab.pdf?1473162743

⁷⁴ Express Tribune, Education for all Punjab govt to spend Rs8bn on 15000 schools, June 20th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/728307/education-for-all-punjab-govt-to-spend-rs8-billion-on-15000-schools/>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
4.3	Provide special incentives like free books to girls	Free books already being provided to boys and girls at primary level.	1	1	1.5	3.5
4.4	Education Endowment Funds shall be set up in the province to award merit scholarships to poor and needy students for higher education.	44,000 active scholarships by Punjab Educational Endowment Fund (PEEF) during the year 2016-17 (in process). ⁷⁵ Education Endowment Fund already established and it awarded 16,881 scholarships worth Rs 962 million awarded to students in Punjab during 2013-14. ⁷⁶	2	2	3	7
4.5	Computer labs shall be established in all the government high schools in the first phase.	Budget allocation made in 2015-16 budget to establish computer labs in 990 high schools. No data on % of schools with computer labs; not all high schools have such facility so far. ⁷⁷ 4280 Labs have been set up in schools in Punjab. ⁷⁸	2	2	2	6
4.6	All merit students in public	CM approved purchase of 150,000 laptops to be	2	2	3	7

⁷⁵ Punjab Educational Endowment Fund, Annual Report 2016, http://www.peef.org.pk/downloads/AnnualReports/annual_report2016.pdf

⁷⁶ Ibid.

⁷⁷ The Nation, Punjab presents Rs.1.45tr 'election' budget, June 13, 2015, <http://nation.com.pk/national/13-Jun-2015/punjab-presents-rs1-45tr-election-budget>

⁷⁸ Business Recorder, Punjab government establishes 4,280 IT labs in schools, January 10th 2014. <http://www.brecorder.com/general-news/172/1142298/>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	universities shall be provided laptops to link them with the digital revolution	distributed in Punjab in 2016. ⁷⁹ 200,000 laptops given during the last reporting period. ⁸⁰				
4.7	Distance learning programs will be given priority to expand in public and private sector educational institutions	Punjab Information Technology Board has developed videos, animations, simulations and assessments to enhance learning values of textbooks grade 6th -10th Science. ⁸¹	2	2	3	7
4.8	Madrassas will be provided financial assistance and other incentives to bring their syllabus and standards in conformity with the mainstream education.	Ittehad Tanzeem-ul-Madaris has unanimously decided to adopt the syllabus of Federal Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (FBISE) for Matriculation and Intermediate. ⁸²	1.5	0.5	0.5	2.5

⁷⁹ The Express Tribune, Educational aid: CM approves buying 150,000 laptops, November 21, 2016, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1237722/educational-aid-cm-approves-buying-150000-laptops/>

⁸⁰ The Office of Chief Minister Punjab, One lakh More Students to be Given. <http://www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/?q=node/2826>

⁸¹ Punjab Information Technology Board January 1st 2014. http://elearn.punjab.gov.pk/home/about_us/

⁸² Aaj News, Seminaries decide to adopt FBISE's syllabus, July 14, 2016, <http://aaj.tv/2016/07/seminaries-decide-to-adopt-fbises-syllabus/>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
4.9	Promotion of teachers will be linked with their qualifications and performance.	Promotion Policy 2014 links promotion with qualification, not with performance as yet. ⁸³	1	0	1	2
4.10	To improve administration of education sector, establish autonomous District Education Authorities (DEAs)	DEAs have been established in all 36 districts of Punjab. DEO would be chairman in every district and EDO would be secretary. ⁸⁴	2.5	2.5	5	10
4.11	Set up autonomous monitoring and evaluations authorities and use of modern technology to check the performance of education sector.	Government of The Punjab has established autonomous body which collects real-time data, based on monthly spot visits, across schools in Punjab. The data is available on the Program Monitoring & Implementation Unit-powered by Punjab Information Technology Board. ⁸⁵	2.0	2.0	4.0	8.0
5.	Labour and Human Resources					4.5

⁸³ Promotion Policy 2014. Promotion <http://itest.pk/2014/05/punjab-education-department-introduced-new-promotion-policy-for-teachers/educaion-department-promotion-policy/>

⁸⁴ Pakistan Today, District Education Authorities Established in Punjab to improve educational standards, October 15, 2015, <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2015/10/15/district-education-authorities-established-in-punjab-to-improve-education-standards/>

⁸⁵ Punjab Monitoring and Implementation Unit (PMIU); Website: <http://open.punjab.gov.pk>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
5.1	Youth training and skill development program shall be initiated to create one million positions for apprenticeship in trade and industry	73.2% employability rate of traceable pass-outs at PVTC. ⁸⁶ Together, PVTC, TEVTA and Punjab Skills Development Fund have completed a number of vocational training projects and there a number of such projects that are ongoing or are in the pipeline. ⁸⁷	1.5	1.5	2	5
5.2	Vocational and technical education will be promoted, especially in rural areas.	Punjab Vocational Training Council had 59,129 graduates in 2016. Annual Pass out capacity is 145,000. ⁸⁸	1	1	2	4
5.3	Establish Tripartite Provincial Productivity Council.	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-
6.	Transport					6.5
6.1	Build mass transit facilities in all major cities	Metro bus project completed in Rawalpindi and Multan. Orange Line Metro train project ongoing in Lahore.	2	2	2.5	6.5

⁸⁶ Punjab Vocational Training Council Web site, accessed March 17, 2017, <http://www.pvtc.gov.pk/Statistics/VitalStats.aspx>

⁸⁷ Pakistan Today, Punjab govt to set up skill agency for technical training: Ashfaq Sarwar, March 15, 2016, <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2016/03/15/punjab-govt-to-set-up-skill-agency-for-technical-training-ashfaq-sarwar/>

⁸⁸ Punjab Vocational Training Council Web site, accessed March 17, 2017, <http://www.pvtc.gov.pk/Statistics/Passouts.aspx>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
7.	Housing					7
7.1	1,000 clusters of 500 houses each for lower income families will be developed on a public private partnership mode.	Apna Ghar Housing Scheme announced in 2013 is yet to materialize. ⁸⁹ MoU signed with Turkey to construct 50,000 low-cost houses. ⁹⁰ The Ashiana Housing Scheme already in progress in upcoming projects in Lahore, Faisalabad, Rawalpindi, Sargodha and Gujranwala. ⁹¹ Faisalabad and Sahiwal ready to be allotted ⁹² . Upcoming in Chiniot, Kasur and Bahawalpur. ⁹³	2.5	2	2.5	7
8.	E-Governance					7
8.1	Create and implement performance monitoring	Digital devices and apps are being used by the Monitoring and Evaluation Assistants for	2.5	2	2.5	7

⁸⁹ Pakistan Today, After 3 years low-cost Apna Ghar Housing Scheme still remains a distant dream, November 27, 2016, <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2016/11/27/after-3-years-low-cost-apna-ghar-housing-scheme-still-remains-a-distant-dream/>

⁹⁰ The Nation, Turkish firm to construct 50,000 houses in Punjab, January 3, 2016, <http://nation.com.pk/laohre/03-Jan-2016/turkish-firm-to-construct-50-000-houses-in-punjab>

⁹¹ Punjab Land Development Company, Projects. <http://www.pldc.gop.pk/projects.html>

⁹² Pak Real Estate. <http://www.pakrealestatetimes.com/showthread.php?tid=15902>

⁹³ Punjab Land Development Company, Projects. <http://www.pldc.gop.pk/projects.html>

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	dashboards for all major provincial projects	<p>Primary and Secondary Health. Digitisation of land record and criminal records of province' 709 police stations, mapping of areas according to intensity of crime and monitoring of schools, hospitals and vaccinators through global positioning system- enabled devices.⁹⁴</p> <p>Pak-Turk collaboration in e-governance.⁹⁵ E-governance projects by use of smart technology under way in various departments such as: Health, Livestock and Dairy, Irrigation, Agriculture, Lahore Waste Management Company, and Police. PITB is working on numerous Department of Health, Livestock and Dairy, Agriculture and Punjab Police are few instances. (Health Watch Program, EDOs, DDOs, DOs and other officers inspect healthcare facilities</p>				

⁹⁴ The News, Punjab takes stride towards e-governance, February 3, 2016, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/95578-Punjab-takes-stride-towards-e-governance>

⁹⁵ The News, Turkey to help promote e-governance in Punjab, June 3rd 2014. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-5-253702-Turkey-to-help-promote-e-governance-in->

PML-N Manifesto		Implementation Status (PUNJAB)				
S.No	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		on regular bases using smart phones. The Irrigation department is also using smart phone based applications to report and monitor daily activities like their daily visits and water level discharge. Punjab Police in the provincial capital is successfully utilising smart phone applications to geo-tag location of FIR and analyze crime hot spots; the Lahore Waste Management Company (LWMC) has been successfully using smart phone applications to report its cleaning activities. ⁹⁶				

⁹⁶ Pakistan Today, Umar Saif's hard work for better e-governance paying off, May 20th 2014. <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2014/05/20/city/lahore/umar-saifs-hard-work-for-better-e-governance-paying-off/>

Policy Research Institute of Market Economy (PRIME)

PPP Economic Agenda: Tracking Report

Average Score= 3.71 (10)

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
1.	Agriculture and Livestock					5.14
1.1	Flat rate electricity	Peak tariff rate retained at Rs. 10.50 per unit. Off-peak tariff rate reduced by Rs. 3.50 to Rs. 5.35(federal government notification). ⁹⁷ 2013-14 flat rate of Rs. 10.50 per unit of tube well ⁹⁸	2.5	2.5	5	10
1.2	Encourage use of solar tube wells	Rs. 130 million subsidy announced for solar tube wells in the 2014-15 budget, was not disbursed to farmers. This amount was	1.0	1.0	2	4

⁹⁷ Pakistan Today, Power tariff lowered for agricultural tube wells, July 11, 2016, <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2016/07/11/power-tariff-lowered-for-agriculture-tube-wells/>

⁹⁸ Ibid.

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		<p>earmarked to subsidize initially 70 out of the announced 250 solar tube wells.⁹⁹</p> <p>CM Finance, in his budget speech for year 2016-17 stated that 250 tube wells powered by solar energy, at a total cost of around Rs. 2 bn, will be installed in various districts of Sindh. The solar tube wells will be installed on cost sharing basis.¹⁰⁰</p> <p>Installation of 250 Solar Tube wells.¹⁰¹</p>				
1.3	Provide farmers with land holding of 25 acres with high quality inputs and training	CM Finance, in his budget speech announced that 350 laser land leveling equipment, installation of drip irrigation on 5,000, 300 laser	0.5	1.0	1.0	2.5

⁹⁹ DAWN, Solar-powered tube-well subsidy in limbo, March 31, 2015, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1172652>

¹⁰⁰ Pakistan Press International, Text of Sindh Finance Minister Syed Murad Ali Shah's budget speech 2016-17, June 13, 2016; <http://ppinewsagency.com/text-of-sindh-finance-minister-syed-murad-ali-shahs-budget-speech-2016-17/>

¹⁰¹ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		land leveling, 100 deep ripping- all will be provided on cost sharing basis to farmers. Beside this, 71 community Flood shelters and 200 farmer field schools will be established in different districts of Sindh. ¹⁰² 3-14 Agriculture Research Rs. 470.441M Allocated and Agriculture Mechanization Rs2736.039M. ¹⁰³				
1.4	Provide Capital through ZTBL	Sindh secured 13.5% of ZTBL's loan disbursements in 2015, amounting to Rs. 12,742,769 million ¹⁰⁴	1	1	1.5	3.5
1.5	Soft Loans to purchase inputs	Banks have disbursed around Rs. 26bn loans to the farmers of Sindh	2.0	2.0	3.5	7.5

¹⁰² Ibid

¹⁰³ Agriculture, Supply and Prices Department Government of Sindh, Summary Progress Report 2013-14. <http://www.sindhagri.gov.pk/develop.html>

¹⁰⁴ ZTBL, Annual Report 2015, <http://www.ztbl.com.pk/Documents/Publication/annualReports/AnnualReport2015/1DirectorReport.pdf>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		in the first half of the current fiscal year. ¹⁰⁵				
1.6	Set up clusters/cooperatives of farmers (Facilities and inputs such as tractors, laser levelers, fertilizer, seeds and pesticides will be accessible through collective credit.)	Announced scheme to subsidize 3550 tractors, through the Sindh Bank Limited on a first-come, first-served basis. ¹⁰⁶ NAB has barred the government from proceeding on with the scheme, in April 2006. Yet, in August, the scheme was re-announced by the government. Rs. 2 billion has been allocated for Sindh Agriculture Growth Project and Rs. 3 billion for Sindh Irrigated Agriculture Productivity Enhancement Project (SIAPEP) in budget 2016-2017. ¹⁰⁷ Support small farmers by	0.5	1	2	3.5

¹⁰⁵ State Bank of Pakistan, District wise summary of agricultural loans, <http://www.sbp.org.pk/acd/District-Summary-Jul-Dec-2016.pdf>

¹⁰⁶ Pakistan Observer, PAAPAM questions integrity of government's new tractor scheme, August 26, 2016, <http://pakobserver.net/paapam-questions-integrity-of-sindh-govts-new-tractor-scheme/>

¹⁰⁷ The Express Tribune, Agriculture spending relies heavily on foreign loans, June 12, 2016, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1253153>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		providing them subsidy on purchase of 7,350 wheel type tractors, 1250 agriculture implements, 70 solar pumps & 715 tube wells ¹⁰⁸				
1.7	Set up agriculture markets at the tehsil/taluka level	As yet no development	-	-	-	-
1.8	Set up Public-Private Silos	Farmers point out the IFC silo project had run into snags and the government is silent on it. Government clarifies that the budget document is silent on it as the project donor-funded. ¹⁰⁹ IFC and Govt of Sindh initiated project bidding in Feb 2014. ¹¹⁰¹¹¹ Modern grain storage project,	2	1.5	1.5	5

¹⁰⁸ Ibid

¹⁰⁹ DAWN, Sindh's lackluster agricultural budget, June 22, 2015, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1189722>

¹¹⁰ Business Recorder, Grain storage re-tendering: Sindh government to conduct pre-qualifications afresh, January 23rd 2014. <http://www.brecorder.com/agriculture-allied/183:pakistan/1146375:grain-storage-re-tendering-sindh-government-to-conduct-pre-qualifications-afresh/?date=2014-01-23>

¹¹¹ Public Private Partnership Unit, Food Storage Silos. <http://www.pppunitsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php?pid=31>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		developed with the help of International Finance Corporation; In the first phase, storage capacity of 60,000 tons will be built. ¹¹²				
2.	Resource Utilization					2
2.1	No indirect taxes on agriculture	CM Sindh Commission to streamline agri tax as at present not only agriculture income tax, but water tax, drainage tax, local cess and other indirect taxes are also being collected. ¹¹³	2	0	0	2
2.2	Provide tax breaks to young entrepreneurs.	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-
3.	Health					2.3
3.1	Increase coverage of LHWs to 100% rural and urban slums	As yet no development	-	-	-	-
3.2	Provide MNCH services in every basic health unit	Agreement of Sindh government with an NGO, Integrated Health	1	1	2.5	4.5

¹¹² Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

¹¹³ Express Tribune, Moving forward: Sindh forms committee to streamline agriculture tax, May 27th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/713517/moving-forward-sindh-forms-committee-to-streamline-agriculture-tax/>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	(BHU) and rural health centre (RHC) in each district	<p>Services, to run all RHC except those in Thatta and Sujawal.¹¹⁴</p> <p>Sindh CM announced in budget 2016-17 speech that RHCs, BHUs, THQs and DHQs would be upgraded.</p> <p>Rs 1.8 billion have been allocated for foreign funded health projects, which include Sindh Nutrition Support Programme worth Rs 1.4 billion and establishment of Child Health Care Institute at Sukkur worth Rs 400 million with Korean assistance.¹¹⁵</p> <p>Community Support Meetings to Improve health services at BHU in</p>				

¹¹⁴ The Express Tribune, Improving healthcare: Sindh government hands over hospitals to reputable NGOs, March 20, 2015, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/855980/improving-healthcare-sindh-govt-hands-over-hospitals-to-reputable-ngos/>

¹¹⁵ Daily Times, health sector gets third largest share, July 12, 2016, <http://dailytimes.com.pk/sindh/12-Jun-16/health-sector-gets-third-largest-share>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		Jacobabad, Shikarpur, Ghotki and Larkana. ¹¹⁶ Revival of 200 health units and up gradation of 40 rural health centers ¹¹⁷ A special training program for community midwives. A PPHI Midwifery training institute is being established at RHC Bhit Shah for this purpose. ¹¹⁸				
3.3	Micro-insurance health units	CM has agreed to contribute Rs. 2 billion to extend PM's National Health Program in six districts of Sindh. This 3-year program will provide health insurance for the poor. ¹¹⁹	0.5	0.5	0	1
3.4	Develop community-level	Rota virus vaccine will be included	1	1	0.5	2.5

¹¹⁶ Peoples Primary Health Initiative, Community Support Meetings. <http://pphisindh.org/pphinew/wordpress/2013/05/community-support-meetings/>

¹¹⁷ Dunya, Health Facilities in Sindh, June 2nd 2014.

¹¹⁸ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

¹¹⁹ The News, Murad agrees to launch National Health Program in Sindh, September 26, 2016, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/latest/152813-Murad-agrees-to-launch-National-Health-Programme-in-Sindh>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	interventions that encompass EPI routine immunization.	in routine immunization from April 2017 in Sindh. Coverage of routine immunization has improved to 45%, while it stood at 35% as per PDHS 2012-2013. ¹²⁰				
3.5	Develop stronger public-private partnerships for health care delivery systems	Government to hand over 50 public hospitals to NGOs under public-private partnership. ¹²¹ Request for Proposal Public Private Partnership for few of its underperforming Public Health Facilities/ Health Services with the objective of improving service delivery through 5-10 years	1	0.5	1	2.5

¹²⁰ The Express Tribune, Larkana has the lowest immunization coverage in Sindh, March 2, 2017, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1343034/larkana-lowest-immunisation-coverage-sindh/>

¹²¹ The Express Tribune, Public-private partnership: Sindh govt to hand over 50 hospitals to NGOs this week, July 6, 2015, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/916002/public-private-partnership-sindh-govt-to-hand-over-50-hospitals-to-ngos-this-week/>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		management contracts February 2014. ¹²²				
3.6	Bring the population growth rate down to 1.6 per cent	CM Qaim Ali Shah launched Rs. 51.2 billion five-year family planning plan- Costed Implementation Plan. ¹²³	0.5	0.5	0	1
4.	Education					3.58
4.1	Comprehensive review of the curriculum	12 member Advisory Committee formed on textbook reforms ¹²⁴ The Sindh Textbook Board has decided to dub Abdul Sattar Edhi, Malala Yousufzai and Arfa Abdul Kareem as national heroes in its textbooks for grades I to VI while 'purging' textbooks of references to "non-democratic heroes". ¹²⁵	1	1	0.5	2.5

¹²² Government of Sindh Initiative of Improving Healthcare: Public Private Partnership for Select Public Health Facilities Services. <http://www.timespacetechnologies.com/portal/Portals/0/data/rfp.pdf>

¹²³ The Express Tribune, Population Control: CM launches 5-year family planning plan worth Rs. 51bn, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1003395/population-control-cm-launches-five-year-family-planning-plan-worth-rs51bn/>

¹²⁴ Dawn, 12-member body set up for textbook reforms in Sindh, October 15th 2013. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1049764>

¹²⁵ Express Tribune, Education gets politicised as textbooks and heroes are changed, March 25th 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/686885/education-gets-politicised-as-textbooks-and-heroes-are-changed/>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
4.2	Stress on both mother tongue instruction as well as the appropriate introduction of national and international languages	Teaching Sindhi made compulsory in all private schools. ¹²⁶ Sindh education department signed an MoU with the education department of Sichuan province of China for their cooperation in teaching Chinese language in schools of Sindh. ¹²⁷ University of Sindh has launched a month-long Chinese language course. ¹²⁸	2.0	1.5	3.0	6.5
4.3	Cell within provincial education departments to monitor, coordinate and overview district-wise utilization of the education	Making school specific budgets for 43,000 schools to ensure that each school gets its earmarked budget and the head of the school has an oversight over expenditure.	2	0	0	2

¹²⁶ Pakistan Today, Sindhi language teaching compulsory for private schools: minister, December 9, 2016, <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2016/12/09/sindhi-language-teaching-compulsory-for-private-schools-minister/>

¹²⁷ DAWN, Accord signed to teach Chinese in Sindh schools, March 25, 2015. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1171645>

¹²⁸ SAMAA TV, Sindh University launches Chinese language course, August 08, 2016. <https://www.samaa.tv/pakistan/2016/08/sindh-university-launches-chinese-language-course/>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
	budget	Rs.1750 million will be transferred to School Management Committees for community identified school improvement investments. ICT Enabled Education Management Information System (EMIS). ¹²⁹				
4.4	Improve adult literacy rates	Work on \$800 million Sindh Education City has been initiated. ¹³⁰ Sindh's literacy rate (10 years and above) which was 56 percent in 2013-14 reached to 60 percent in 2014-15. ¹³¹	1.5	1.5	3.0	6
4.5	Incentive to girls to enroll in schools	Government of Sindh going to initiate a scheme to distribute Rs. 950 mn among 350,000 girls to	1.5	1.5	0	3.0

¹²⁹ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

¹³⁰ The News, Education City's infrastructure work to begin soon, March 13, 2016, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/157247-Education-Citys-infrastructure-work-to-begin-soon>

¹³¹ Pakistan Economic Survey 2015-16.

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		enhance girls' enrolment in schools. ¹³² Rs. 1500 million will be spent on stipends for girl students, Rs.1540 million on provision of free textbooks to students. ¹³³				
4.6	Achieve Universal Primary Enrollment by 2018	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-
4.7	Vocational Training	STEVTA conducting programs as per mandate	0.5	0.5	0.5	1.5
5.	Labour and Human Resources					4
5.1	Set up labour committees at the district level to resolve labour difficulties and disputes	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-

¹³² Pakistan Today, disbursement of stipend among girls from 29th, Khuhro, January 27, 2016. <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2016/01/27/disbursement-of-stipend-among-girls-from-29th-khuhro/>

¹³³ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
5.2	Construct a labour housing complex in the provincial capitals	ABAD housing society announced. ¹³⁴ KDA's low-cost housing scheme announced Decision to upgrade 100 katchi abadis to township level. ¹³⁵	1.5	1	1.5	4
5.3	Promote the registration of workers	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-
5.4	Issuance of Labour Cards	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-
6.	Transport					4
6.1	Improve public bus service	Karachi Mass Transit Program signed with China includes six Bus Rapid Transport corridors, two mass rapid transit corridors and revitalization of Karachi Circular Railway. ¹³⁶	1.5	1.5	1	4

¹³⁴ The News, ABAD- Sindh government to construct low-cost housing units in city, August 13, 2016, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/142165-ABAD-Sindh-govt-to-construct-low-cost-housing-units-in-city>

¹³⁵ Dawn, Housing the poor, October 16, 2016, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1290222>

¹³⁶ The Nation, China, Sindh to sign Rs. 14.6bn transport project, September 8, 2016, <http://nation.com.pk/national/08-Sep-2016/china-sindh-to-sign-rs14-6b-transport-project>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
		ADP for transport is pitched at Rs. 3.2 billion in budget 2016-17, with an increase of 6.2%. ¹³⁷				
6.2	Float municipal bonds to raise funds	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-
7.	Housing					5
7.1	More than 500,000 houses will be constructed for the homeless poor in urban and rural areas special public-private partnership	Shaheed Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Towns scheme launched in 8 districts of Sindh province (Karachi, Hyderabad, Jamshoro, Thatta, Dadu, Mirpur Khas, Khairpur and Tandul Muhammad Khan) 100,000 plot applications, 27,500 successful allottees, 23 districts balloting on Dec 9th 2013. ¹³⁸ 1500 plots have been allotted to poor residents and 12000 more houses for poor to be built. ¹³⁹	2	1	2	5

¹³⁷ PK Revenue, Sindh Budget 2016/2017: Transport ADP pitched at Rs3.2bn, June 11, 2016, <http://www.pkrevenue.com/budget-2015-16/budget-2016-2017/sindh-budget-20162017-transport-adp-pitched-at-rs3-2bn/>

¹³⁸ SHAHEED MOHTARMA BENAZIR BHUTTO TOWNS, <http://www.smbbt.com/>

PPP Manifesto Chapter		Implementation Status (SINDH)				
S. No.	Manifesto Target	Current Status	Legislative and Policy Developments (score out of 2.5)	Institutional Reforms (score out of 2.5)	Implementation (score out of 5)	Total Score 10
7.2	Construct low-cost housing developments on government land with a 20-year mortgage facility	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-
7.3	Provide a tax credit to those low-cost housing schemes that use alternative energy as a primary source of power	As yet no development.	-	-	-	-

¹³⁹ Department of Finance, Sindh, Budget Speech 2014-15. <http://www.fdsindh.gov.pk/site/index.php>

PRIME Team

Ali Salman

Executive Director

Ayesha Bilal

Chief Operating Officer

Zia Banday

Director

Syed Ali

Head of Marketing &
Communication

Raes Abbasi

Manager Operations &
Finance

Shahid Mehmood

Head of Research

Amna Memon

Program Officer

Shehryar Aziz

Research Associate

Talha Hassan

Research Analyst

Dr. Khalil Ahmad

Distinguished Research
Fellow

Contact:

Address: Office 401,
Gulistan Khan House,
82-East Fazal-e Haq Road,
Blue Area Islamabad

Tel: 00 92 (51) 8 31 43 37-8

Fax: 00 92 (51) 8 31 43 39

Email:

info@primeinstitute.org

URL:

www.primeinstitute.org

Provinces Tracking Report 2016 – 2017

Provincial Tracking Report reviews economic performance of three provinces, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh by tracking the progress made on the implementation of economic manifesto announced by the parties in power in these respective provinces i.e. Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) and Pakistan People's Party-Parliamentarians (PPP-P). In case of Balochistan, the report includes a commentary on the socio-economic status of the province instead of following any manifesto because of a mid-term change in the government. The purpose of the Provincial Tracking Report is to initiate and inform policy dialogue and public debate on the progress made by political parties vis-à-vis their electoral promises. This tracking directly serves the basic principle of a functioning democracy: accountability.

Inflation in Pakistan: Understated, Especially for the Poor

The study presents a critical analysis of measurement of inflation, its results and implications in Pakistan. As a pilot study, it considers price data of February 2016 as released by Pakistan Bureau of Statistics by taking consumption items which constitute 80% of monthly expenditure for an average household. By applying splicing technique of weights rectification and standardization, it identifies discrepancies between reported inflation rates and adjusted inflation rates, in particular for the low income households. It is authored by Dr. Hafiz A. Pasha et'al.

Towards Flat, Low-rate, Broad and Predictable Taxes

The study analyses the structural and operational weaknesses of the existing tax system at federal level and suggests alternate solutions in the areas that require fundamental reforms. It argues that taxpayers have to deal with multiple tax agencies adding to their cost of doing business and the nonexistence of tax-related benefits is the most neglected area of our discourse on reforms. It highlights the existing four-tier tax appellate system, how it has failed to deliver and the alternate system which can be adopted. This study is authored by Huzaima Bukhari and Dr. IkramulHaq

Unilateral Liberalias on: Pakistan's Path to Trade Revival

The study focuses on significant shifts in trade policy over the last 25 years and their impact on Pakistan's overall trade performance. This study argues that 'Pakistan has become relatively open compared to 1990s but when compared to its neighbouring countries today, it is still much protectionist'. In this regard, this study discusses the different trade regimes of Pakistan since 1990s till 2014 and compares Pakistan's trade performance with that of neighbouring countries. It is authored by Sara Javed.

All PRIME publications are available at our website:

<http://www.primeinstitute.org>